Illuminating Musical Lifeworlds:
Phenomenological narratives of the musical lifeworlds of five senior secondary school students

By

David Cleaver B. Mus. Ed. (Hons)

Submitted in fulfillment of the requirements for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy

University of Tasmania

September, 2004
This thesis contains no material which has been accepted for a degree or diploma by the University or any other institution, except by way of background information and duly acknowledged in the thesis, and to the best of my knowledge and belief no material previously published or written by another person except where due acknowledgement is made in the text of the thesis.

Signed: 

[Signature]
This thesis may be made available for loan and limited copying in accordance with the Copyright Act 1968.

Signed: [Signature]

Date: 23/11/04
Abstract

This study investigates the musical lifeworlds of five musically dedicated senior secondary high school students in order to explicate meaning structures within their 'musical ways of being'. These structures illuminate the participants' musical lives as they are 'lived' and each idiosyncratic and unique relationship with music.

While the study illuminates broad features of the way 'musical lives are lived' it also highlights two specific lifeworld realms. The first is the realm of lived musical experiences that are described as deeply felt, formative, transformative or epiphanic. Interpretation of these experiences provides insight into the ways that the participants had commenced musical lives. The second is the realm of lived experience with different types of music learning processes. Illuminating music teaching and learning processes from the perspective of each student is designed to contribute to the ongoing dialogue and discussion of music's place in formal institutional settings and informal, student initiated communities of practice.

Data were generated from interviews with the participants, their parents and music teachers, and also from observations of musical performances, researcher field notes and reflexive journal entries. A 're-storying' process was then conducted using narrative analyses and syntheses and phenomenological interpretation. The re-storied research texts were then structured and presented as composite 'portraits' of each participant.

The project promotes narrative and phenomenological 'ways of thinking' about music, music experience and processes of inquiry. I have explored a pragmatic, embodied and situated experience of narrative and phenomenological 'ways of thinking' rather than operating from a priori principles and abstract theories about them. This pragmatic engagement is made visible by the insertion of vignettes, at strategic points, of my situated, lived experiences and learning processes with being a narrative and phenomenological thinker.

The findings suggest that by illuminating the essential meanings within individual musical lifeworlds, music may be perceived not as a thing, but an active process and a socially mediated, integrated structure of self. Sensitivity to and empathy with the ways students live musical lives may assist educators to achieve
situational appropriateness whilst teaching. Understanding the ways that life and music are inseparable will help to counter the alienating tendency in Western music education to view music as an autonomous aesthetic object that is independent of the experiencer. The findings suggest that music educators engage in 'pedagogical self-transformation' by adopting a narrative and phenomenological stance. This transformation, I argue, promotes empathy where educators are primarily engaged as 'enhancers of musical identity' and 'interpreters of the musical texts of life'. 
Acknowledgements

I would like to thank my supervisor Associate Professor Margaret Barrett for her invaluable guidance and support throughout this project. I appreciate how Margaret would challenge me with criticism and feedback while artfully encouraging my ideas and inspiring me toward new ones. I am fortunate that with such a broad range of knowledge, experience and professionalism, Margaret was available to provide such astute advice within the wide fields of music and qualitative research.

I would like to thank my family, colleagues and friends – all who provided me with much encouragement, care and assistance. Importantly I would like to thank my mother Marie Cleaver whose indomitable spirit in difficult times has been such an inspiration.

I am indebted to the musicians who took part in the project. Despite having incredibly busy schedules, they gave up valuable time to tell their ‘stories of musical lives’. Their commitment to this research has been a reflection of their dedication and love for music.

Finally, I would like to express my deep gratitude and love for my wife Eilish, who has endured my time as a full-time researcher with such patience and constant support.

In memory of
Sidney ‘Vic’ Cleaver
1913 – 2000

From childhood I listened
To the stories you told of your life.
But now, taking less for granted
I feel connected to your experiences
And the wonderful adventure
That formed a remarkable life
# Table of Contents

**Prologue**
- The Tasmanian school system  

**Chapter One - The Research Background**
- Music teaching and learning – Encountering ‘Issues’  
- Exploring the issues – finding a way in  
- The need to focus on the experience of individuals  
- Planning decisions – An introduction to the narrative and phenomenological approach  
- The Aims and Objectives of the Study  
- The Research Questions  
- Researcher positioning, autobiography, and the ‘reflexive narrative text’  
- A further motive for the Study  
- Summary  

**Chapter Two – Narrative Inquiry and Phenomenology**
- Introduction  
- ‘Two Ways of Construing Reality’  
  - The narrative and paradigmatic modes  
  - A narrative ‘way of knowing’ about narrative  
  - A narrative ‘telling’ of narrative thinking  
  - Narrative and “arts-based research” - a foil for the paradigmatic mandate  
- Phenomenology, Theory, Assumptions and Attitude  
  - The roots of Phenomenology  
  - Phenomenology and the science ‘meta-narrative’  
  - Phenomenological ‘essence’ and ‘bracketing’  
  - Interpretivism and Phenomenology  
- Summary and reflection
Chapter Three – Unmasking Dimensions of Musical Experience

The Foundations and Influence of Objectivism
The 'Objectification of Music'
The de-personalisation of music
Reactions to musical objectivism
Paradigmatic and narrative approaches to music, teaching and learning
The story of Lenny
Narrative and 'lived musical experience'
The bodily experience of the two modes in music practice

Chapter Four – Epistemological and Ontological Foundations

Constructivism
Pragmatism
Postmodern research – 'representation and the truth'
'Validating' the Research
‘Validation’ – through the discourse of the community
Authenticity, Believability and Trustworthiness
The usefulness of the research
A philosophical 'leap'
A new dimension – a rearranged vantage point
Representation in the narrative portraits
Summary and reflection

Chapter Five – Methodology, Methods and Procedures

Introduction
The ‘case study’ framework
Narrative Methodology
Phenomenological Methodology
The contexts of lived music-space and lived music-time
The context of lived music body and lived music-social-relations
An Outline of Procedures, Techniques and Processes
The participant recruitment procedure
Collecting stories and “lived experience material”
Semi-structured interviewing
The Three Interview Series
Interview One: Focussed Life History
Interview Two: The Details of Experience
Interview Three: Reflection on the Meaning
Interviews with parents and music teachers
Participant observation and music performance sessions
Re-storying – turning data into narrative portraits
The First Interpretive Task
The Second Interpretive Task
The Third Interpretive Task
Phenomenological methods
Two types of narrative interpretation
Constructing sections of the portraits using narrative synthesis
Constructing sections of the portraits using paradigmatic synthesis
The types of interpretation in the restorying process
Linking phenomenology and narrative in the textual structure
A progression – from paradigmatic to narrative reasoning
‘Writing’ as a mode of inquiry
Summary and reflection

Chapter Six – The Narrative Portraits

Polly Jameson
Prelude – Polly’s Musical Beginnings
Musical values
Attitudes to different styles
Contexts and communities of practice and learning
Music as a mood enhancer
Music – “an addiction of emotion”
Figures and Tables

Figure 1 8

Table 1 111

Figure 2 133

Figure 3 134