Created Motion in Maximus the Confessor: A Dynamicist Reading

by

Cullan Joyce Bachelor of Theology ACU hons

Submitted in fulfillment of the requirements for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy

University of Tasmania

October, 2010
This thesis contains no material which has been accepted for a degree or diploma by the University or any other institution, except by way of background information and duly acknowledged in the thesis, and to the best of my knowledge and belief, no material previously published or written by another person except where due acknowledgement is made in the text of the thesis.

Cullan Joyce

26/10/2010
This thesis may be made available for loan and limited copying in accordance with the Copyright Act 1968

Cullan Joyce

26/10/2010
Abstract

This thesis explores how Maximus the Confessor understands created motion. It describes how he utilises not just one description of motion, but several. Recent literature has struggled to articulate the diversity of ways for describing motion available to Maximus. Sometimes these works have over-simplified Maximus’ views. At other times the works gesture toward some important areas, but fail to go into sufficient technical detail. This study explores how Maximus’ descriptions of motion play important but specific roles in his work. Accordingly, the thesis employs a strategy of closely reading texts containing key descriptions of motion, clarifying their meaning, and setting out some implications. The work begins by describing Maximus’ cosmological context, and shows the importance of relating different senses of motion together. This suggests the need for more specific analyses. Chapters two and three describe a form of self-continuous motion, showing how it permeates Maximus’ thought. Chapters four and five evaluate two approaches in the secondary literature. Chapter four focuses on motion as a general principle in the cosmos. Accordingly, it explores how the general account of motion emerges from a theology of creation. Chapter five analyses how personhood has been used, with some success, for describing specific instances of motion in Maximus. The sixth and final chapter examines how motion is comprised of several different processes working co-operatively. The thesis does not explicitly investigate how Maximus’ views on motion might be reconstructed in contemporary contexts. Nor does it discuss the broader implications of created motion for his theology. It offers an alternative reading of this important but notoriously difficult figure of antiquity, suggesting new avenues of interpretation, as well as opening a range of topics for further research.
Acknowledgments:
Dedicated to my teachers, Professor Wayne Hudson, and Professor Adj Dr Marcelo Stamm and Professor Jeff Malpas. Without their help and kindness this work could not have come to light.
I also dedicate it to my family, my mother Elizabeth Woods, my Father Steven Joyce, my sisters Ella and Astrid, my friends, those who, through their patience, supported me. And to the Angels, those forgotten clarities, whose inspiration may embarrass, but who cause the confrontation that allows a choice for good.
Contents

Abstract ........................................................................................................................................ iii
Acknowledgments: ......................................................................................................................... iv
Contents .......................................................................................................................................... v
Abbreviations: ................................................................................................................................. vii
Introduction ...................................................................................................................................... 1
The Life of Maximus ....................................................................................................................... 1
The Philosophical Influences on Maximus .................................................................................... 3
Maximus’ Written Works ............................................................................................................... 5
Κίνησις .......................................................................................................................................... 7
Forms of Motion Found within Secondary Literature ................................................................. 12
The Shift between Indeterminacy and Determinacy ................................................................. 19
Maximus’ Relation to Pre-Established Λόγοι ............................................................................. 24
Overview ....................................................................................................................................... 27
Chapter 1 ...................................................................................................................................... 34
Maximus’ Regional Cosmology ..................................................................................................... 34
Two Examples of Regional Thinking in Maximus ....................................................................... 35
A Second Set of Divisions ............................................................................................................. 41
Co-operation Between Qualitative Orders ................................................................................... 43
Efficient Causality and Appearance ............................................................................................. 45
Περιχώρησις .................................................................................................................................. 47
Chalcedon as the Model of Interrelation ....................................................................................... 49
The Interregional Reading of Created Motion ............................................................................. 51
Exploring an Appropriate Structure for a Definition ................................................................. 52
Conclusion: The Emergence of Several Types of Motion ............................................................ 54
Chapter 2 ...................................................................................................................................... 56
Φύσις, Κίνησις, Λογισμόι .............................................................................................................. 56
Φύσις ............................................................................................................................................ 57
Clarifying the Causal Status of Φύσις .......................................................................................... 61
The Effects of Γνώμη or Noesis ..................................................................................................... 66
Procreative Causal Relations ........................................................................................................ 68
Critiquing the Idea of Opposition as Creative ........................................................................... 71
Compilation and Naming .............................................................................................................. 74
Λόγισμοι, Συνθεσις and Psychic Continuity ................................................................................ 78
Conclusion: The Structure of Procreative Motion and the Move Toward Increased Determinacy ....................................................................................................................................... 82
Chapter 3 ...................................................................................................................................... 84
The Development of Κατηγορία ................................................................................................... 84
Porphyry and the Κατηγορία ......................................................................................................... 87
Circumscriptive Speech in Porphyry ............................................................................................. 87
Γένος and Εἶδος: Establishing δόμομα ......................................................................................... 88
Maximus on Porphyry .................................................................................................................. 90
The Role of Μνήμη ..................................................................................................................... 91
Data for Habitual Understanding: The Relation between Κατηγορία and Μνήμη ............................................................................................................................................... 92
The Μνήμη .................................................................................................................................... 96
Assessing the Κατηγορία in Maximus .......................................................................................... 98