

**THE INTERNATIONAL BACCALAUREATE: POLICY PROCESS IN
EDUCATION**

by

Ian Hill

**BA, Dip Ed (University of Tasmania)
M Ed Admin (University of New England)**

in the Centre for Education

**Submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for
the degree of Doctor of Philosophy at
the University of Tasmania**

July 1993

Thesis
HILL
Ph.D
Educ
1994

To my wife, Danielle-Louise, without whose encouragement and infinite patience this thesis would never have been written.

This thesis contains no material which has been accepted for an award of any other higher degree or graduate diploma in any tertiary institution, and to the best of my knowledge and belief it contains no material previously published or written by another person, except when due reference is made in the text of the thesis.

G. L. Hill

20.07.93

Abstract

This is a qualitative, historical case study in the area of international education using a policy process approach. The research explores the characteristics of policy formation and implementation which led to the creation, maintenance and expansion of the IB diploma and the IB Office (a private non-government organisation registered in Geneva); it covers events from 1920 to 1978.

This research is guided by an assumption that the basic question of policy analysis is: *who did what and why?* Existing policy process models are examined on a continuum from the rational to the political and a conceptual model is created which accounts for human interaction without ignoring scientific reflection. This framework is a three-dimensional structure consisting of seven policy process stages, nine categories of actors and ten factors. Four stages of policy formation - problem definition, aggregation, agenda setting, policy decision - and three stages of policy implementation - design, administration, execution - are discussed. The following actors are identified: headmasters, teachers, parents, students, university staff, funding organisations, education officials, UNESCO, non-education professionals. Influential factors comprise technical analysis, family welfare, ideologies, self-interest and the following environmental contexts: economic, educational, social, political, technological and international diffusion. The social context comprises demography, culture, history and geography.

The research seeks to show the interdependence of the three elements: the policy process stages, the actors, and the factors which influence the actors during one or more of the policy process stages. Data is obtained from published literature, unpublished documents, interviews, conversations.

The study shows a number of temporal and structural properties of the policy process such as the non-sequential and overlapping nature of the stages. Other theoretical findings concern the multiple impact of influential factors on actors, the importance of personal ideologies in shaping actor behaviour, the properties of international diffusion and their implications for structure in international organisations, the impact of implementation on the policy decision, the concept of leverage for elite actors, compliance in an international non-government setting, and how the nature of the policy decision directly affects the structure of the policy process.

Acknowledgements

I wish to express my appreciation to my Supervisor, Professor Phillip Hughes, formerly of the Centre for Education, University of Tasmania, who guided the production of this thesis with the wisdom of vast experience.

To Dr Brian Caldwell, also formerly of the Centre for Education, University of Tasmania, I owe a debt of gratitude for his suggestions concerning the orientation of the research in its seminal days.

I wish to acknowledge the willing cooperation of Dr Roger Peel, Director-General of the IB Organisation, who allowed ready access at all times to ISES and IBO archives in Geneva and to Gérard Renaud, former Director-General of the IB Organisation who assisted me on many occasions.

I am beholden to my friends and acquaintances in the world of international education (many of whom are listed in Appendix 2) for granting interviews and providing assistance in other ways. I must single out Ruth Bonner, former Executive Secretary of ISES and IBO and now in active retirement. She received me on many occasions in Geneva, always with new information or documents that might be useful, a room to work and sleep in, and a word of encouragement along the way. Thank you, Ruth.

The assistance of the Director-General of the International School of Geneva, George Walker, is gratefully acknowledged in making available the Minutes of the Meetings of the Board of Governors and procuring other documents concerning the school.

CONTENTS

List of Figures	xiv
List of Tables	xvii
List of Appendices	xix
Glossary	xxi
 Chapter 1 INTRODUCTION	
Purposes of the Research	1
Research Question	2
Significance of the Study	
. Contribution to the History of the IB	3
. Significance for IB Development across the Globe	3
. Significance for Policy Analysis	4
. Significance for Educational Administrators	4
Definition of terms	
. Policy-Related Terms	5
. International and National Schools	7
Delimitations	9
The International Baccalaureate	
. What is it?	9
. Historical Perspective	12
. The Present	17
Summary	17
 Chapter 2 A REVIEW OF RELEVANT MODELS RELATING TO POLICY FORMATION AND IMPLEMENTATION	
Introduction	19
Orientation of Models	20
Rational Model	21
Incremental Model	26
Systems Theory	28
Comparative Theory	33

Elite Theory	38
Interest Groups	42
Process Model	45
Summary	52
Chapter 3 THE CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK	
Introduction	55
Rationale for the Framework	56
The Conceptual Framework	57
Stages of Policy Formation	
. Problem Definition	59
. Aggregation	60
. Agenda Setting	61
. Policy Decision	63
Stages of Policy Implementation	
. Design	64
. Administration	65
. Execution	66
Actors	67
Influential Factors	71
. Environmental Context	72
. Technical Analysis	73
. Self-Interest	74
. Ideologies	75
. Family Welfare	76
Interdependent Characteristics of the Conceptual Framework	
. Simultaneous Involvement of Elements on the Same Axis	77
. Linear Representation of the Stages of Policy Formation and Implementation	78
. The Dimension of Time	78
. Geometric Properties of the Conceptual Framework	79
Conclusion	81
Summary	81

Chapter 4 THE RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

Introduction	84
Quantitative and Qualitative Research	84
A Study in International Policy Formation and Implementation	85
The Case Study Approach	86
Primary and Secondary Sources of Data	88
Sampling	89
Validity and Reliability	89
Selected Methodological Issues	
. Investigator Bias	91
. Interviews	91
The Conceptual Framework and the Data	93
. Stages of Policy Formation and Implementation over Time	94
. Influential Factors	95
. Actors	96
Summary	98

Chapter 5 DEFINING THE PROBLEM

Introduction	101
Factors Influencing Problem Definition	
. The Rise of International Schools	102
. The Educational Program of International Schools	105
Actors	
. Meyhoffer, Parents and the League of Nations	107
. Headmasters and UNESCO	108
. Teachers	110
. Parents, Non-education Professionals and the UN	112
. The ISA Consultant	113
. The International School of Geneva: Headmaster and Chairman of the Board	114
. The United World College of the Atlantic	116

Synthesis	118
. The Creation of the International School of Geneva and Subsequent International Schools	119
. Problem Perception by Different Actors	121
Conclusion	125
Chapter 6 AGGREGATION	
Introduction	131
Conference of Internationally-Minded Schools 1949	131
Course for Teachers Interested in International Education 1950	133
International Schools Association 1951	134
Conference of Teachers of Social Studies in International Schools 1962	137
Aggregation as Policy Process	139
Summary	144
Chapter 7 PART 1: AGENDA SETTING	
Introduction	146
Size and Nature of the Population Affected	146
The Seriousness and Reality of the Problem	147
The Availability of an Acceptable Solution	148
Representation and Access to Decision Makers	149
Preoccupations of the Policy Makers	151
Synthesis	152
PART 2: THE POLICY DECISION	
Introduction	155
The Policy Statement	155
Arriving at the Decision	156

Interest Group and Elite Theories	159
The Decision Making Elite	161
The Nature of the Policy Statement	164
Synthesis	166
 Chapter 8 DESIGN	
Introduction	168
Designing the Program	
. Contemporary History	169
. Other Subjects	170
. ISES Day	171
. Draft Proposal for an International Baccalaureate	172
. Curriculum Development Meetings	173
. Sèvres Conference 1967	174
. Events from August 1967 to July 1969	175
. Consultative Committee	176
. School-Based Curriculum Development	176
. Funding	177
Summary of Program Design Activities	179
ISA: Planning for the Execution of the IB Program	
. Marketing	183
. Delivery	185
. Human and Material Resources	185
. Funding	185
ISES and IBO: Planning for the Execution of the IB Program	
. ISES Principles Document	186
. ISES Plan for 1964-1965	187
. ISES: the Five-Year Plan 1965-1969	187
. Other ISES and IBO Planning Documentation	188
Summary of Planning for the Execution of the IB Program	190
Synthesis	193
 Chapter 9 ADMINISTRATION	
Introduction	194
International Schools Examination Syndicate (ISES)	194

International Baccalaureate Office (IBO)	196
North American IB Office	199
Marketing	202
. Universities	203
. Schools: Teachers, Students and Parents	206
. Ministries of Education and National Governments	209
. Examining Bodies	212
Program Delivery	214
Human and Material Resources	216
. Alec Peterson	216
. Oxford Research Unit	218
Funding	220
. UNESCO	221
. The Twentieth Century Fund	222
. The Ford Foundation	223
. Funding by National Governments	226
. School Contributions	227
Synthesis	
. Events and Principal Actors	228
. Organisation of the IB Office	232
. Actors and their Roles	233
. Actors and Reactors	234
Chapter 10 EXECUTION	
Introduction	236
Trial Examinations 1967-1969	237
Experimental Period 1970-1976	238
Sèvres Conference 1974	241
Participating Schools	243
University Recognition	248
Evaluation	251
Elitism	254
International Diffusion	255

Actors	256
Synthesis	258
Chapter 11 AN OVERVIEW OF THE POLICY PROCESS STAGES	
The Formation and Implementation Phases	261
Policy Formation Phase	262
Policy Implementation Phase	266
Evaluation Feedback and the Policy Process	269
Summary	270
Chapter 12 ACTORS ACROSS POLICY PROCESS STAGES	
Actor Involvement and the Conceptual Framework	271
Changing Classification of Actors	272
Headmasters	274
Teachers	278
Parents	280
Students	282
University Staff	283
Funding Organisations	286
Education Officials	291
UNESCO	293
Nor.-education Professionals	296
Summary	300
Chapter 13 INFLUENTIAL FACTORS ACROSS POLICY PROCESS STAGES	
The Nature of Influential Factors	302
The Effect of IB Adoption on Influential Factors	303

Influential Factors and the Conceptual Framework	306
Technical Analysis:	307
Family Welfare	308
Ideologies	309
Self-Interest	313
Economic Context	315
Educational Context	317
Social Context	319
. Demography	320
. Culture	321
. History	323
. Geography	324
Political Context	326
Technology	328
International Diffusion	329
Summary	330
Chapter 14 SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS	
Findings Concerning IB Development	
. Policy Process Stages	331
. Actors	335
. Influential Factors	340
Methodological Considerations	343
Theory Development	
. Temporal and Structural Properties of the Policy Process	344
. Other Theoretical Considerations	346
Future Research Questions	355
Conclusion	357
BIBLIOGRAPHY	
Policy Analysis Literature	359

List of Figures

Figure 1.1 Phases of the Policy Process	6
Figure 2.1 Policy Process Models According to Rational or Political Orientation	20
Figure 2.2 Rational Systems Model after Caldwell and Tymko	25
Figure 2.3 Basic Systems Model of the Policy Process	29
Figure 2.4 Hierarchical Layers of the Tasmanian Education Department Involved in the Implementation of Compulsory Literacy and Numeracy Testing	35
Figure 2.5 The Elite Model	39
Figure 2.6 Interest Group Model	44
Figure 3.1 Model of International Policy Formation and Implementation in Education	58
Figure 3.2 Cubic Space in the Conceptual Model	79a
Figure 3.3 The Agenda Setting Stage (Layer) of Policy Formation: Possible Actors and Factors Influencing their Behaviour	81
Figure 5.1 Actors and Factors Influencing the Creation of the International School of Geneva and Subsequent International Schools	119a
Figure 5.2 The Problem Definition Stage of the Policy Process	127a
Figure 6.1 The Aggregation Stage of the Policy Process	145a
Figure 7.1 The Agenda Setting Stage of the Policy Process	154a
Figure 7.2 An Interest Group Theory Representation of the IB Policy Process	160
Figure 7.3 Information Networks to the Decision Making Elite	163
Figure 7.4 The Decision Stage of the Policy Process	167a
Figure 8.1 The Design Stage of the Policy Process	193a

Figure 9.1 Components of IB Program Delivery	214
Figure 9.2 Current Structure of IBO	232a
Figure 9.3 The Administration Stage of the Policy Process	235a
Figure 10.1 Actors as Deliverers and Recipients During the Execution Stage	257
Figure 10.2 The Execution Stage of the Policy Process	260a
Figure 11.1 The Relationship Between Formation and Implementation in Terms of Policy Process Stages	262
Figure 11.2 Overlapping Stages of Policy Formation	266
Figure 12.1 The Involvement of Headmasters Across Policy Process Stages and the Factors that Influenced Them	274a
Figure 12.2 The Involvement of Teachers Across Policy Process Stages and the Factors that Influenced Them	278a
Figure 12.3 The Involvement of Parents Across Policy Process Stages and the Factors that Influenced Them	280a
Figure 12.4 The Involvement of Students Across Policy Process Stages and the Factors that Influenced Them	282a
Figure 12.5 The Involvement of University Staff Across Policy Process Stages and the Factors that Influenced Them	283a
Figure 12.6 The Involvement of Funding Organisations Across Policy Process Stages and the Factors that Influenced Them	286a
Figure 12.7 The Involvement of Education Officials Across Policy Process Stages and the Factors that Influenced Them	291a
Figure 12.8 The Involvement of UNESCO Across Policy Process Stages and the Factors that Influenced this Involvement	294a
Figure 12.9 The Involvement of Non-education Professionals Across Policy Process Stages and the Factors that Influenced Them	296a
Figure 13.1 A Systems Model Representation of IB Program Impact on Environmental Factors	306a

Figure 13.2 The Influence of Technical Analysis on Actors Across Policy Process Stages	307a
Figure 13.3 The Influence of Family Welfare on Actors Across Policy Process Stages	308a
Figure 13.4 The Influence of Ideologies on Actors Across Policy Process Stages	311a
Figure 13.5 The Influence of Self-Interest on Actors Across Policy Process Stages	313a
Figure 13.6 The Influence of the Economic Context on Actors Across Policy Process Stages	315a
Figure 13.7 The Influence of the Educational Context on Actors Across Policy Process Stages	317a
Figure 13.8 The Influence of the Social Context on Actors Across Policy Process Stages	320a
Figure 13.9 The Influence of the Political Context on Actors Across Policy Process Stages	327a
Figure 13.10 The Influence of Technology on Actors Across Policy Process Stages	329a
Figure 13.11 The Influence of International Diffusion on Actors Across Policy Process Stages	330a

List of Tables

Table 2.1 Agenda Setting and Decision Making for Policy Elites	41
Table 2.2 Summary of Policy Process Models Discussed in Chapter 2	54
Table 4.1 Primary Sources of Information for the Study	89
Table 4.2 Research Question: Outline of Data Sources, Data Collected and Methodology for each Policy Formation and Implementation Stage	100
Table 5.1 Factors Influencing Problem Definition and Proposed Solutions by Actors with Particular Reference to the International School of Geneva	121a

Table 5.2 A Chronological Summary of Significant Events and Actors Related to the Problem Definition Stage	128
Table 6.1 The Creation of the Conference of Internationally-Minded Schools as Policy Process	139
Table 6.2 The Creation of the Course for Teachers Interested in International Education as Policy Process	141
Table 6.3 The Creation of the International Schools Association as Policy Process	142
Table 6.4 The Creation of the Conference of Teachers of Social Studies in International Schools as Policy Process	143
Table 7.1 Chronological Summary of Significant Events and Actors Related to the Agenda-Setting Stage	152
Table 7.2 Chronological Summary of the Policy Decision Stage and Actors Involved	166
Table 8.1 UNESCO Contracts with the IB Office 1974 to 1979	179
Table 8.2 Chronological Summary of Significant Events and Actors Related to Program Design	181
Table 8.3 Chronological Summary of Significant Plans and Proposed Actors Related to the Design Stage	191
Table 9.1 Principal Actors in the Early Years of the ISES and IBO	201
Table 9.2 Chronological Summary of Major Events and Actors Related to the Administration Stage	228
Table 9.3 Growth of IB Administration Offices to 1992	232b
Table 10.1 Schools and Candidates Participating in Trial IB Examinations 1968	237
Table 10.2 IB Examination Statistics for the Experimental Period 1970-1976	239
Table 10.3 IB Examinations 1963-1976	259
Table 11.1 Juxtaposition of the Policy Formation Stages	263
Table 11.2 Juxtaposition of the Policy Implementation Stages	267

Table 12.1 Involvement of Headmasters Throughout the IB Policy Process	278
Table 12.2 Aspects of Leverage for Leach and Renaud	280
Table 12.3 Principal Parent Actors During Policy Process Stages	282
Table 12.4 Foundations and the Criteria under which the IB was Funded	290
Table 12.5 UNESCO Sponsorship During the Formation Phase	293
Table 12.6 Aspects of Leverage for Selected Non-education Professionals	299
Table 13.1 Growth of IBO Regional Representation to 1992	325a

Appendices

Appendix 1 International School Organisations	377
Appendix 2 List of Interviews and Conversations	378
Appendix 3 Organisations which have Funded Activities Associated with the Development of the IB	381
Appendix 4 Paul Meyhoffer Letter Concerning a <i>Maturité Internationale</i>	384
Appendix 5 Participants at the Inaugural Meeting of the Conference of Principals of International Schools, UNESCO, Paris, 31 March and 1 April 1949	388
Appendix 6 Inaugural Structure and Membership of the International Schools Examination Syndicate (ISES), February 1964, Geneva	389
Appendix 7 IBO Council of Foundation, Executive Committee and Examinations Board 1967	391
Appendix 8 Statement of the Basic Principles upon which the ISES has Developed Its Program	393
Appendix 9 Draft Proposal for an International Baccalaureate	395
Appendix 10 University Recognition of the IB as at October 1976	397

Appendix 11 IBO Chief Examiners 1973	398
Appendix 12 IB Regulations	399

Glossary

Advanced Placement: an examination administered by the CEEB and used by USA colleges and universities as an entry qualification

AAIBS: Australasian Association of International Baccalaureate Schools

ACACA: Australasian Conference of Assessment and Certification Authorities

"A" Levels: Advanced Level of GCE (now GCSE) in the UK used by universities as an entry qualification

CAS: Creativity, Action, Service - a requirement of the IB diploma

CEEB: College Entrance Examination Board, USA

CERN: Centre Européen de Recherche Nucléaire (European Nuclear Research Centre), Geneva

ECIS: European Council of International Schools, UK

GCE: General Certificate of Education "O" Levels (now GCSE) sat by students in the UK two years before "A" Levels

GCSE: General Certificate of Secondary Education which has replaced the GCE in the UK

HSC: Standing Conference of Heads of IB Schools

IB: International Baccalaureate

IBE: International Bureau of Education, Geneva, a subsidiary of UNESCO

IBNA: International Baccalaureate North American office

IBO: International Baccalaureate Office ("Organisation" after 1986)

ISA: International Schools Association, Geneva

ISES: International Schools Examination Syndicate

ISS: International Schools Services, USA

Lycée: a French secondary school for the last three years leading to the *baccalauréat*

Proviseur: Head of a French lycée

SCG: IB Standing Conference of Governments

UNIS: United Nations International School, New York

UWC: United World College