TRUST AND THE CAPTURING OF SCHOOL-BASED POTENTIAL

Pamela Winsome Bishop, M.Ed.

Submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

University of Tasmania
April 1998
DECLARATION

I certify that this Thesis contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any institute, college or university, and that, to the best of my knowledge and belief, it contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference is made in the text of the Thesis.

Pamela W. Bishop
ABSTRACT

TRUST AND THE CAPTURING OF SCHOOL-BASED POTENTIAL

by Pamela Winsome Bishop

The importance of collegial trust to organisations has long been recognised. In school settings the achievement of trust between principals and teachers can be a vital ingredient in the development of school culture and effectiveness. Yet the nature and rapidity of changes being required of schools, plus the context in which principals and teachers are expected to implement initiatives, may test collegial trust. Despite the challenges which many principals face in the course of their work, some are more trusted by teachers than others.

This study investigated what four principals did or did not do to engender and maintain trust with teachers. As well, the study considered how externally-driven initiatives, which principals were required to implement with teachers, affected mutual trust. An examination of how trustworthy leadership contributed to school culture was also made.

An interpretive multiple-site case study framed the investigation. The researcher spent approximately ten weeks in four inner urban Melbourne secondary schools. During this time, each school’s principal was shadowed for four days and interviewed extensively. The balance of the fieldwork consisted of observation, document analysis, and interviews with 112 teachers.

A combination of principals’ personal and professional characteristics plus
work practices engendered and maintained trust with teachers. Trusting teachers, being knowledgeable, hardworking, caring, confidential, and having integrity were commonly favoured characteristics that attracted teacher trust. Work practices which engendered trust were non-exploitative, de-emphasised principals' power differentials with teachers, and encouraged controversy and critical dialogue. Teachers' perceptions of trust in their principals were evident along four dimensions: absolute, domain-specific, relational, and comparative.

The extent to which teachers thought their key interests were being advanced or diminished was often the standard which teachers used to determine trust in their principals. That standard came into play especially when principals implemented non-negotiable initiatives with teachers. When teachers consistently perceived trustworthy leadership from the principal which was congruent with the school’s culture, mutual trust was enhanced and a strengthening of shared expectations occurred.

Results of this study highlighted principals’ trust-engendering characteristics and practices. The study also found that when teachers were unable to discern the need for an externally-imposed key initiative, they often questioned the educational competency of those associated with its development. Such questioning frequently extended to principals who were actively involved in the initiative's implementation even though the rhetoric of much current educational change emphasises devolution and school-based management, and teacher participation in decision making. These findings have implications for the ongoing trust between principals and teachers and the capturing of school-based potential.
To Bill,

for believing in possibility, sovereignty,

and leading by example,

with thanks.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The goodwill and efforts of many individuals contributed to this project. A debt of thanks is owed to participating teachers from Kandos, Ruthven, Sarina East, and Sarina North Secondary Colleges (all pseudonyms). They generously gave of their time and views. Particular appreciation is extended to the four principals from those schools who, in keeping with the spirit of organisational learning, allowed their leadership practices to be scrutinised. Their willingness to entertain open questioning, criticism, and feedback about their work was impressive. The personal and professional courage involved in their gesture of openness was noted by many of their school-based colleagues as well as the researcher.

Special gratitude is extended to my Supervisor, Professor Bill Mulford. His caring manner, expert guidance, and integrity provided an enduring source of inspiration. It was both a pleasure and privilege to work with him. Special thanks also go to Dr. Neville Grady for the insightful and supportive reviews of my work. The thesis was strengthened as a result of his endeavours. In addition, thanks are offered to Sara Brain, Maureen Colarossi, Rev. Tim Costello, Chris Scott, Cathi Walker, and Jan Wood, all of whom are exemplary professionals in their respective fields. Finally, I remain grateful to my close friends for their support and companionship.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

*Abstract*  
*Acknowledgements*  

## CHAPTER I  INTRODUCTION  
1

Problem Statement  
Background  
Purpose  
Significance  
Research Questions  
Assumptions  
Limitations  
Definition of Terms  
Scope  
Summary  
Chapter Outline  

## CHAPTER II  REVIEW OF LITERATURE  
15

Introduction  
Perspectives on Trust  
  Traditional Disciplinary Perspectives  
  Management Perspective  
  Psychological Perspective  
  Sociological Perspective  
  Summary of Traditional Disciplinary Perspectives  
Integrative Perspective: Moving Beyond Traditional Disciplines  
  Trust Within the Western World  
  Trust Within Social Capital  
  Social Capital in Italy  
  Social Capital in the United States  
  Social Capital in Australia  
  Summary of Integrative Perspective  
Trust Within Schools  
  Shared Governance Requires Trust
CHAPTER III  METHODS AND PROCEDURES

The Study's Questions  109
Participants  111
Researcher as Instrument  113
  Instrument Flexibility  113
  Site-based Instrument Responsiveness  114
  Instrument 'Depth' and Sensitivity  115
  Validity Through Triangulation  116
Procedures  118
  Authorisations and Briefings  118
  Gaining Entry  119
  Comprehensive Briefings for Organisational Learning and Participant Control  120
  Orientation: Toward Understanding  121
  Processes Involved in Observations, Interviews, and Document Analysis  122
  Emphasising Principals' Member-checking and Control  123
  On-going Content Sensitivity  123
  Emphasising Teachers' Options and Control  125
  Teachers' Member-checking Sessions  128
  Place and Content of Interviews  129
    Principals' Interview Schedule  132
    Teachers' Interview Schedule  136
Data Analysis  138
Summary  144

CHAPTER IV  RESULTS

Cohort Depiction: A Caution  146
Career and Contextual Markers for a Typical Teacher Participant  147
Cross-site Teachers' Networks: Features and Trends
Case Study 1: Kandos
The Setting
Demographic Data
Key Themes of Teachers' Perceptions
At Kandos: Where Courage and Credibility Count
Vivid Memories of Recent Pasts
Picking Up (Some of) the Pieces ... Post Reorganisation
Can the Jigsaw be Reassembled?
The Business of Time
Maintaining Sovereignty
Kandos Into the Future: A New Picture?

Case Study 2: Sarina North
The Setting
Demographic Data
Key Themes of Teachers' Perceptions
Altered Principals, Fixed Principles
Boundary Spanning Tests the Bounds of Tolerance
Schools as Buffer Zones
The Shadow of Veto

Case Study 3: Sarina East
The Setting
Demographic Data
Key Themes of Teachers' Perceptions
Working for the Whole Organisation
Maintaining a Paradox: Inclusion
Taking Teachers' Troubles Seriously
Facing Reorganisation: Teachers for Kids

Case Study 4: Ruthven
The Setting
Demographic Data
Key Themes of Teachers' Perceptions
An Appointment to 'Teach Old Dogs New Tricks'
Kids First ... Maybe
Teachers' New Work Environments
Just Another Day in Paradise
CHAPTER V  DATA ANALYSIS

Kandos Secondary College  Question 1  294
Question 2  298
Question 3  300

Sarina North Secondary College  Question 1  303
Question 2  305
Question 3  308

Sarina East Secondary College  Question 1  311
Question 2  312
Question 3  315

Ruthven Secondary College  Question 1  318
Question 2  320
Question 3  322

Cross-Site Analysis  Question 1  325
Question 2  325
Question 3  329

Summary of Principal Findings  Question 1  336
Question 2  340
Question 3  341

Comparison with Findings in Related Studies  343
Reflections on Methodology  357
Summary  359

CHAPTER VI  SUMMARY, CONCLUSIONS, AND IMPLICATIONS

Summary of Methods and Procedures  360
Summary of Findings  365
Conclusions  369
Implications of the Study  373
Recommendations for Further Study  376

APPENDICES  378