A comparison of nonsuicidal self-injury in individuals with and without Borderline Personality Disorder

Erin Bowe
B.A (Hons) Assoc. MAPS

A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (Clinical Psychology)

University of Tasmania
July, 2012
I certify that this thesis contains no material which has been accepted for a degree or diploma by the University of Tasmania or any other institution, except by way of background information where acknowledgement has been made in the text of the thesis, and that to the best of my knowledge and belief this thesis contains no material previously published or written by another person except where due acknowledgement has been made in the text of the thesis.

This thesis may be made available for loan and limited copying in accordance with the Copyright Act 1968.

Erin Bowe.

6th of July, 2012
Abstract

The aim of the investigation was to examine differences in the motivational, psychophysiological, psychological and cognitive responses to nonsuicidal self-injury (NSSI) and other impulsive behaviours of individuals with and without Borderline Personality Disorder (BPD). Also, it was anticipated that results of this investigation could identify whether or not individuals with BPD engage in other impulsive, self-destructive behaviours for the same reasons that they engage in NSSI. Essentially, this part of the research was comprised of an examination of criterion 4 and 5 of the Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders (DSM-IV-TR; APA, 2000) diagnostic criteria for BPD. To examine processes at the time of NSSI and impulsive behaviours, a personalised, staged guided imagery methodology was used to test the affect regulation theory of NSSI.

It was expected that both individuals with and without BPD would demonstrate a reduction in negative emotional states with the act of NSSI. However, it was expected that individuals with BPD would report an increase in high arousal positive emotional states, such as excitement, with the act of NSSI whereas individuals without BPD would report an increase in low arousal positive emotional states. This affect regulation function, either positive or negative, also was predicted to distinguish NSSI from control events of an accidental injury and an emotionally neutral event. Interestingly, results indicated that when considering subjective (self-report) data alone, individuals with BPD and individuals without BPD (NBPD) appeared almost indistinguishable in their responses to NSSI. However, when examining objective (psychophysiological) responses, the two groups demonstrated completely different reactions to NSSI. Individuals without BPD demonstrated a
pattern of tension reduction which was consistent with their self-reported reduction in anxiety and tension during the act of NSSI. The BPD group, in contrast, demonstrated the opposite effect, whereby there was an increase in arousal, perhaps suggesting excitement in response to NSSI. Despite this, the BPD group still reported that they felt calm and relaxed as a result of self-injury. This has important considerations for the affective instability of individuals with BPD, particularly in relation to alexithymia.

Secondly, a comparison was made between NSSI and other diagnostically relevant, impulsive behaviours. It was expected that engaging in impulsive behaviours would elicit an excitement response for those with BPD, and a tension reducing function for those individuals without BPD. It also was expected that the response to the impulsive behaviours would mirror the arousal increase, excitement response to NSSI in the BPD group and would mirror the arousal decrease, calm response to NSSI in the NBPD group. Similarly, it was thought that the reasons for engaging in the impulsive behaviours will relate to sensation seeking for the BPD group but a sense of calm for the NBPD group.

Results indicated that there were few differences between the groups in terms of motivational factors associated with impulsive behaviours and, furthermore, psychophysiological responses to these impulsive behaviours did not mirror those demonstrated for NSSI. Results were discussed in terms of support for the fact that NSSI is a unique behaviour, and should not necessarily be included in the DSM-IV-TR (APA, 2000) with other Impulse Control Disorders.

Finally, the motivational and cognitive responses to NSSI for those with and
without BPD were considered. In particular, consideration was given to internal and external motivations to determine if the presence of BPD has an impact on the reasons why people choose to self-injure. It is evident that people with BPD have additional difficulties with interpersonal communication that are not experienced as intensely by people without BPD (Lieb, Zanarini, Schmahl, Linehan, & Bohus, 2004). It was thought that these difficulties should influence their motivation for engaging in behaviours that serve to regulate affect because the disturbance in affect may be caused by interpersonal difficulties.

Results for Study 3 indicated that both of the groups endorsed internal motivations for NSSI, but the BPD group endorsed a number of additional external motivations for NSSI indicating that NSSI may be used as a maladaptive tool for communicating distress. In addition, results indicated that individuals with BPD have a range of additional difficulties with anger, irrational beliefs and perceived low ability to control their emotions which likely contribute to NSSI. Interestingly, the BPD group also endorsed the cognition *I like to hurt myself* during NSSI, which further supports the notion that the behaviour may be associated with sensation seeking in this group.

It was concluded that the role of affect regulation in NSSI needs to consider the role of both positive and negative emotions, as well as increase and decrease in arousal, rather than assume that the affect regulatory function of NSSI is always a decrease in negative emotions. This is likely to have important implications for the consideration of BPD in future research as well as treatment options.
Acknowledgements

I wish to thank my supervisor Dr Janet Haines, whose unwavering confidence and trust in my abilities allowed me to develop both personally and professionally. Being able to reconfirm your findings of a tension reduction response to NSSI with a non-Borderline group was a satisfying experience. However, finding the opposite effect for a Borderline group was even more satisfying, and it is an experience that I have truly enjoyed.

Nothing is more curious than the almost savage hostility that humour excites in those who lack it (George Saintsbury, 1845-1933). Humour and common sense are two qualities that sometimes appear to be lacking in the field of clinical psychology. Luckily for me, I have a mentor who has made sure that there were no gaps in my clinical training.

Thanks must also go to Professor Douglas Paton for acting as co-supervisor, and to Dr Chris Williams who has continued to provide valuable assistance in an unofficial capacity along the way.

I am forever grateful to my family who supported me throughout this process, and offered words of encouragement along the way. For my parents, Gerry and Annie Deveney, who were raised in poverty in their home country, the fact that I was the first person in our family to even set foot inside a university has meant a lot to them. For me to obtain a PhD means the world.

Special thanks also go to James, who is kind, understanding, selfless to the point of annoying, helpful, and above all, patient. I will never forget that you put
your own opportunities on hold, so that I could pursue my dreams.

No one appreciates the very special genius of your conversation as a dog does (Christopher Morley, 1890-1957). I would like to thank Bella for always listening.

To the many other members of staff and friends at the University of Tasmania, I thank you for your support, enthusiasm, and assistance. I would particularly like to thank Kate Elliott, with whom I have shared all the highs and lows of my PhD, and hers, over many, many cups of tea.

Finally, thanks must go to the participants who made this project possible. They shared with me some of the most private and complex experiences of their lives, in return for what will hopefully be an improved understanding of the treatment needs for people who engage in NSSI.
# Table of Contents

Abstract ........................................................................................................................................ iii

Acknowledgements .................................................................................................................. vi

Table of Contents ................................................................................................................... viii

List of Tables ......................................................................................................................... xix

List of Figures ......................................................................................................................... xxii

List of Appendices ................................................................................................................ xxiv

CHAPTER 1 Introduction and overview ..................................................................................... 1

  Definition of the problem ....................................................................................................... 2

  Overview of the investigation ............................................................................................... 15

CHAPTER 2 Classification of self-injury .................................................................................... 21

  Nomenclature in the self-injury research literature ............................................................... 22

    Wrist-cutting syndrome .................................................................................................... 24

    Deliberate self-harm syndrome ....................................................................................... 25

  Factors that distinguish NSSI from parasuicide and attempted suicide ......................... 26

    Intent ............................................................................................................................... 30

    Lethality .......................................................................................................................... 32

    Behavioural repetition ................................................................................................... 34

    Method of injury ............................................................................................................. 35

    Summary ......................................................................................................................... 35

  Direct and indirect risk-taking behaviours .......................................................................... 36

  Stereotypic, major, compulsive and impulsive self-injury ................................................ 38

  Types of self-injurious behaviours ...................................................................................... 41
Chronic feelings of emptiness ................................................................. 89
Inappropriate, intense anger ................................................................. 91
Transient, stress-related paranoid ideation or severe dissociative symptoms 92
Course of BPD and severity of symptoms over time ................................. 96
Summary ................................................................................................. 98

CHAPTER 4 Affect regulation theory and its relationship to self-injury and BPD 104
The role of emotion .................................................................................. 105
Delineating emotion from affect and mood .............................................. 106
Categories of emotional experience ....................................................... 107
Clarity ......................................................................................................... 107
Attention .................................................................................................. 108
Intensity ..................................................................................................... 108
Affect regulation theory .......................................................................... 109
Emotional dysregulation ......................................................................... 110
Dysregulation versus absence of regulation .......................................... 111
Affect regulation, self-injury, and impulsive behaviours .......................... 112
BPD and self-injury .................................................................................. 116
The role of hyperarousal ......................................................................... 118
Summary .................................................................................................. 120

CHAPTER 5 Study 1: Psychological and psychophysiological responses to
nonsuicidal self-injury ............................................................................ 123
INTRODUCTION ..................................................................................... 124
The psychophysiology of NSSI .............................................................. 125
The tension reduction response ................................................................. 127
Psychophysiological studies using individuals with BPD ....................... 128
Process of guided imagery ....................................................................... 131
Tension reduction in individuals with and without BPD ......................... 132
Summary .................................................................................................... 134
Aims and hypotheses .................................................................................. 135

METHOD ..................................................................................................... 136
Participants ................................................................................................. 136
Materials ...................................................................................................... 139
Demographic information and sample characteristics ............................. 139
Psychological tests .................................................................................... 140
Assessment of BPD .................................................................................. 140
Suicidal intent ............................................................................................ 141
Imagery Scripts ......................................................................................... 143
Visual Analogue Scales (VAS) ................................................................. 144
Apparatus and psychophysiological recording ....................................... 145
Procedure .................................................................................................. 146
Session one: Interview ............................................................................. 146
Session 2: Psychophysiological recording and psychological responses ... 148
Transformation and scoring of psychophysiological data ....................... 149

RESULTS ..................................................................................................... 149
Description of sample ............................................................................... 149
Suicidal intent ............................................................................................ 152
Responses to imagery ............................................................................... 153
Psychophysiological data ................................................................. 153
Psychological responses ................................................................. 156

DISCUSSION ......................................................................................... 170
Psychophysiological responses ......................................................... 170
Psychological responses ................................................................. 179
Summary and conclusions ................................................................. 187

CHAPTER 6 Impulsivity and impulsive behaviours ..................................... 189
Impulsivity ......................................................................................... 190
Affect regulation and impulsivity ....................................................... 193
Impulsivity and BPD ................................................................. 198
An examination of DSM-IV-TR (APA, 2000) criterion 4 (impulsivity) and 5
(self-injury and suicidal behaviour) .................................................. 203
Self-injury ......................................................................................... 205
Gambling ......................................................................................... 207
Excessive spending .......................................................................... 209
Binge eating ..................................................................................... 212
Risky sexual activity ......................................................................... 214
Substance use ................................................................................. 220
Reckless driving .............................................................................. 223
Stealing/shoplifting .......................................................................... 225
Impulsive damage to property .......................................................... 227
Summary ......................................................................................... 229

CHAPTER 7 STUDY 2: A comparison of self-injury with other impulsive
behaviours .......................................................................................................................... 232

INTRODUCTION ............................................................................................................ 233

Summary .......................................................................................................................... 242

Aims and hypotheses ....................................................................................................... 243

METHOD ....................................................................................................................... 245

Participants .................................................................................................................... 245

Apparatus and Materials ............................................................................................. 245

Psychological tests ......................................................................................................... 245

Procedure ....................................................................................................................... 248

RESULTS .................................................................................................................... 248

Overview ....................................................................................................................... 248

Description of sample ................................................................................................ 249

Suicidal intent ................................................................................................................ 252

Impulsive behaviours .................................................................................................... 252

Range of impulsive behaviours and differences between BPD and NBPD groups ....... 252

Motivations for impulsive behaviours ........................................................................... 257

Responses to impulsive behaviours ............................................................................. 261

Examination of the processes underlying impulsive behaviours ............................. 274

Psychophysiological data .......................................................................................... 275

Psychological data ....................................................................................................... 276

DISCUSSION ................................................................................................................ 284

Group differences in frequency and type of impulsive behaviours ............................ 284

Psychophysiological responses to impulsive behaviours ........................................ 287
Psychological responses to impulsive behaviours ........................................... 290
Motivations for engaging in impulsive behaviours ........................................ 297
Responses to impulsive behaviours: Group differences ............................ 301
Responses to impulsive behaviours: Combined scores for both groups ...... 303
Responses to NSSI compared to each impulsive behaviour ....................... 312
General summary and conclusions ............................................................... 319

CHAPTER 8 Motivational, symptomatological and cognitive factors associated with NSSI in individuals with and without BPD ............................................................. 324

Motivations for NSSI .................................................................................. 325
  Internal motivations ................................................................................ 327
  External motivations ............................................................................. 329
Sex differences in motivations for NSSI ....................................................... 333

NSSI and associated Axis-I symptomatology in individuals without BPD .... 334
  Anxiety .................................................................................................. 335
  Posttraumatic Stress Disorder .............................................................. 336
  Panic Disorder with or without Agoraphobia ........................................ 337
  Obsessive-Compulsive Disorder .......................................................... 337
  Mood Disorders .................................................................................. 339
  Depression .......................................................................................... 339
  Bipolar Disorder ................................................................................ 341
  Substance use ...................................................................................... 342
  Eating Disorders ................................................................................ 344
  Dissociation ......................................................................................... 346
The impact of BPD and comorbidity on motivations for NSSI ............... 349

BPD and comorbid Axis I disorders .................................................. 353

Anxiety and anxiety-related disorders ........................................... 353

Obsessive-Compulsive Disorder .................................................... 355

Posttraumatic Stress Disorder ....................................................... 356

Panic Disorder .............................................................................. 358

Mood Disorders ........................................................................... 360

Major Depression ........................................................................ 360

Bipolar Disorder .......................................................................... 361

Substance use ............................................................................. 363

Eating Disorders .......................................................................... 365

Other Axis I symptomatology ...................................................... 367

Other Axis-II symptomatology .................................................... 369

Cluster B ....................................................................................... 370

Antisocial Personality disorder .................................................... 370

Narcissistic personality disorder ................................................. 371

Histrionic personality disorder .................................................. 372

Summary ..................................................................................... 373

Other symptomatology in individuals who engage in NSSI .......... 374

Anger .......................................................................................... 376

BPD and anger .......................................................................... 377

Impulsiveness, venturesomeness and empathy ................................ 379

Cognitive factors and beliefs ...................................................... 379

Irrational beliefs and NSSI ......................................................... 383
Cognitive factors in BPD ................................................................. 385
Perceived stress ................................................................. 387
BPD and perceived stress ......................................................... 389
Perceived control ................................................................. 390
Perceived control of one’s internal state .................................. 392
Summary ............................................................................................... 394

CHAPTER 9 STUDY 3: Motivational and cognitive factors associated with NSSI in individuals with and without BPD ........................................ 397

INTRODUCTION ............................................................................................... 398
Motivations for NSSI ................................................................................. 398
Cognitions and psychopathology contributing to NSSI .................... 402
Summary ................................................................................................. 406
Aims and hypotheses ............................................................................. 407

METHOD ............................................................................................................. 408
Participants ............................................................................................... 408
Apparatus and Materials ................................................................. 408
Psychological tests ................................................................................. 409
Motivation for NSSI .............................................................................. 409
Irrational beliefs ..................................................................................... 410
Perceived control of emotions .......................................................... 410
General Symptomatology and Screening for Axis I and II disorders .... 411
Perceived stress ..................................................................................... 411
Anger ........................................................................................................ 412