Finding common ground: An exploration of the factors influencing coordinated and collaborative community-based approaches to services that support early childhood development in Tasmanian rural communities

Susan Maree Johns
MEd (Research), BAdVocEd, BEd

Submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy

University of Tasmania

March 2010
Statement of originality

I, Susan Maree Johns, am the author of the thesis titled *Finding common ground: An exploration of the factors influencing coordinated and collaborative community-based approaches to early childhood development in Tasmanian rural communities*, submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy. I declare that the material is original, and to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due acknowledgment is made in the text of the thesis, nor does the thesis contain any material that infringes copyright. The thesis contains no material which has been accepted for a degree or diploma by the University or any other institution.

Susan Maree Johns                                Date
Statement of authority of access

I, Susan Maree Johns, author of the thesis titled *Finding common ground: An exploration of the factors influencing coordinated and collaborative community-based approaches to early childhood development in Tasmanian rural communities*, submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy, agree that this thesis may be made available for loan and limited copying in accordance with the Copyright Act 1968.

Susan Maree Johns

Date
Abstract

The purpose of the study is to explore coordinated and collaborative community-based approaches to services that support early childhood development within three small Tasmanian rural communities, and to examine the factors that influence their development and sustainability. The study focuses specifically on linkages amongst groups and organisations that provide early childhood and family services and supports. Parental and community capacity building have been identified as critical to early childhood development. The emphasis is on developing community-based approaches to provide a support base and safety net for families with young children. Context shapes the development of community-based approaches, yet much of the early childhood literature is derived from urban communities, and it is not clear to what extent this is relevant to the rural context. Additionally, much of the literature examines linkages from an organisational perspective rather than a whole-of-community perspective. This multi-site, multi-method study uses a qualitative approach and case study methodology. Interviews are the key data source, along with observation and written documentation. Working within a community development framework, the study adopts a multi-layered view of community, and examines linkages from multiple perspectives.

Findings indicate that community-based early childhood linkages represent a continuum of activity, extending from cooperation to collaboration. Three interdependent factors influence the development and sustainability of coordinated and collaborative community-based approaches to early childhood development: social capital, leadership and environmental factors. The three influencing factors operate within a rural and community context. This is one of the first early childhood studies to explore the nature and influence of community leadership, moving beyond the traditional focus on individual leaders. The study highlights a link between influencing factors and community readiness. As communities move from early to later stages of readiness, internal leadership capacity develops, levels of social capital are increased, and communities develop
the capacity to harness and shape environmental factors to better meet identified need.

The study fills a gap in our knowledge of the development and sustainability of community-based approaches to early childhood development in rural communities, and will enhance the targeting of resources and supports, including mentoring. Implications include the need to increase skills, knowledge and supports in relation to the process of developing and sustaining coordinated and collaborative activity in rural areas. This includes greater attention to the provision of interprofessional learning with a rural component for undergraduates and initial trainees, on-site interprofessional development for voluntary and paid staff, and assistance in establishing and supporting appropriate leadership structures.
Acknowledgments

I wish to gratefully acknowledge the invaluable support, guidance and mentoring provided by my supervisors: Professor Sue Kilpatrick, Pro Vice Chancellor (Rural and Regional), Deakin University; Professor Joan Abbott-Chapman, Faculty of Education, University of Tasmania, and my former supervisor, Professor Bill Mulford, Faculty of Education, University of Tasmania. I am particularly indebted to Professor Sue Kilpatrick who has continued to supervise me on an honorary basis, following her departure from the University of Tasmania.

I wish to acknowledge the support provided by postgraduate students and work colleagues in the University Department of Rural Health at the University of Tasmania, and specifically their willingness to act as a sounding board during project design, data collection and analysis, and preparation of the thesis.

Thank you also to my son Matthew Johns, and colleague Bron Fein, for assistance with graphics and formatting.

Completion of this research would not have been possible without the unwavering support of my husband Ron, and patience of my children Matthew, Luke and Madeleine.
Contents

Statement of originality ........................................................................................................... i
Statement of authority of access .............................................................................................. ii
Abstract .................................................................................................................................... iii
Acknowledgments .................................................................................................................. v
List of figures .......................................................................................................................... xii
List of tables ............................................................................................................................ xiii

Chapter 1: Introduction .......................................................................................................... 1

Purpose and research questions ............................................................................................. 1

Background and rationale for the study .................................................................................. 2

Growing awareness of the importance of community-based approaches to early childhood development ......................................................................................................................... 2

Supporting the early years in Tasmanian rural communities .................................................. 6

Timeliness of the study ........................................................................................................... 8

Scope and delimitations of the study ...................................................................................... 9

Structure of the dissertation ................................................................................................... 10

Chapter 2: Literature Review ............................................................................................... 14

Introduction ............................................................................................................................. 14

Policy frameworks for early childhood development .............................................................. 15

Implementing early childhood policy ..................................................................................... 17

Types of early childhood linkages .......................................................................................... 19

Intensity, complexity and purpose .......................................................................................... 19

Different terminology .............................................................................................................. 21

Collaboration .......................................................................................................................... 21

Integration ............................................................................................................................... 22

Partnership ............................................................................................................................... 22

Scoping the literature on early childhood linkages .................................................................. 23

Research on early childhood collaborations: Factors influencing process ............................ 25

Enhancers and inhibitors ......................................................................................................... 25

Interpersonal factors ................................................................................................................. 25

Structural factors ..................................................................................................................... 26

The nature and extent of influence of interpersonal and group factors: Social capital and coordinated and collaborative activity ........................................................................................................... 28

Knowledge resources and coordinated and collaborative activity ........................................ 30

Identity resources and coordinated and collaborative activity ............................................. 31

The nature and extent of influence of leadership .................................................................... 34

Characteristics, roles and contributions of leaders ................................................................. 35

Structures that facilitate leadership ....................................................................................... 38

Leadership process ................................................................................................................ 39

Organisational and/ or community readiness .......................................................................... 41

The nature and extent of influence of broader environmental factors .................................... 42

Policy and funding issues ....................................................................................................... 42

Workforce issues .................................................................................................................... 44

Relationship amongst influencing factors .............................................................................. 45

Influencing factors, process outcomes and sustainability ..................................................... 45
Chapter 3: Methodology

Introduction

Research paradigm, ontology and epistemology

Qualitative research

Constructivist paradigm and ontological and epistemological assumptions

Theoretical perspectives

Constructivist-interpretivist perspective

Social capital theory

Research methodology and strategy: Case study

Rationale

Type of case study research

Multiple case study design

Case selection

Research methods and procedures

Multiple data sources and engagement in the field

Semi-structured interviews

Rationale for conducting and taping interviews

Identification of participants

Interviewee group, interview schedule and participant checklist

Staged process of interview data collection

Observation

The critical role of the researcher in interviewing and observation

The approach of the researcher to data collection

Managing the effects of the researcher’s role

Written documentation

Ethical implications

Recruitment of participants

Informed consent

Strategies to minimise risk

Confidentiality of data and anonymity of participants

Data analysis and reporting

General analytic strategy

Overview of the data analysis process

Use of NVivo data analysis software

Stages in the data analysis process

Step 1: Organise and prepare data

Step 2: Read through data to get a general sense of information

Step 3: Begin detailed analysis by coding data into categories or themes

Within-case analysis and reporting

Step 4: Generate a detailed description of the setting, identify a smaller number of categories that will represent the major findings of the study, and conduct additional layers of analysis to interconnect themes

Step 5: Determine how description and themes will be represented

Step 6: Interpret the data and identify what lessons were learned

Cross-case analysis and reporting
Step 4: Generate a detailed description of the setting, identify a smaller number of categories that will represent the major findings of the study, and conduct additional layers of analysis to interconnect themes ........................................... 92
Step 5: Determine how description and themes will be represented ........................................... 94
Step 6: Interpret the data and identify what lessons were learned ........................................... 94

Criteria for judging the quality of qualitative case study design ........................................... 94
Construc validity .................................................................................................................. 95
Internal validity .................................................................................................................. 97
External validity .................................................................................................................. 98
Reliability .......................................................................................................................... 99

Limitations of the study ....................................................................................................... 100

Chapter 4: Background to the Case Study Reports ................................................................. 102

Introduction ......................................................................................................................... 102
Definition of key terms ....................................................................................................... 102
Third sector organisation .................................................................................................... 102
Non government organisation (NGO) .................................................................................. 103
Community organisation ..................................................................................................... 103
Neighbourhood house ........................................................................................................ 103
Primary health care service ................................................................................................. 104
School cluster ..................................................................................................................... 104
Launching into Learning ...................................................................................................... 105

Site 1: Hopton Vale .............................................................................................................. 105
The site ................................................................................................................................. 105
The people and their support networks .............................................................................. 107
Timeline of events in site 1 ................................................................................................. 109

Site 2: Seamoor .................................................................................................................... 110
The site ................................................................................................................................. 110
The people and their support networks .............................................................................. 113
Timeline of events in site 2 ................................................................................................. 114

Site 3: Minton ....................................................................................................................... 116
The site ................................................................................................................................. 116
The people and their support networks .............................................................................. 119
Timeline of events in site 3 ................................................................................................. 121

Overview of early childhood services within each site ....................................................... 123

Chapter 5: Case Study Report Site 1 (Hopton Vale) ............................................................. 127

Findings: Development and operation of early childhood linkages .................................. 127
Early childhood services ..................................................................................................... 127
Services within all population centres ............................................................................... 127
Services that cross the LGA ............................................................................................... 128
Different types of linkages among early childhood services ............................................ 129
Cooperation among services ............................................................................................. 130
Coordination of service delivery ....................................................................................... 131
Collaborative activity among services ............................................................................... 131
Different scope of linkages among early childhood services ........................................... 134
Linkages within the LGA ................................................................................................. 134
External linkages ................................................................................................................. 135

Findings: Factors influencing early childhood linkages ..................................................... 136
Leadership ......................................................................................................................... 136
Leaders and their roles ........................................................................................................ 137
Leadership structures and process ................................................................................... 141
Chapter 8: Cross-case Analysis and Discussion .........................................................203

Introduction .............................................................................................................203

The nature and development of early childhood linkages in rural communities ..........203
Types of early childhood linkages ...........................................................................203
Involvement of schools in early childhood linkages in rural areas..........................206
Involvement of health services in early childhood linkages in rural areas ...............206
Involvement of local Councils in early childhood linkages in rural areas ...............207
Involvement of the third sector in early childhood linkages in rural areas ...............208
Why and how have these early childhood linkages developed? ...............................209

Factors that influence the development and/or sustainability of early childhood linkages .....210

The impact of influencing factors on the development and/or sustainability of coordinated and collaborative community-based approaches to early childhood development ..........213
To what extent is social capital an influencing factor? ..............................................213
Composition and nature of networks .....................................................................214
Government organisations .....................................................................................215
Third sector organisations .....................................................................................216
Trust, attitudes, and values .....................................................................................217
Shared values and trust ..........................................................................................218
Philosophy and service delivery orientation ............................................................219
Awareness of, and valuing the expertise of, others ..................................................220
Previous history of collaboration ............................................................................222
Workplace culture ....................................................................................................223
Commitment at all levels .........................................................................................224
Summary ..................................................................................................................225
To what extent is leadership an influencing factor? ..................................................225
Leadership process ..................................................................................................226
How are process outcomes linked to sustainability of coordinated and collaborative community-based approaches to early childhood development? ..................235
Leader attributes and roles ......................................................................................236
Leadership structures ..............................................................................................238
Summary ..................................................................................................................240
To what extent are environmental factors an influencing factor? ............................241
Micro-level environmental factors ..........................................................................241
Macro-level environmental factors ........................................................................242
Summary ..................................................................................................................245

Coordinated and collaborative community-based approaches to early childhood development in rural communities: A model .................................................................245

Chapter 9: Conclusions and Recommendations .......................................................249

Introduction .............................................................................................................249

Conclusions from the study .....................................................................................250

The nature, extent and development of early childhood linkages in rural communities ...250
Factors that influence the development and/or sustainability of early childhood linkages in rural communities .................................................................253
The impact of influencing factors on the development and/or sustainability of coordinated and collaborative community-based approaches to early childhood development .......... 256

Contribution of this study to early childhood development in rural areas ..................... 258

Recommendations for further research ................................................................. 261
Further research into early childhood linkages ....................................................... 261
Research to test findings in other contexts ............................................................. 262

Recommendations for policy and practice ............................................................. 264
Policy .......................................................................................................................... 264
Training, education and professional learning .......................................................... 264
Development and implementation of early childhood linkages .................................. 265
Practice .......................................................................................................................... 266
Development and implementation of early childhood linkages .................................. 266
Workplace and job role reform .................................................................................. 267

Finding common ground: Concluding remarks ......................................................... 268

References .................................................................................................................. 269
List of figures

Figure 1: CRLRA model of building and using social capital ......................................................... 30
Figure 2: Category reduction for explanatory node ‘linkage type’ .................................................. 89
Figure 3: Hopton Vale early childhood and parent support services ............................................. 124
Figure 4: Seamoor early childhood and parent support services ..................................................... 125
Figure 5: Minton early childhood and parent support services ...................................................... 126
Figure 6: Typology of early childhood linkages ............................................................................. 204
Figure 7: Category reduction for cross-case analysis of influencing factors .................................. 211
Figure 8: Refinement of the social capital node ............................................................................ 212
Figure 9: Key member organisations in early childhood networks .............................................. 214
Figure 10: Relationship between context and factors that influence early childhood linkages in rural communities ........................................................................................................... 246
List of tables

Table 1: Terminology used in this study ................................................................. 23
Table 2: Summary of research examining the influence of leadership on early childhood collaborative activity ................................................................. 35
Table 3: Research design and methodology .......................................................... 57
Table 4: Strategies to address the disadvantages of case study methodology ............ 65
Table 5: Case study types depicted in selected methodological texts ....................... 65
Table 6: Classification of participants by interviewee category ................................ 72
Table 7: Classification of participants by gender .................................................... 72
Table 8: Descriptive category parent and child nodes .......................................... 85
Table 9: Explanatory category parent and child nodes ......................................... 86
Table 10: Descriptor category and child nodes ...................................................... 87
Table 11: Case attributes ...................................................................................... 88
Table 12: Early Years program in Site 1 .................................................................. 228
Table 13: ABC Mobile Playgroup program in site 2 ............................................. 230
Table 14: Nutrition program in site 3 ..................................................................... 232
Table 15: Relationship between influencing factors and community readiness ....... 247