A comparative analysis of the medico-legal and ethical issues associated with embryonic stem cell research in Australia and Malaysia

By

Chee Kuen Foong (Patrick) LLB (Hons), LLM

Submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy

University of Tasmania
Faculty of Law

July 2012
ABSTRACT

This thesis evaluates the regulatory framework governing human embryonic stem cell (HESC) research in Malaysia and recommends the adoption of a more effective regulatory model, which is designed to regulate and promote ethical HESC research. The research, which involves the use of donated excess in vitro fertilisation (IVF) embryos and embryos created through the cloning technology, somatic cell nuclear transfer, aims at a better understanding of diseases and could lead to improved medical treatments including cell based therapies, genetically matched to the patient.

This research is controversial as extractions of embryonic stem cells involve the destruction of human embryos, which raises ethical issues. For HESC research to proceed, it is important that an effective regulatory framework that promotes ethical conduct, allays public concerns and ensures transparency and accountability is established. This research argues that the existing regulatory framework in Malaysia needs revision taking into account that scientists generally prefer less regulation to enjoy the scientific freedom to conduct research.

The thesis investigates challenges that exist in the regulation of new technologies with focus on unique challenges for Malaysian regulators. It considers the difficulties in regulating an emerging technology in a multi-religious society with different religions adopting differing perspectives on the research. As a comparison, the thesis evaluates Australia’s regulatory framework which has been operating since the early regulation of assisted reproductive technique (ART) in the 1980s when world’s first ART legislation was enacted in the Australian state of Victoria in 1984. The thesis evaluates the applicability of the Australian model in the context of a different social environment and concludes with the recommendation of the adoption of an effective regulatory framework. The proposed model is designed to regulate and facilitate ethical HESC research in Malaysia that addresses the regulatory challenges and has features of transparency and accountability.
PREFACE

This thesis is on an evolving and dynamic area with a number of scientific developments as well as legal developments occurring around the world. It takes into consideration the latest scientific and legal developments up to 31 December 2011.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT

PREFACE

TABLE OF CONTENTS

STATEMENT OF ORIGINALITY AND AUTHORITY OF ACCESS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

**PART 1: BACKGROUND TO THE REGULATION OF HUMAN EMBRYONIC STEM CELL, THE SCIENCE AND THE THEORY OF REGULATION**

**CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION**

1.1 BACKGROUND TO THE REGULATION OF HUMAN EMBRYONIC STEM CELL RESEARCH IN MALAYSIA

1.2 THE CONTROVERSIES OF HESC RESEARCH

1.3 THE MORAL STATUS OF A HUMAN EMBRYO

1.4 ARGUMENTS IN FAVOUR OF AND AGAINST HESC RESEARCH

1.5 THE JUSTIFICATIONS FOR THE POSITION THIS THESIS TAKES ON HESC RESEARCH

1.6 TO REGULATE HESC RESEARCH OR NOT?

1.7 RESEARCH QUESTIONS AND AN OVERVIEW OF THESIS

1.8 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

**CHAPTER 2: WHY IS IT NECESSARY TO USE HUMAN EMBRYOS FOR STEM CELL RESEARCH?: THE SCIENCE**

2.1 INTRODUCTION

2.2 WHAT ARE STEM CELLS?
| 2.3 THE DISCOVERY OF STEM CELLS       | 31 |
| 2.4 CELL CULTURE, CELL LINES AND DIFFERENTIATION | 32 |
| 2.5 TYPES OF STEM CELLS              | 33 |
| 2.6 THE BIOLOGICAL DEFINITION OF A HUMAN EMBRYO | 43 |
| 2.7 ALTERNATIVE SOURCES OF HUMAN PLURIPOTENT STEM CELLS | 49 |
| 2.8 THE CREATION OF CYTOPLASMIC HYBRIDS/ CYBRIDS | 62 |
| 2.9 STEM CELL CLINICAL APPLICATION AND THERAPY | 65 |
| 2.10 CONCLUSION                      | 66 |

**CHAPTER 3: THE THEORY OF REGULATION**

| 3.1 INTRODUCTION                      | 69 |
| 3.2 REGULATORY CHALLENGES            | 70 |
| 3.3 RESPONSIVE REGULATORY THEORY     | 92 |
| 3.4 CONCLUSION                       | 101 |

**PART 2: THE REGULATORY REGIME FOR USE OF HUMAN EMBRYOS IN RESEARCH IN AUSTRALIA**

**CHAPTER 4: ACHIEVING REGULATORY LEGITIMACY: THE EVOLVING RESPONSIVE REGULATORY REGIME**

| 4.1 INTRODUCTION                      | 105 |
| 4.2 FROM EARLY DAYS TO PRESENT       | 106 |
| 4.3 THE REGULATION OF ASSISTED REPRODUCTIVE TECHNOLOGY | 107 |
| 4.4 THE SCIENTIFIC, ETHICAL AND REGULATORY CONSIDERATIONS RELEVANT TO CLONING OF HUMAN BEINGS | 109 |
| 4.5 HUMAN CLONING: SCIENTIFIC, ETHICAL AND REGULATORY ASPECTS OF HUMAN CLONING AND STEM CELL RESEARCH REPORT | 112 |
PART 3: THE REGULATORY REGIME FOR USE OF HUMAN EMBRYOS IN RESEARCH IN MALAYSIA

CHAPTER 7: THE CHALLENGE OF REGULATORY LEGITIMACY

7.1 INTRODUCTION 206
7.2 THE ISLAMIC PERSPECTIVE 207
7.3 THE ROMAN CATHOLIC PERSPECTIVE 216
7.4 THE BUDDHIST PERSPECTIVE 221
7.5 THE HINDU PERSPECTIVE 224
7.6 THE SIKH PERSPECTIVE 227
7.7 THE FINDINGS OF THE INTERVIEWS 228
7.8 CONCLUSION 231

CHAPTER 8: CURRENT REGULATION OF THE USE OF HUMAN EMBRYOS: MISSING RUNGS OF BRAITHWAITE’S PYRAMIDS

8.1 INTRODUCTION 233
8.2 AMBITIOUS NATIONAL PLANS 234
8.3 CURRENT RESEARCH BEING CONDUCTED 235
8.4 NATIONAL GUIDELINES ON STEM CELL RESEARCH 237
8.5 ASSESSMENT OF THE GUIDELINES 2009 241
8.6 MOVING TO THE NEXT LEVEL: ADOPTING A REGULATORY FRAMEWORK INCORPORATING LEGISLATION 245
8.7 A UNIQUE FEATURE OF THE MALAYSIAN LEGAL SYSTEM: CONSTITUTIONAL DIVISION BETWEEN SECULAR LAW AND SYARIAH LAW 248
8.8 THE IMPLICATIONS OF EXISTING LAWS IN MALAYSIA: THE PENAL CODE 1936 252
8.9 THE EXPERIENCE IN A COMPARABLE JURISDICTION: SINGAPORE 255
8.10 CONCLUSION 269

CHAPTER 9: CONCLUSION: CRAFTING A RESPONSIVE REGULATORY REGIME FOR USE OF HUMAN EMBRYOS IN RESEARCH IN MALAYSIA 271

BIBLIOGRAPHY 284

APPENDIXES
APPENDIX 1: INTERVIEWEES 300
APPENDIX 2: GLOSSARY 302
APPENDIX 3: TABLE OF CLONING TIMELINE 312
APPENDIX 4: BLASTOCYST 314
APPENDIX 5: TABLE OF THE HISTORY OF REGULATION OF RESEARCH INVOLVING HUMAN EMBRYOS IN AUSTRALIA 315
APPENDIX 6: STATE/TERRITORY LEGISLATION IN AUSTRALIA 317
APPENDIX 7: THE MALAYSIAN GUIDELINES ON STEM CELL RESEARCH 318
APPENDIX 8: FATWA ON THERAPEUTIC CLONING AND STEM CELL RESEARCH 321