THE TREATMENT OF WOMEN WHO KILL THEIR VIOLENT MALE PARTNERS WITHIN THE AUSTRALIAN CRIMINAL JUSTICE SYSTEM

By

Reberca Bradfield, BA/LLB (Hons)

Submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy

University of Tasmania
Faculty of Law

July 2002
STATEMENTS

This thesis contains no material which has been accepted for a degree or diploma by the University or any other institution, except by way of background information and duly acknowledged in the thesis, and to the best of the candidate's knowledge and belief no material previously published or written by another person except where due acknowledgment is made in the text of the thesis.

Signature .......................... .......................... ..........................
Date 11 July, 2002.........

This thesis may be made available for loan and limited copying in accordance with the Copyright Act 1968 (Cth)

This thesis states the law as of 1 January 2002.
ABSTRACT

My thesis examines the treatment of women who kill their violent male partners within the Australian criminal justice system.

The primary aim of my study is to examine the circumstances in which women kill their violent partners and to explore the ability of the criminal law to have proper regard to these circumstances. The interaction between the criminal law and battered women who kill their violent partners is a topical issue that has generated substantial interest and debate in many western countries.

My thesis provides an empirical study detailing the legal outcome and circumstances of the killing in the 76 cases identified where women have killed their male partner. In the context of these findings, I examine reliance on the various defences to murder (diminished responsibility, provocation, lack of the requisite intent for murder, self-defence, insanity and automatism). The argument advanced is that the current approach of the Australian criminal justice system to battered women who kill reveals sympathy for their situation, but a failure to adequately consider whether these circumstances provide the basis for self-defence.

I examine the procedural rules that interact with the substantive law of self-defence to constrain a battered woman's ability to convey the reality of her experience of violence to the fact-finder. In facilitating reliance on self-defence, I propose a shift in the current evidentiary approach to battered women who kill from the 'battered woman syndrome' framework to the reception of social framework evidence in its own right.

My thesis also includes a consideration of the judicial approach in sentencing women who kill their violent partners. My analysis suggests that there is sympathy for the woman's situation, however there is not an adequate recognition of the mitigatory impact of a history of violence. The dominant judicial approach to mitigation appears to be premised according to principles of 'mercy' and 'sympathy' for women who can position themselves as the 'appropriate victim'.

Although focusing on the Australian criminal justice system, my thesis has potential application beyond this context.
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

During the process of completing my PhD, I have drawn support and inspiration from my colleagues at the Faculty of Law, University of Tasmania. I would particularly like to acknowledge the support, encouragement and guidance that I received from Professor Kate Warner during her supervision of my candidature. I would also like to thank Terese Henning for her comments on earlier drafts of my thesis and her general encouragement in relation to my research project. My thanks also to Jenny Gawlik for her assistance during the final stages of my research project.

I would like also to acknowledge the financial support that I received from the Faculty of Law, University of Tasmania that enabled the purchase of the sentencing comments from the Supreme Court of New South Wales. In addition, I am grateful for the assistance that I received from Stephen Cunines at the Judicial Commission of New South Wales.

Finally, I would like to thank Greg for his love and support, as well as his unwavering belief in my ability to complete this PhD.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Table of cases xi
Table of statutes xxvi
List of tables and figures xxviii

INTRODUCTION

• Caveats and definitions 4
• Structure and content 6

CHAPTER ONE

SETTING THE SCENE – SPOUSAL HOMICIDE

1.1 INTRODUCTION 13

1.2 THE INCIDENCE OF SPOUSAL HOMICIDE 14

1.2.1 Gender 14

1.2.2 Cultural/racial 16

1.3 CIRCUMSTANCES AND MOTIVATION FOR SPOUSAL HOMICIDE 19

1.3.1 Men who kill 19

1.3.2 Women who kill 21

1.4 LEGAL OUTCOME IN CASES OF SPOUSAL HOMICIDE 23

1.4.1 Men who kill 25

1.4.2 Women who kill 26

1.5 CONCLUSION 28
CHAPTER TWO

FILLING IN THE PICTURE – THE BACKDROP OF DOMESTIC VIOLENCE

2.1 INTRODUCTION 30

2.2 INCIDENCE OF DOMESTIC VIOLENCE 31

2.3 GENDER 33

2.4 CULTURAL/RACIAL 35

2.5 NATURE OF DOMESTIC VIOLENCE 36

2.6 WOMEN'S RESPONSES TO DOMESTIC VIOLENCE 40

2.6.1 Formal strategies 41

2.6.2 Informal strategies 41

2.6.2.1 Conflict Avoidance 42

2.6.2.2 Confrontation and active resistance 42

2.6.2.3 Seeking help from friends and family 43

2.6.2.4 Diversionary tactics 43

2.6.2.5 Leaving 44

2.6.3 Barriers to disclosure and/or leaving 44

2.6.3.1 Commitment to the relationship/family; shame and embarrassment 44

2.6.3.2 Denial and disbelief 46

2.6.3.3 Fear 47

2.6.3.4 Resources/economic factors 48

2.6.4 Cultural/racial intersections 49

2.6.4.1 Indigenous women 50
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.6.4.2</td>
<td>Women from particular ethnic backgrounds</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>CONCLUSION</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CHAPTER THREE</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>HOMICIDE AND THE FRAMEWORK OF THE DEFENCES TO MURDER</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>STRUCTURE OF HOMICIDE</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1</td>
<td>A brief history of homicide and the defences</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1.1</td>
<td>Excusable homicide</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1.2</td>
<td>Enter provocation</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1.3</td>
<td>Women who killed their partners</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.1.4</td>
<td>Mental impairment</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2.2</td>
<td>Overview of current framework</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>MOTIVE, INTENTION AND CRIMINAL RESPONSIBILITY</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK OF THE DEFENCES</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.1</td>
<td>The ‘capacity view’: justification and excuse</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.1.1</td>
<td>Self-defence</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.1.2</td>
<td>Provocation</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.1.3</td>
<td>Diminished responsibility and insanity</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.1.4</td>
<td>Beyond justification and excuse</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.2</td>
<td>The ‘reasons view’</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.2.1</td>
<td>Self-defence</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.2.2</td>
<td>Provocation</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### 3.5 CONCLUSION

---

**CHAPTER FOUR**

**THE ‘APPROPRIATE’ WOMAN – INTENTION, DIMINISHED RESPONSIBILITY, INSANITY AND HOMICIDE**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>THEORETICAL ENGAGEMENT WITH WOMEN WHO KILL</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.1</td>
<td>The ‘appropriate’ woman</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.2</td>
<td>Gender and psychiatry</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.3</td>
<td>The violent woman</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.4</td>
<td>Beyond the ‘appropriate’ woman/violent woman</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>THE LAW OF DIMINISHED RESPONSIBILITY</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.1</td>
<td>Overview of the law</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.1.1</td>
<td>Abnormality of mind</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.1.2</td>
<td>Cause of abnormality</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.1.3</td>
<td>Substantial impairment</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.2</td>
<td>Diminished responsibility and spousal homicide</td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>IN VOLUNTARY MAN SLAUGHTER</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.1</td>
<td>Overview of the law</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.2</td>
<td>Lack of intent and spousal homicide</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.2.1</td>
<td>Intoxication</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.2.2</td>
<td>The nature of the fatal act</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.2.3</td>
<td>Emotional turmoil</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.3</td>
<td>The implications of the ‘defacto’ defence of domestic violence</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.5 OTHER MENTAL STATE DEFENCES

4.5.1 Mental impairment (insanity)

4.5.1.1 Overview of the law

4.5.1.2 Insanity and spousal homicide

4.5.2 Mental disease and intention (the 'Hawkins' defence)

4.5.2.1 Overview of the law

4.5.2.2 Mental disease and intention (the 'Hawkins' defence) and spousal homicide

4.5.3 Automatism

4.5.3.1 Overview of the law

4.5.3.2 Automatism and spousal homicide

4.6 CONCLUSION

CHAPTER FIVE

THE 'ANGRY' WOMAN – THE DEFENCE OF PROVOCATION AND HOMICIDE

5.1 INTRODUCTION

5.2 SPOUSAL HOMICIDE: RELIANCE BY MEN AND WOMEN ON THE DEFENCE OF PROVOCATION

5.3 THE LAW OF PROVOCATION

5.3.1 The act of provocation

5.3.1.1 Cumulative provocation

5.3.1.2 A triggering incident

5.3.2 The subjective requirement: loss of self-control

5.3.2.1 Suddenness

5.3.2.2 Fear/anger

v
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.3.3</td>
<td>The objective standard: the ordinary person test</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.3.1</td>
<td><em>The 'ordinary person' test</em></td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.3.2</td>
<td><em>Critique of the 'ordinary person' test</em></td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4</td>
<td><strong>THE ABOLITION OF PROVOCATION</strong></td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5</td>
<td><strong>BATTERED WOMEN AND THE CONSEQUENCES OF RELIANCE ON THE PROVOCATION DEFENCE</strong></td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6</td>
<td><strong>CONCLUSION</strong></td>
<td>188</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**CHAPTER SIX**

**THE ‘FRIGHTENED’ WOMAN – THE DEFENCE OF SELF-DEFENCE AND HOMICIDE**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.1</td>
<td><strong>INTRODUCTION</strong></td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2</td>
<td><strong>BATTERED WOMEN AND RELIANCE ON SELF-DEFENCE</strong></td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3</td>
<td><strong>THE LAW OF SELF-DEFENCE</strong></td>
<td>198</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.1</td>
<td>The subjective test: the accused’s state of mind</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.2</td>
<td>Assessing the nature of the threat and the accused’s response</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.2.1</td>
<td><em>Type of threat: proportionality</em></td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.2.2</td>
<td><em>Imminence</em></td>
<td>206</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.2.3</td>
<td><em>Duty to retreat</em></td>
<td>217</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.3</td>
<td>The objective standard: reasonableness</td>
<td>221</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.3.1</td>
<td><em>The standard of reasonableness</em></td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.3.2</td>
<td><em>The standard of reasonableness and the battered woman</em></td>
<td>224</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4</td>
<td><strong>OTHER CONSTRAINTS IMPACTING ON BATTERED WOMEN’S RELIANCE ON SELF-DEFENCE</strong></td>
<td>231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.1</td>
<td>Legal representative’s understanding of domestic violence</td>
<td>231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section</td>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.2</td>
<td>Communicating domestic violence</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.3</td>
<td>The trial</td>
<td>234</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.3.1</td>
<td>Women’s credibility</td>
<td>234</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.3.2</td>
<td>The price of the trial</td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.4</td>
<td>Sentencing considerations</td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>THE FUTURE OF SELF-DEFENCE</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5.1</td>
<td>Draft provision</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5.2</td>
<td>Critique</td>
<td>246</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5.2.1</td>
<td>Premeditated killings and imminence</td>
<td>247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5.2.2</td>
<td>Third parties</td>
<td>248</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5.2.3</td>
<td>Male offenders</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6</td>
<td>CONCLUSION</td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CHAPTER SEVEN

UNDERSTANDING THE WOMAN – THE ADMISSIBILITY OF EVIDENCE OF DOMESTIC VIOLENCE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>AN OVERVIEW – EVIDENCE OF DOMESTIC VIOLENCE AND SELF-DEFENCE</td>
<td>256</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>THE EXPERT WITNESS – EVIDENCE OF ‘BATTERED WOMAN SYNDROME’</td>
<td>263</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3.1</td>
<td>What is BWS?</td>
<td>263</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3.1.1</td>
<td>The cycle of violence</td>
<td>264</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3.1.2</td>
<td>Learned helplessness</td>
<td>265</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3.2</td>
<td>BWS and self-defence</td>
<td>266</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3.3</td>
<td>BWS and the rules of evidence</td>
<td>267</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
7.3.3.1 Relevance 269
7.3.3.2 Expert opinion evidence 270
7.3.4 BWS in Australia 273
  7.3.4.1 Reliance on BWS 273
  7.3.4.2 Critique of BWS 277
7.4 BEYOND BATTERED WOMAN SYNDROME – ‘SOCIAL FRAMEWORK’ EVIDENCE 285
  7.4.1 Why do we need social framework evidence? 286
    7.4.1.1 Power dynamics 292
    7.4.1.2 The issue of exit 293
    7.4.1.3 Culturally diverse communities 294
  7.4.2 What is the content of social framework testimony? 295
    7.4.2.1 General dynamics of domestic violence 296
    7.4.2.2 Responses of women in violent relationships 298
    7.4.2.3 Culturally relevant information 303
  7.4.3 Is social framework evidence admissible? 303
    7.4.3.1 Relevance 304
    7.4.3.2 Rules of opinion evidence 310
  7.4.4 Educating lawyers 318
7.5 PSYCHOLOGICAL SEQUELAE OF ABUSE 319
7.6 CONCLUSION 320
CHAPTER EIGHT

PUNISHING THE WOMAN – SENTENCING WOMEN WHO KILL THEIR MALE PARTNERS

8.1 INTRODUCTION 323

8.2 THE SENTENCING FRAMEWORK FOR MURDER AND MANSLAUGHTER 326

8.2.1 The factual basis for sentencing 326

8.2.2 The sentencing discount for a plea of guilty 328

8.2.3 Sentencing for murder and manslaughter: statutory minimum penalties 330

8.2.4 The sentencing range for domestic homicide 331

8.2.4.1 Murder 332

8.2.4.2 Manslaughter 335

8.3 JUDICIAL DISCRETION IN SENTENCING WOMEN WHO KILL THEIR MALE PARTNERS 337

8.3.1 Under the cloak of mercy 337

8.3.1.1 Justice and mercy 337

8.3.1.2 Mercy and battered women who kill 340

8.3.1.3 Consequences of reliance on mercy 343

8.3.2 Condemnation of domestic violence 344

8.3.2.1 Domestic violence as serious violence 344

8.3.2.2 Misunderstanding domestic violence 346

8.3.3 The exceptional case: New South Wales 348

8.3.3.1 Psychological deficiency caused by domestic violence 351

8.3.3.2 A 'good mother': hardship to children 355
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8.3.3.3</td>
<td>Lack of intent</td>
<td>361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.3.4</td>
<td>Sentencing for provocation</td>
<td>363</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.3.4.1</td>
<td>Domestic violence as 'grave' provocation</td>
<td>364</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.3.4.2</td>
<td>Psychological provocation</td>
<td>365</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.3.5</td>
<td>Aboriginality</td>
<td>370</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.4</td>
<td>TOWARDS A PRINCIPLED APPROACH TO SENTENCING BATTERED WOMEN WHO KILL</td>
<td>376</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.4.1</td>
<td>Abolition of mandatory penalties</td>
<td>376</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.4.2</td>
<td>Sentencing within a discretionary framework</td>
<td>378</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.5</td>
<td>CONCLUSION</td>
<td>383</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS</td>
<td>386</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>BIBLIOGRAPHY</td>
<td>401</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>APPENDIX</td>
<td>432</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# TABLE OF CASES

## AUSTRALIA

**Reported**


*Arrowsmith* (1994) 55 FCR 130.


*Chow* (1992) 28 NSWLR 593.


*Corrigan* [1994] 2 Qd R 415.

*Crabbe* (1985) 156 CLR 464.


*De Simoni* (1981) 147 CLR 383.

Table of Cases


Harris and Simmonds (1992) 59 SASR 300.

Hawkins (1994) 179 CLR 500.

Hawkins (No 3) (1994) 4 Tas R 376.

Herlihy (1956) Qld St R 18.


Hicks (1987) 45 SASR 270.


Howe (1958) 100 CLR 448.


Inkson (1996) 6 Tas R 1.


Lane [1983] 2 VR 449.


Moffa (1977) 138 CLR 601.


Murphy (1989) 167 CLR 94.


Neal (1982) 149 CLR 305.


Parker (1963) 111 CLR 610.


Peisley (1990) 54 A Crim R 42.

Perks (1986) 43 SASR 112.


Rogers (1989) 44 A Crim R 301.


Ryan (1967) 121 CLR 205.
Saler v Klingbiel [1945] SASR 171.


Shepherd (1990) 170 CLR 573.


Stingel (1990) 171 CLR 312.


Tumanako (1992) 64 A Crim R 149.


Viro (1978) 141 CLR 88.


Walsh (1991) 60 A Crim R 419.


Weal v Bottom (1966) 40 ALJR 436.


Whiting [1995] 2 Qd R 199.

Willmot (No 2) [1985] 2 Qd R 413.
Wirth (1976) 14 SASR 291.

Unreported

Agostinelli, unreported, CCA SA, 12 October 1995, Doyle CJ, Duggan and Nyland JJ; unreported, SC SA, 31 May 1996, Matheson J.

Anas, unreported, SC Vic, 5 May 1987, Marks J.

Anderson, unreported, SC Vic, 17 December 1997, Byrne J.

Atik, unreported, CCA Vic, 23 August 1990, Crockett, Murphy and Cummins JJ.

Attai, unreported, CCA Vic, 11 February 1993, Southwell, Harper and Eames JJ.

Auberson, unreported, CA Qld, 3 September 1996, Fitzgerald P, Pincus JA and De Jersey J.

Audsley, unreported, SC NSW, 30 May 1997, Hidden J.


Babsek, unreported, CA Qld, 2 June 1998, Moynihan J, Davies and McPherson JJA.

Baker, unreported, SC SA, 12 April 1985, Burnett J.


Baker, unreported, SC Vic, 11 July 1988, Crockett J.

Baker, unreported, SC SA, 12 April 1985, Burnett J.

Barac, unreported, SC NSW, 16 February 1999, James J.

Baraghith, unreported, CCA NSW, 14 June 1991, Samuels JA, Enderby and Loveday JJ.

Barnes, unreported, CA Qld, 15 February 1995, Fitzgerald P, Davies and McPherson JA.

Barrett, unreported, SC NSW, 4 April 1997, Temby AJ.
Bateman [2000] NSWSC 867, Barr J.

Berger, unreported, SC NSW, 21 March 1995, Finlay J.

Billeley, unreported, SC SA, 31 July 1987, Johnston J.

Birch, unreported, CA Qld, 27 March 1985; unreported, SC Qld, 1 March 1985, McPherson J.

Bobach, unreported, SC NSW, 11 November 1988, Lee CJ at CL.

Bottrell [1999] VSC 523, Hampel J.

Bourke [2000] NSWSC 356, James J.

Bourke, unreported, CCA NSW, 20 September 1989, Gleeson CJ, Carruthers and Campbell JJ.

Brady, unreported, SC SA, 12 November 1992, Bollen J.

Bradley, unreported, SC Vic, 14 December 1994, Coldrey J.

Brauer, unreported, SC SA, 16 February 1988, Johnson J.

Brescia, unreported, CA Qld, 25 March 1994, Macrossan CJ, McPherson and Davies JA.

Britten, unreported, SC NSW, 26 March 1993, Finlay J.

Broadrick, unreported, SC NSW, 31 August 1988, Hunt J.

Brown, unreported, CA Qld, 13 September 1993, The President, Ambrose and White JJ.

Bruderin, unreported, CCA NSW, 22 September 1989, Priestley JA, Allen and Badgery-Parker JJ.

Bryant [2000] NSWSC 245, Dowd J.

Button, unreported, SC NSW, 9 August 1993, Hunt CJ at CL.

Buzzacott, unreported, SC SA, 21 July 1993, Bollen J.

Capar, unreported, SC NSW, 27 October 1995, Smart J.

Carlton, unreported, SC NSW, 4 April 1989, Carruthers J.

Case, unreported, CCA SA, 10 November 1993, Bollen, Duggan and Mulighan JJ.

Cheatam [2000] NSWCCA 282, Spigelman CJ, James and Sperling JJ.

Chetcuti, unreported, CCA NSW, 24 December 1993, Loveday AJ, Finlay and Smart JJ.

Cheung [2001] HCA 67, Gleeson CJ, Gaudron, Gummow, Kirby, Hayne and Callinan JJ.

Cheung, unreported, CCA NSW, 11 December 1995, Hunt CJ at CJ, Allen and Dunford JJ.
Clarke, unreported, CCA NSW, 13 December 1994, Barr AJ, Finlay and Newman JJ.

Cook, unreported, CCA Vic, 28 July 1991, Phillips CJ, Crockett and Southwell JJ.

Cornick, unreported, CCA Tas, 28 July 1987, Neasey, Cox and Underwood JJ; unreported, SC Tas, 14 August 1986, Wright J.

Corrigan, unreported, SC NSW, 15 April 1993, Finlay J.

Coupe, unreported, SC NSW, 28 June 1990, Hunt J.

Crossan, unreported, SC Tas, 7 April 1992, Cox J.

Davies, unreported, SC SA, 17 May 1996, Duggan J.

Denney [2000] VSC 323, Coldrey J.


Dodd, unreported, SC SA, 31 August 1989, Matheson J.

Donnelly, unreported, SC NSW, 10 October 1997, Hidden J.

Donnelly, unreported, CCA Vic, 12 March 1997, Winneke P, Charles JA and Hedigan AJA.

Dundas, unreported, SC NSW, 15 April 1992, Studdert J.

Edwards, unreported, CCA NSW, 17 December 1996, Gleeson CJ, James and Ireland JJ.

Edwards, unreported, CCA NSW, 2 August 1995, Gleeson CJ, Clarke and Hulme JJ.

EJ, unreported, CCA NSW, 1 April 1997, Cole JA, Dowd and Sperling JJ.

Elder, unreported, SC SA, 3 July 1992, Bollen J.

Everett, unreported, CCA NSW, 13 December 1995, Smart, Allan and Sperling JJ.

Finn, unreported, CA Qld, 4 February 1994, Pincus, McPherson and Davies JJA.

Finn, unreported, SC SA, 13 August 1992, Matheson J.

Franke, unreported, SC Tas, 22 August 1983, Neasey J.

Fiume, unreported, CCA Vic, 18 December 1992, Phillips CJ, Crockett and Fullagar JJ.

Foulstone, unreported, CCA NSW, 18 July 1990, Hunt, Wood and Finlay JJ.

Frawley [2000] NSWSC 1128, Studdert J.

Gadd, unreported, SC Qld, 27 March 1995, Moynihan SJA.
Gardner, unreported, SC NSW, 27 March 1992, Wood J.

Gerrard, unreported, SC NSW, 3 July 1992, Hunt CJ at CL.

Gilbert, unreported, SC WA, 4 November 1993, Scott J.


Glusheski, unreported, SC NSW, 4 April 1996, Ireland J.

Goddard, unreported, SC WA, 27 June 1984, Olney J.

Godwin, unreported, SC NSW, 22 August 1991, Finlay J.

Gomaa, unreported, SC NSW, 27 April 1994, Badgery-Parker J.

 Gunnarsson Weiner, unreported, SC Tas, 13 August 1992, Zeeman J.

Hall, unreported, CCA Tas, 30 August 1968, 85/1968, Crisp, Crawford and Chambers JJ.

Hanley, unreported, CCA Vic, 9 March 1993, Marks, Southwell and Harper JJ.

Harris, unreported, SC NSW, 7 March 1991, Abadee J.

Henschke, unreported, SC SA, 7 July 1992, Bollen J.

Heo, unreported, SC NSW, 21 May 1993, Allen J.

Herring, unreported, SC NSW, 3 October 1991, Slattery AJ.

Hickey, unreported, SC NSW, 14 April 1992, Slattery AJ.

Holschier, unreported, SC NSW, 90/91/0064.

Hona, unreported, SC NSW, 9 October 1992, Sully J.

Horrell, unreported, CCA NT, 1 April 1997, Martin CJ, Angel and Bailey JJ.

Huynh, unreported, SC NSW, 92/91/0089.

Hughes, unreported, CA Qld, 7 December 1993, The President, Pincus and Williams JJ.

Ingles, unreported, CCA Tas, 4 May 1993, Green CJ, Crawford and Zeeman JJ.

Jans [2000] NSWSC 525, Grove J.

Jones, unreported SC Tas, 9 February 1994, Crawford J.

Kable, unreported, SC NSW, 1 August 1990, Hunt J.

Kalajcich, unreported, SC NSW, 16 May 1997, Hunt CJ at CL.
Kacskis, unreported, CCA NSW, 10 August 1993, Mahoney and Clarke JJA and Finlay J.

Keir [2000] NSWSC 111, Adams J.

Kelly, unreported, SC Vic, 5 June 1998, O’Bryan J.

Kennedy [2000] NSWSC 109, Barr J.

Kennedy, unreported, SC NSW, 20 June 1998, James J.

Kerr, unreported, CCA WA, 9 July 1997, Kennedy J.

Kershaw, unreported, SC NSW, 6 September 1995, James J.

Kim, unreported, SC NSW, 23 May 1996, Allen J.

Kim, unreported, CA Qld, 29 November 1993, The President, Davies and McPherson JJA.

King, unreported, SC NSW, 13 August 1998, Studdert J.

King, unreported, CCA NSW, 24 February 1998, Hunt CJ at CL, Sperling and Barr JJ.

Kontaxakis, unreported, SC NSW, 30 October 1990, Enderby J.

Kontinnen, unreported, SC SA, 30 March 1992, Legoe J.

Kropp, unreported, SC SA, 20 January 1995, No 23/95, Mohr J.

Lalor, unreported, SC NSW, 21 July 1995, Grove J.

Lambadgee, unreported, CCA WA, 19 December 1990, Wallace, Kennedy and Pidgeon JJ.

Laurie, unreported, SC NSW, 30 April 1992, Slattery AJ.

Leaman, unreported, SC Tas, 10 December 1996, Cox CJ.

Leonard [1999] NSWSC 510, Sully J.

Light, unreported, SC Vic, 1 March 1990, McGarvie J.

Ljubic, unreported, CCA NSW, 3 July 1989, Hope JA, Enderby and Grove JJ.

Lorenz [1998] SC ACT 81, Crispin J.

Lovec, unreported, CCA SA, 21 September 1987, King CJ, Jacobs and Millhouse JJ.

Low, unreported, CCA NSW, 13 August 1991, Lee CJ at CL, McInerney and Sharpe JJ.

M, unreported, SC SA, 31 January 1986, Johnston J.

Table of Cases

Monly, unreported, SC SA, 2 February 1996, Perry J.

Manning, unreported, CCA NSW, 15 April 1988, Lee, Carruthers and Campbell JJ.

Mansfield, unreported, SC Vic, 5 May 1994, Hampel J.


McIntyre, unreported, SC NSW, 15 March 1996, McInerney J.

McKellar, unreported, SC NSW, 25 March 1992, Wood J.

McKenzie, [2000] QCA 324, McMurdo, McPherson JA and Dutney J

McKernon, unreported, SC SA, 3 March 1993, Millhouse J.

McMillian, unreported, SC NSW, 17 December 1992, Slattery AJ.

Merritt, unreported, CCA NSW, 2 June 1988, Finlay, Grove and McInerney JJ.


Milera, unreported, SC SA, 30 August 1991, Cox J.

Moore, unreported, CCA NSW, 16 June 1998, Smart, Ireland and Dunford JJ; unreported, SC NSW, 2 May 1997, Newman J.

Moore, unreported, CCA NSW, 4 November 1991, Lee AJ, Carruthers and Sully JJ.

Morgan, unreported, SC NSW, 28 July 1997, Hidden J.

Munro [2001] NSWCCA 187, Stein JA, James and Beil JJ.

Murphy, unreported SC Tas, 2 July 1996, Zeeman J.

Nardoni [1999] NSWSC 1097, Grove J.

Nettles, unreported, SC NSW, 27 April 1993, Grove J.

Nichols, unreported, SC Tas, 15 December 1986, Neasey J.

Nixon, unreported, CA Qld, 22 July 1992, The President, Davies and Lee JJ.

Obholz, unreported, SC NSW, 18 September 1992, Abadce J.

Olig [2000] NSWSC 1242, Adams J.

Owen, unreported, CCA NSW, 5 June 1997, Gleeson CJ, Stein JA and Bruce J; unreported, SC NSW, 15 Nov 1996, McInerney J.

XX
Table of Cases

Palamidovski, unreported, CCA NSW, 10 October 1986, Slattery CJ at CL, Lee and Allen J.J.

Panozzo, unreported, CCA NSW, 25 March 1993, Hunt CJ at CL, Carruthers and Ireland JJ.

Parsons, unreported SC ACT, 18 May 1995, Spender J.


Pashalay, unreported, CCA Vic, 27 July 1998, Winneke, Charles and Callaway JJA.

Penn, unreported, CCA Vic, 9 May 1994, Crockett, Southwell and Vincent JJ.

Perich, unreported, CCA WA, 3 September 1996, Malcolm CJ, Pidgeon and Murray JJ.

Peters [1999] VSC 421, Hampel J.

Prasad, unreported, NSW SC, 91/91/0099.

Puchalski, unreported, CCA Vic, 30 October 1991, Crockett, Southwell and Nathan JJ.

Raby, unreported, SC Vic, 22 November 1994, Teague J.

Ratcliffe, unreported, CCA WA, 20 February 1990, Malcolm CJ, Kennedy and Rowland JJ.

Reynolds, unreported, CCA Vic, 28 May 1997, Winneke P, Brooking JA and Ashley AJA.

Rigney, unreported, SC SA, 21 May 1996, Williams J.

Ritchie, unreported, SC Tas, 28 June 1999, Underwood J.


Roberts, unreported, SC NSW, 1 August 1989, Hunt J.

Rogers, unreported, SC Vic, 11 December 1995, Hampel J.

Rose, unreported, SC WA, August 1989 (91/89).

Rosevears, unreported, SC NSW, 89/91/0115.

Rudkowsky, unreported, CCA NSW, 31 August 1995, Gleeson CJ, Cripps and McInerney JJ.

Rushton, unreported, CA Qld, 17 June 1997, Fitzgerald P, De Jersey and Dowsett JJ.

Ryan, unreported, SC NSW, 25 July 1991, Abadie J.

Sadler, unreported, SC Tas, 19 February 1999, Cox CJ.

Sanfil, unreported, CCA Vic, 14 October 1988, Crockett, King and Teague JJ.

Secretary, unreported, SC NT, 18 May 1998.
Seddon, unreported, SC Vic, 12 February 1988, Hampel J.

Sharpe, unreported, SC Tas, 6 October 2000, Slicer J.

Shaw, unreported, SC SA, 27 March 1987, Wells AJ.

Shaw, unreported, CCA SA, 11 December 1996, Matheson, Prior and Duggan JJ.


Sheppard, unreported, SC SA, 26 August 1992, Bollen J.

Sherry [2000] NSWCCA 35, Sully J, Carruthers and Smart AJJ.

Simington and Saunders, unreported, SC NSW, 4 November 1988, Loveday J.

Simon, unreported, SC NSW, 21 July 1995, Bruce J.

Smith, unreported, CA Qld, 26 February 1996, Pincus, Davies and McPherson JJA.

Sokol, unreported, CCA NSW, 2 February 1989, Lee CJ at CL, Wood and Mathews JJ.

Spencer, unreported, SC NSW, 18 December 1992, Mathews J.

Stephenson, unreported, SC Qld, August 1992.

Stjernqvist, unreported, Cairns CC, 18 June 1996, Derrington J.

Street, unreported, SC NSW, 29 June 1995, Dunford J.

Strong, unreported, SC NSW, 92/91/0016.

Surace, unreported, CCA NSW, 20 September 1989, Gleeson CJ, Carruthers and Campbell JJ.

Sutcliffe, unreported, SC Vic, 27 November 1990, Ashley J.

Sutherland, unreported, CCA SA, 16 November 1992, King CJ, Perry & Duggan JJ.

Tassone, unreported, SC NT, 26 April 1994, Gray J.

Taylor, unreported, SC SA, 16 June 1993, Olsson J.

Telford, unreported, CCA Vic, 4 June 1996, Phillips CJ, Southwell and Smith AJJA.

Terare, unreported, SC NSW, 20 April 1995, Levine J.

Terronova, unreported, CCA WA, 26 October 1993. Pidgeon, Rowland & Ipp JJ.

Tjami [2000] SASC 311, Prior, Duggan and Nyland JJ.

Towns, unreported, CCA Vic, 21 September 1992, Phillips CJ, Crockett and Nathan JJ.
Troja, unreported, CCA NSW, 16 July 1991, Kirby P, Grove and Newman JJ.

Tuncay, unreported, CCA Vic, 27 June 1997, Phillips CJ, Ormiston JA and Hedigan AJA.

Twala, unreported, CCA NSW, 4 November 1994, Carruthers, Finlay and Badgery-Parker JJ.

Vandersee [2000] NSWSC 916, James J.

Varagnolo, unreported, SC NSW, 21 March 1996, McInerney J.

Walton, unreported, CCA SA, 3 May 1989, Mohr, Matheson and Bollen JJ.


Webb, unreported, SC NSW, 17 June 1992, Badgery-Parker J.

Webb, unreported, CCA SA, 19 June 1992, White ACJ, Cox and Mohr AJJA.

Westley, unreported, SC NSW, 14 March 1997, Ireland J.

Whalen, unreported, CCA NSW, 5 April 1991, Lee CJ at CL, Carruthers and Sharpe JJ.


Wiffen, unreported, SC SA, 24 December 1990, Olsson J.

Winnett v Stephenson, unreported, Magistrates' Court of the ACT, 19 May 1993, Burns M.

Wirdum, unreported, CA Qld, 9 November 1994, Derrington J, Pincus and Davies JJA

Woodruff, unreported, SC Tas, 23 September 1998, Cox CJ.

Woolsey, unreported, SC NSW, 19 August 1993, Newman J.

Wright, unreported, SC NSW, 91/91/0029.

Young, unreported, SC NSW, 20 May 1998, Levine J.

Zubrinich, unreported, SC SA, 26 May 1994, Mohr J.

Zysec, unreported, SC WA, 21 May 1987 (no 76/87).

OTHER JURISDICTIONS

Acott [1997] 1 All ER 706.

Ahtuwalia [1992] 4 All ER 889.

Beckford [1987] 3 All ER 425.

Table of Cases

Byrne [1960] 2 QB 396.

Bright [1916] 2 KB 441.


Daniels (1984) 7 CCC (3d) 542.


Duffy [1949] 1 All ER 932.

Hayward (1833) 172 ER 1188.


HM Advocate v Dingwall (1867) 5 Irvine 446.

Hollingham v Head (1858) 140 ER 1135.

Holmes [1946] 2 All ER 124.


Kirkham (1837) 173 ER 422.


Lloyd [1967] 1 QB 175.

Malott [1998] 1 SCR 123.


Mawgridge (1707) 84 ER 1107.

McNaghten (1843) 10 Cl and Fin 200; 8 ER 718.


Rongonui, unreported, CA NZ, 13 April 2000.


Smith [2000] 4 All ER 289.

State v Stewart 763 P 2d 572.

Thornton (No 2) [1996] 2 All ER 1030.


Vaughan (1982) 4 Cr App R (S) 83.

Wang [1990] 2 NZLR 529.

Wanrow (1997) 88 Wash 2d 221.

Welsh (1869) 11 Cox CC 336.

Williams (Gladstone) (1983) 78 Cr App R 276.
TABLE OF STATUTES

AUSTRALIA

Commonwealth


Federal Court of Australia Act 1976.

Australian Capital Territory

Crimes Act 1900.

New South Wales

Crimes Act 1900.


Crimes (Homicide) Amendment Act 1982.


Criminal Appeal Act 1912.


Mental Health (Criminal Procedure) Act 1990.

Northern Territory

Criminal Code.

Criminal Code Amendment Act 2001 (NT).


Queensland

Criminal Code.

xxvi
Evidence Act 1977.


**South Australia**

Criminal Law Consolidation Act 1935.


**Tasmania**

Criminal Code.


**Victoria**

Crimes Act 1958.

Crimes (Mental Impairment and Fitness to be Tried) Act 1997.


**Western Australia**

Criminal Code.


**OTHER JURISDICTIONS**

Homicide Act 1957 (UK).

Criminal Code (Can).

Crimes Act 1961 (NZ).

**LIST OF TABLES AND FIGURE**

**TABLES**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>Violence in the relationship before the homicide by legal outcome</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>Outcome of case: male offenders</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>Outcome of case: female offenders</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>Act causing death: female offenders: 'lack of intent' manslaughter</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>Median head sentence: manslaughter in relation to killing partner</td>
<td>336</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.1</td>
<td>Spousal homicide: female offender: murder: sentences in years and appeal results</td>
<td>432</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.2</td>
<td>Spousal homicide: female offender: manslaughter: diminished responsibility: sentences in years and appeal results</td>
<td>432</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.3</td>
<td>Spousal homicide: female offender: manslaughter: provocation: sentences in years and appeal results</td>
<td>432</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.4</td>
<td>Spousal homicide: female offender: manslaughter: unlawful and dangerous act: sentences in years and appeal results</td>
<td>433</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.5</td>
<td>Spousal homicide: male offender: murder: sentences in years and appeal results</td>
<td>435</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.6</td>
<td>Spousal homicide: male offender: manslaughter diminished responsibility: sentences in years and appeal results</td>
<td>438</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.7</td>
<td>Spousal homicide: male offender: manslaughter: provocation: sentences in years and appeal results</td>
<td>438</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.8</td>
<td>Spousal homicide: male offender: manslaughter: unlawful and dangerous act: sentences in years and appeal results</td>
<td>439</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**FIGURE**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>The power and control wheel</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>