At the Edges – A Place and A Space For Tears:

Exploring the Framing of Depression in Contemporary Western Culture

By

Helen Elizabeth Collins

Master of Education, Edith Cowan University, 1998
Certificate of Art and Design, Western Australian Department of Training, 1995
Diploma of Education (Graduate), University of Western Australia, 1994
Bachelor of Arts (Social Sciences), WAIT (now Curtin University of Technology), 1986
Graduate Diploma in Library Studies, WAIT (now Curtin University of Technology), 1984
Bachelor of Arts (English), WAIT (now Curtin University of Technology), 1983

A thesis submitted in total fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

University of Tasmania

March, 2010
DECLARATION OF ORIGINALITY

This thesis does not contain any material that has been accepted for a degree or diploma by the University or any other tertiary institution. To the best of my knowledge and belief, this thesis does not contain material previously published or written by another person except where due reference is made in the text of the thesis and nor does this thesis contain any material that infringes copyright.

______________________________
Helen E. Collins
15/03/10

STATEMENT OF AUTHORITY OF ACCESS

This thesis may be made available for loan and limited copying in accordance with the Copyright Act 1968.

______________________________
Helen E. Collins
15/03/10
Abstract

In this thesis I explore the contemporary Western framing of depression as an illness requiring treatment. This understanding of depression is examined through a hermeneutic study of the depression literature, focusing primarily on medical and sociological academic literature, but also including one popular website. Drawing on Weberian social theory, I argue that the dominant cultural understanding of depression allows only one story to be told: that of depression as an illness necessitating medical treatment to facilitate a cure. However, depression can also be understood as part of the suffering that constitutes what it is to be human. While contemporary approaches to depression are valuable, they are also restricted. I suggest an inclusive interstitiality of different stories would expand the current framing of depression.

I draw on Weber’s analysis of the causal and codified nature of Western rationality and of the total world-view of the secular West deriving from religious antecedents to analyse the current framing of depression. In addition, I employ Derridean concepts of the Western proclivity for logocentrism and Levinasian concepts of the Western impulse to change Other into Same to augment the Weberian analysis to demonstrate how dominant approaches to depression are influenced by both historical and cultural factors ‘specific and peculiar’ to the Western way of viewing the world. This approach embeds depression within the historical-cultural milieu of the West, which I argue provides a predominantly exclusive and scientifically based view of depression as illness. I demonstrate this through an exploration of historical influences, interpretative positions, the assigning of meaning, and information produced for the public. Finally, I proffer some possibilities for future directions.

The meta-perspective provided by this approach facilitates, for example, an appreciation that contemporary medical science inherited its belief in a total world-view from Western religious antecedents. Such a world-view results in the contemporary framing of depression functioning as though depression can only be viewed from the medical-scientific perspective, which is considered, a priori, to be the correct perspective. Establishing this meta-perspective enables the contemporary
framing of depression to be situated firmly *within* its historical-cultural background. Through this re-interpretation of contemporary approaches to depression the study provides another perspective on depression: one that is historically and culturally grounded, one that challenges current perspectives and opinions, and one that encourages respectful dialogue and debate.
Acknowledgements

This PhD has been a personal and academic journey of profound depth and wide-ranging exploration. I could not have ventured, or continued, upon this journey without support and encouragement from other people.

In particular, my supervisor, Associate Professor Douglas Ezzy, provided constant support and advice, carefully negotiating the difficult terrain between criticism and affirmation of my work. I am very appreciative of his interest and enthusiasm for my topic. I am also indebted to him for his unavering belief in me that I could produce a worthwhile PhD, when I so very often doubted my abilities and myself.

I also appreciate the assistance provided by Associate Professor Gary Easthope, my associate supervisor, during the early part of my doctoral candidature and for his helpful comments on the semi-penultimate draft of my thesis.

My thanks are also due to Dr. Daphne Habibis for providing advice on general references in the early months of my doctoral candidature and to Dr. Julia Verdouw for useful comments on an early draft of Chapter One.

I am also very thankful for the assistance of Della Clark, Lyn Devereaux, Andrea Michaelson, and Denise Jones for their administrative support, particularly for help in solving printer, photocopier, and computer problems.

I would also like to extend my thanks to the staff of the University Library for assistance over the years, and particularly to the Document Delivery staff for securing books and articles from other libraries.

Finally, and most importantly, I owe a great debt of gratitude to my husband, James Collins, for his unceasing support and encouragement. Without his patience and understanding, this PhD thesis would never have been completed.
Hence loathed Melancholy
   Of Cerberus and blackest midnight born,
In Stygian cave forlorn
   ‘Mongst horrid shapes, and shrieks, and sights unholy,
Find out some uncouth cell,
   Where brooding darkness spreads his jealous wings,
And the night-raven sings;
   There under ebon shades, and low-browed rocks,
As ragged as thy locks,
   In dark Cimmerian desert ever dwell....

Mirth with thee, I mean to live.

(L’Allegro, John Milton)¹

But hail though goddess, sage and holy,
Hail divinest Melancholy,
   Whose saintly visage is too bright
To hit the sense of human sight;
And therefore to our weaker view,
   O’erlaid with black, staid Wisdom’s hue....

And I with thee will choose to live.

(Il Penseroso, John Milton)²

¹ Milton 2007: 15-19
² Milton 2007: 19-24
# Table of Contents

DECLARATION OF ORIGINALITY ii  
STATEMENT OF AUTHORITY OF ACCESS ii  
ABSTRACT iii  
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS v  
TABLE OF CONTENTS vii  

PART ONE 1  
INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND  

Chapter One – Introduction 2  
Depression: Demon or Dæmon?  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.1 Introduction</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 Background and Overview</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.1 Terminology</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.2 Statement of the Problem</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.3 Sociological Research on Depression</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2.4 Statement of My Argument</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3 Methodology</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4 Method</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4.1 Data Collection</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4.2 Process</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5 Approach and Layout</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.6 Conclusion</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Chapter Two 32  
Theory: Possibilities and Directions  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.1 Introduction</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 Background</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2.1 Selected Theorists</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3 Weber</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.1 Historical Religious Antecedents</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.2 The Protestant Ethic</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3.3 Western Rationalism</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4 Derrida and Levinas</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.1 Derrida</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4.2 Levinas</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5 Conclusion</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter Three
Background: Motifs of Suffering in Western Culture

3.1 Introduction
   3.1.1 Introducing the Selected Literature
   3.1.2 Introducing the Motifs of Suffering
3.2 Acceptance and Resistance
3.3 Relationship and Causality
3.4 Chaos and Certainty
3.5 Descent and Ascent
3.6 Conclusion

Chapter Four
The Quatrefoil Model of Historical-Cultural Framing

4.1 Introduction
4.2 Introducing My Theoretical Model
   4.2.1 Part One – Historical Orientations
   4.2.2 Part Two – Interpretative Orientations
   4.2.3 Part Three – Meaning Orientations
   4.2.4 Part Four – Public Orientations
   4.2.5 Part Five – Future Orientations
4.3 The Quatrefoil Model and the Motifs of Suffering
4.4 Advantages and Disadvantages of My Theoretical Model
4.5 Conclusion

PART TWO
ORIENTATIONS: EXAMINATION AND DISCUSSION

Chapter Five
Historical Orientations: Certainty

5.1 Introduction
   5.1.1 Background: View of the World
5.2 Singularity and Plurality
5.3 Evidence and Certainty
5.4 Elite and Laity
5.5 Conclusion

Chapter Six
Interpretative Orientations: Resistance

6.1 Introduction
6.2 The Problem
6.3 Defining the Problem
6.4 Solving the Problem
6.5 ‘Inconvenient Voices’
6.6 Conclusion
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9.4.3 Respect</td>
<td>272</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.4.4 Appraisal</td>
<td>275</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.5 Conclusion</td>
<td>286</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter Ten – Conclusion</td>
<td>289</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Paradox of Depression: Demon and Dæmon</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.1 Introduction</td>
<td>289</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2 Stories of Depression</td>
<td>290</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3 Paradox</td>
<td>296</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.4 Conclusion</td>
<td>298</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REFERENCES</td>
<td>301</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDIX A – Quatrefoil</td>
<td>354</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDIX B – Abbreviations</td>
<td>356</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>