Implementing technology and organisational based change at Tasmania Police – A case study.

Leonie Ellis BCom, BComp (Hons)

Submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

University of Tasmania (2009)
This dissertation contains no material which has been accepted for a degree or diploma by the University or any other institution, except by way of background information and duly acknowledged in the Thesis, and to the best of the candidate’s knowledge and belief no material previously published or written by another person except where due acknowledgement is made in the text of the Thesis.

This Thesis may be made available for loan. Copying of any part of this thesis is prohibited for two years from the date this statement was signed; after that time limited copying is permitted in accordance with the Copyright Act 1968.

Leonie Ellis
November 2009
Abstract

This thesis presents a case study into change management strategies utilised by Tasmania Police in the implementation of technology related projects during a ten year period (1998 to 2008). The role and impact of technology in and on approaches to organisational change management has become the focus of increasing debate amongst both academics and practitioners (Markus, 2004). While numerous theories, models and approaches exist that have been developed from organisational experiences, few of them are based on organisational case studies specifically examining the relationships over time between approaches to organisational change management and technology implementations. This research contributes to these debates through analysis of a case study at Tasmania Police. As a hierarchical command-control type organisation with a tradition of top down management this case study also considers the role organisational structure and culture has on approaches to organisational change management and technology implementations.

The case study at Tasmania Police was based on the analysis of four projects that were developed directly as a result of a major business process re-engineering exercise (BATON) initiated in 1997. BATON developed and promoted an over-arching change management strategy and the use of information and communications technology as the major driver for its implementation of organisational change within Tasmania Police. The four projects were selected to specifically investigate the relationships between the implementation of technologies to drive change and the change management strategies utilised. To explore the sustainability of these relationships and overcome the potential limitations of case studies conducted over a single period of time, a two phase approach requiring a second period of research at Tasmania Police was adopted.

The research methodology was underpinned by a subjective ontology and an interpretative epistemology. The strategy adopted a two phase approach requiring data collection and analysis at two time points during the ten year period. The research design uses four technology related projects as a vehicle to study the change management process. During phase one, drawing on tools from ethnography, the researcher became a participant-observer. Data was collected through observations,
informal interviews, activity monitoring and participation in work with the project teams and change management coordinators over a two year period.

Drawing on principles of grounded theory, data analysis of the four projects was conducted iteratively using thematic coding. This analysis led to the generation of six themes identifying eleven factors illustrating the relationships between organisational change management and technology implementations. In particular the analysis highlighted that Tasmania Police relied on informal communication practices and trust networks (as distinct from their hierarchical organisational and governance structures) to achieve change. The analysis also highlighted the capacity for technology to be significant as both an agent and object change that required adaption and flexibility in change management strategies. Interpretation of phase one data suggested that Tasmania Police was an organisation that appeared to fit with conventional models of change management in the literature.

Phase two involved a second period of data collection and analysis aimed specifically at exploring the sustainability of relationships between organisational change management and technology implementations identified in phase one. Phase two data collection coincided with a Tasmania Police three year business planning exercise that incorporated a review of their change management and technology approaches. The research design utilised the outputs from phase one to generate a interview question frame that was used to investigate the current status of organisational change management and technology implementation. The interviews were conducted with members of the business project unit, senior management and change agents. Interview analysis revealed differences in the relationships and approaches adopted by Tasmania Police over time. Phase two analysis also highlighted how new factors had emerged that directly impacted on the organisational approach to technology initiated change.

Interpretation of phase two highlighted how the initial perspectives on Tasmania Police were re-configured and transformed over time. Based on the evidence presented in this case study, the role of technology in and on approaches to organisational change management does require a higher level of sophistication of both project management and change management than had previously been considered necessary within the literature. This thesis contributes to an enhanced understanding of the implementation
phase of technology-based change. This Tasmania Police case study suggests that for hierarchical organisations informal communication networks are critical and flexibly combining elements of change management and project management is required to accommodate technology as both object and potential agent of organisational transformation.
Acknowledgements

This dissertation would not have been possible without the support and guidance of Associate Professor Paul Turner. Paul was able to see, while others could not, the direction this research was headed. I thank him for supervising me when he was already overloaded with PhD candidates, for the time he gave me but most importantly for his incredible supervision. You are truly amazing and I am proud to call you a friend.

Thank you to Dr Elizabeth Cummings who adopted the role of associate supervisor. For this she has my deepest thanks. Liz brought me into the fold of the PhD student for my year of study leave. They have created a supportive environment in which to study for which I thank them.

To my friend and colleague Carmen Lockwood, who read a number of the early and later drafts, thank you for your support.

I must also acknowledge the contributions made by Professor Peter Marshall, Dr Kristy de Salas, Dr Judy Young and Professor Christopher Keen at various times through the course of this research.

I would like to thank Tasmania Police especially Commissioner Jack Johnston and Deputy Commissioner Darren Hine for their continued involvement with the research. Without their support this research would not have been possible.

To my family who have endured this process. To my wonderful and caring husband Tom who stressed about timeframes but supported me without reservation. To my children, Shae and Zachary, who had faith in me and while at times were a pleasant source of distraction also supported me.

My Honours research was dedicated to my father who passed away just before it was completed. This research is dedicated to my mother who gratefully is still with us.
# Table of Contents

1 INTRODUCTION .................................................................................................................. 1

1.1 BACKGROUND .................................................................................................................. 1
  1.1.1 Policing and Law Enforcement ................................................................................. 3
  1.1.2 Change Management Approaches ......................................................................... 4
  1.1.3 Information Technology and Innovation ............................................................. 6

1.2 THE RESEARCH CONTEXT ............................................................................................. 7

1.3 RESEARCH OBJECTIVES ............................................................................................... 9

1.4 RESEARCH QUESTIONS ................................................................................................. 10

1.5 RESEARCH APPROACH ................................................................................................. 10

1.6 RESEARCH CONTRIBUTIONS ........................................................................................ 12

1.7 RESEARCH LIMITATIONS ............................................................................................. 13

1.8 OVERVIEW OF THE THESIS ........................................................................................ 14
  1.8.1 Chapter 2: Australian and Tasmanian Police ......................................................... 14
  1.8.2 Chapter 3: Literature Review ................................................................................ 14
  1.8.3 Chapter 4: Methodology ....................................................................................... 15
  1.8.4 Chapter 5: Data Analysis Phase One ..................................................................... 15
  1.8.5 Chapter 6: Discussion and interpretation Phase One ........................................... 15
  1.8.6 Chapter 7: Data Analysis Phase Two ..................................................................... 16
  1.8.7 Chapter 8: Discussion and interpretation Phase Two ........................................... 16
  1.8.8 Chapter 9: Case Study Findings ............................................................................ 16
  1.8.9 Chapter 10: Conclusion and Future work ............................................................. 16

1.9 CHAPTER REFLECTIONS ................................................................................................. 17

2 AUSTRALIAN AND TASMANIAN POLICE ...................................................................... 18

2.1 INTRODUCTION .............................................................................................................. 18

2.2 POLICE IN AUSTRALIA .................................................................................................. 18
  2.2.1 Duality ................................................................................................................... 20
  2.2.2 Military/Police and drivers for change ................................................................. 21
  2.2.3 Police and IT .......................................................................................................... 22

2.3 POLICE IN TASMANIA .................................................................................................. 24

2.4 DRIVERS FOR CHANGE IN TASMANIA POLICE ..................................................... 26
  2.4.1 Vision and Mission ............................................................................................... 26
  2.4.2 Project BATON ...................................................................................................... 27
  2.4.3 Quick Wins ........................................................................................................... 29
  2.4.4 Change agents ....................................................................................................... 30
  2.4.5 Change agent role ................................................................................................. 33
  2.4.6 Change agent training ......................................................................................... 37
  2.4.7 Change Management Coordinator ...................................................................... 39

2.5 CHAPTER REFLECTIONS ................................................................................................. 41

3 LITERATURE REVIEW – CHANGE, INNOVATION AND TECHNOLOGY ............ 42

3.1 INTRODUCTION .............................................................................................................. 42

3.2 CHANGE MANAGEMENT ............................................................................................... 42
  3.2.1 The beginning of change management ................................................................. 43
  3.2.2 Planned change ..................................................................................................... 43
  3.2.3 The emergent approach ....................................................................................... 48
  3.2.4 Opportunity based change .................................................................................. 49
  3.2.5 Revisiting the past ............................................................................................... 49
  3.2.6 Other models of change ...................................................................................... 50
  3.2.7 Communication of change .................................................................................. 52
  3.2.8 Leadership for change ........................................................................................ 53
  3.2.9 Strategic alignment .............................................................................................. 54
  3.2.10 ICT based change .............................................................................................. 54
  3.2.11 Change Agents .................................................................................................. 56

3.3 BUSINESS PROCESS REENGINEERING ................................................................. 57

3.4 PROJECT MANAGEMENT ............................................................................................. 59
# Table of Figures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1-1</td>
<td>IS strategy an part of business strategy (Source Galliers 1993)</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2-1</td>
<td>Tasmania Police Districts (Tasmania Police 2009)</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2-2</td>
<td>Stakeholders for Tasmania Police (KPMG 1995)</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2-3</td>
<td>Overview of change management framework (KPMG 1997)</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2-4</td>
<td>Researcher’s view of the individual approach</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-1</td>
<td>Leavitt’s Diamond (Leavitt 1964)</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-1</td>
<td>Researcher’s view of projects selected</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-2</td>
<td>Researcher’s data analysis process</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5-1</td>
<td>Schedule and Milestones (KPMG 1995)</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-1</td>
<td>Factors for change - Phase one</td>
<td>183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8-1</td>
<td>The change communication wheel (adapted from Goodman and Truss, 2004)</td>
<td>214</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8-2</td>
<td>Factor for change - Phase two</td>
<td>229</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9-1</td>
<td>Conceptual Map of Change at Tasmania Police</td>
<td>247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12-1</td>
<td>Milestone 1</td>
<td>286</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12-2</td>
<td>Milestone 2</td>
<td>287</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12-3</td>
<td>Milestone 3</td>
<td>288</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12-4</td>
<td>Milestone 5 &amp; 6</td>
<td>288</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12-5</td>
<td>Change Management Framework</td>
<td>289</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table of Tables

Table 2-1: Employment numbers for each Police Force (2008) ......................................................... 20
Table 2-2: Generic differences between the police service and other public sector entities .......................................................... 20
Table 2-3: Change agent distribution 1998, 2001 .................................................................................. 20
Table 2-4 Break up of Change Agents by Role 2009 ........................................................................... 32
Table 2-5 Distribution of Change Agents by Location 2009 ................................................................. 32
Table 2-6 Second Course Training Program ....................................................................................... 38
Table 2-7 Third Course Training Program ......................................................................................... 39
Table 3-1: Summary of Planned Change Models .................................................................................. 46
Table 3-2: Zachman Framework ......................................................................................................... 68
Table 4-1: Interviewees for Phase Two ............................................................................................... 97
Table 4-2: Techniques and outputs of phase one data collection .......................................................... 101
Table 4-3: Categories from Phase One ............................................................................................... 105
Table 5-1: Transcript exemplar February 1998 ................................................................................. 135
Table 5-2: Conceptual labels ............................................................................................................. 138
Table 6-1: Themes and Factors .......................................................................................................... 170
Table 6-2: Change models and factors ............................................................................................... 171
Table 6-3: Inter-relationships with network ........................................................................................ 174
Table 6-4: Inter-relationship with top level support .......................................................................... 176
Table 6-5: An active level of governance ......................................................................................... 177
Table 6-6: Network free to choose ................................................................................................... 179
Table 6-7: Projects and project boundaries ....................................................................................... 180
Table 6-8: Inter-relationship with strategic direction ....................................................................... 181
Table 6-10: Training is essential ........................................................................................................ 181
Table 6-12: Inter-relationships with Face-to-face communication .................................................... 182
Table 7-1: Interview Change Agent K, October 2008 ..................................................................... 187
Table 7-2: Interview with Acting Commissioner of Police, October 2008 ........................................ 187
Table 7-3: Conceptual Labels Example 1 ........................................................................................ 188
Table 7-4: Conceptual Labels example 2 ........................................................................................ 188
Table 8-1: Themes and Factors .......................................................................................................... 217
Table 8-2: Lewin's 3 stage model and phase two factors .................................................................... 218
Table 8-3: Inter-relationships with network ..................................................................................... 220
Table 8-4: Inter-relationships with top level support ....................................................................... 223
Table 8-5: Inter-relationships with active governance ..................................................................... 224
Table 8-6: Inter-relationships with change is clearly articulated ....................................................... 225
Table 8-7: Inter-relationships with personalize the change agent role ............................................. 226
Table 8-8: Inter-relationship with a Culture that accepts Change .................................................... 227
Table 8-9: Inter-relationship with an Overall Strategic Direction ...................................................... 228
Table 9-1: Comparison of factors phase one and two ...................................................................... 233
Table 9-2: Models and factors for implementing technology-based change ..................................... 255