SCENERY TO WILDERNESS


Louise Mendel BSc (Hons)

Submitted in fulfilment of the requirements of the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

School of Geography and Environmental Studies
University of Tasmania

June 1999
Declaration

This thesis contains no material that has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, the thesis contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference is made in the text.

[Signature]

Louise Mendel

Authority of Access

This thesis may be made available for loan and limited copying in accordance with the Copyright Act 1968.

[Signature]

Louise Mendel

9 June 1999
ABSTRACT

National parks comprise a significant component of landscapes around the world. This thesis examines the development of the national park system in Tasmania from 1916 to 1992, with a particular emphasis on changing conservation motives and themes, and their expression in the reserve system.

Part One of this thesis traces the creation of national parks in Tasmania over three major periods of reservation activity: the early period (1916-1937); the middle period (1938-1970); and the late period (1971-1992). Historical evidence is used to identify: the reserve proponents and their motives; opposition to establishing reserves; the debates surrounding the creation of reserves; and the outcomes. A developmental narrative is given on the creation of national parks in each period, with a broader view of identifying the dominant conservation motives and themes and changes to these over time.

Part Two of this thesis examines the representation of three major conservation attributes in national parks established across each period of reserve development. The representation of biological diversity, scenery and wilderness in national parks is quantified for each period. The changing levels of representation of each of these attributes and their relative significance to each other over time are assessed.

The historical and mapping analyses both indicate that there have been shifting emphases in conservation motives and themes over time in the development of Tasmanian national parks. In both the early and middle periods the historical evidence suggests that scenery and general nature conservation were the dominant motives behind the creation of national parks, together with themes of tourism and recreation. In the late period there was a shift in emphasis towards wilderness conservation and more specific nature conservation as the dominant themes. Areas of high aesthetic value had greater proportionate representation in national parks during the early and middle periods than the late period. While national parks were established in wilderness areas during all periods, the representation of wilderness in
the reserve system increased dramatically during the late period. The representation of biological diversity was biased towards high altitude biological elements in the early and middle periods, and expanded to capture greater diversity during the late period.

There is thus a strong relationship between motives and patterns of elements captured in the reserve system. However, this has been tempered by opposition from those with economic interests in the State's natural resources, particularly the mining, forestry and hydro-electric industries.
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

My most heartfelt thanks goes to a wonderful supervisor - the singing Professor, Jamie Kirkpatrick. Thank you Jamie for your constant support, enthusiasm, advice, efficiency and great sense of humour. Thanks also for your confidence in my abilities and providing me with many opportunities over the years.

I am very grateful to the staff of the Archives Office of Tasmania, State Library of Tasmania and Records Office and Library of the Department of Primary Industry, Water and the Environment for all their assistance with my many requests. Thanks also to staff of the Wilderness Society of Tasmania and the Tasmanian Environment Centre for giving me virtually unrestricted access to their files and resource materials.

To all my friends, fellow students and staff of Geography and Environmental Studies, thanks for your support and acceptance of my sometimes odd behaviour, especially during the final stages of writing this thesis. A special thanks to Janet Smith, a wonderful friend and three hand reel partner, who helped me with some of the final production of this thesis. Many thanks also to Les Wood for meticulously reading so many pages and providing valuable criticism.

Finally, I would like to thank my parents for their constant support throughout the many years of my studentship. Thank you for always encouraging me to learn and achieve.
CONTENTS

Abstract........................................................................................................... i
Acknowledgments.......................................................................................... iii
Figures............................................................................................................. viii
Plates............................................................................................................... x
Tables............................................................................................................. xi
Abbreviations................................................................................................. xiii

CHAPTER 1: Introduction............................................................................... 1
National Parks.................................................................................................. 1
Emergence, expansion and roles..................................................................... 1
Motives behind national park creation......................................................... 4
The Tasmanian situation.................................................................................. 6
Thesis Aims and Structure ............................................................................. 7
Endnotes............................................................................................................. 9


CHAPTER 2: Scenes of Unsurpassed Grandeur (The Early Period: 1916-1937) .............................................................. 15
Background...................................................................................................... 15
National Park Proposals.................................................................................. 20
The Freycinet Peninsula................................................................................... 20
Mt Field............................................................................................................ 26
Cradle Mountain............................................................................................. 37
Reserve Extensions.......................................................................................... 48
Discussion....................................................................................................... 51
Endnotes............................................................................................................. 56
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER 5: Biodiversity</th>
<th>213</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Methods</td>
<td>215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Results</td>
<td>221</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The representation of forest communities in reserves</td>
<td>221</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The representation of vegetation types in reserves</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proportional representation of vegetation types in reserves</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discussion</td>
<td>236</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Endnotes</td>
<td>239</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER 6: Scenery</th>
<th>241</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pictorial Content Analysis</td>
<td>243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Methods</td>
<td>243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Results</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scenic Attributes and Scenic Evaluation</td>
<td>254</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>254</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Methods</td>
<td>254</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scenic Analysis Trials</td>
<td>256</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Results</td>
<td>258</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scenic attribute data and scenic scores</td>
<td>258</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scenic analysis across three historic periods</td>
<td>262</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Large reserves versus small reserves</td>
<td>263</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discussion</td>
<td>268</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Endnotes</td>
<td>272</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER 7: Wilderness</th>
<th>276</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>276</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Methods</td>
<td>277</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Results</td>
<td>280</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Historic statewide extents of wilderness, 1916-1992</td>
<td>280</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Representation of wilderness in reserves, 1916-1992</td>
<td>286</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discussion</td>
<td>288</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Endnotes</td>
<td>290</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER 8: Conclusion ................................... 292
National Parks in Tasmania .................................. 292
Changing motives and conservation themes ................. 292
The expression of motives in the reserve system ........... 294
Opposition to national parks and its impacts ............... 295
Oddities and novelties ...................................... 298
Concluding Remarks ........................................ 300
Endnotes ....................................................... 302

BIBLIOGRAPHY ............................................... 305
Archives Office of Tasmania .................................. 305
Records Office, Department of Primary Industry, Water
and the Environment ........................................ 305
Newspapers .................................................... 305
Interviews ...................................................... 306
Parliamentary Acts, Bills and Papers (Tasmanian) .......... 306
Parliamentary Acts and Papers (Federal) ..................... 307
Theses and unpublished material ............................. 308
Maps ............................................................ 310
Brochures and miscellaneous items ............................ 311
Published material .......................................... 314
### FIGURES

2.1: Sketch map of Mt Field National Park, 1917 .................. 35
2.2: Mt Field National Park c1930 .................................. 49
2.3: Cradle Mountain - Lake St Clair National Park c1936 ........ 50
2.4: National Parks in Tasmania, 1937 .............................. 53
3.1: Frenchmans Cap National Park .................................. 72
3.2: Lake Pedder National Park, showing development of
    boundaries .......................................................... 78
3.3: The Hydro-Electric Commission's proposed Middle
    Gordon Power Development Scheme, 1962 ...................... 81
3.4: The South-West Committee's proposed South-West
    National Park, 1966 .............................................. 86
3.5: Southwest National Park, 1968 ................................ 91
3.6: Rocky Cape National Park, 1967 ................................ 93
3.7: Revocation of the western portion of Mt Field
    National Park and southerly extension, 1950 ................. 103
3.8: National Parks and equivalent large reserves in
    Tasmania, 1970 ................................................... 107
4.1: Maria Island National Park ..................................... 124
4.2: Mt William National Park ....................................... 132
4.3: Asbestos Range National Park ................................ 143
4.4: Proposed additions to the Southwest National Park
    in the draft management plan, 1975 ............................ 149
4.5: Australian Conservation Foundation's proposed
    boundary for the Southwest National Park, 1975 .............. 155
4.6: The Hydro-Electric Commission's proposed Gordon
    River Power Development Scheme, Stage Two, 1979 .......... 162
4.7: The National Parks and Wildlife Service's proposed
    Wild Rivers National Park, 1979 ............................... 164
4.8: Tasmania's World Heritage Area, 1982 ......................... 172
4.9: Conservation groups' proposed enlarged Western
    Tasmania National Park (World Heritage Area), 1984 ......... 173
4.10: The Lemonthyme and Southern Forests inquiry areas,
    Helsham Inquiry 1987 .......................................... 174
4.11: Conservation groups' draft nomination for the
    Western Tasmania World Heritage Area, 1988 .................. 178
4.12: The Tasmanian Wilderness World Heritage Area, 1990 .... 180
4.13: Douglas-Apsley National Park .................................. 189
4.14: National Parks and equivalent large reserves in
Tasmania, 1992 .......................................................... 194
5.1: Percentage representation of vegetation types in reserves,
1937, in relation to pre-European estimated statewide areas .... 231
5.2: Percentage representation of vegetation types in reserves,
1970, in relation to pre-European estimated statewide areas .... 232
5.3: Percentage representation of vegetation types in reserves,
1992, in relation to pre-European estimated statewide areas .... 233
5.4: Percentage areas of total statewide vegetation versus
percentage areas reserved, 1937 .................................... 234
5.5: Percentage areas of total statewide vegetation versus
percentage areas reserved, 1970 .................................... 235
5.6: Percentage areas of total statewide vegetation versus
percentage areas reserved, 1992 .................................... 236
6.1: Natural scenic value in Tasmania ................................. 261
6.2: Relative scenic value of national parks and equivalent
reserves established from 1916-1992 ............................... 264
6.3: Relative scenic value of large and small reserves created
between 1916 and 1937 ............................................... 266
6.4: Relative scenic value of large and small reserves created
between 1938 and 1970 ............................................... 267
6.5: Relative scenic value of large and small reserves created
between 1971 and 1992 ............................................... 269
7.1: Statewide extent of wilderness, 1916 ............................. 282
7.2: Statewide extent of wilderness and reserve boundaries, 1937 .. 283
7.3: Statewide extent of wilderness and reserve boundaries, 1970 .. 284
7.4: Statewide extent of wilderness and reserve boundaries, 1992 .. 285
PLATES

2.1: Gordon River scene ................................................. 18
2.2: Wineglass Bay, the Freycinet Peninsula .......................... 22
2.3: The Tasmanian Field Naturalists Easter camp at
Wineglass Bay, Freycinet Peninsula, 1908 ......................... 23
2.4: Mountain scene, Mt Field area ................................ 27
2.5: Leonard Rodway, Government Botanist of Tasmania ........... 28
2.6: The opening of Mt Field National Park, 1917 .................... 36
2.7: Gustav Weindorfer of Cradle Mountain .......................... 38
2.8: Cradle Mountain and Dove Lake ................................ 39
3.1: Hartz Mountain and Lake Emily .................................. 63
3.2: Colin Pitt (Surveyor-General), while working as
Chief Engineer on the West Coast Road, 1933 ....................... 66
3.3: The opening of the Mt Barrow Road by Major Davies,
Minister for Lands, 13 April 1940 ................................ 68
3.4: Frenchmans Cap ..................................................... 71
3.5: Skiing party, Mt Field National Park ............................ 73
3.6: Members of the Northern Tasmanian Alpine Club at
'Carr Villa' - hut on Ben Lomond, 1937 ............................. 75
3.7: Lake Pedder from the Frankland Range .......................... 77
3.8: Premier 'Electric Eric' Reece .................................... 90
3.9: Mt Pelion Company's wolfram mine, 1920 ....................... 94
4.1: Precipitous Bluff from Prion Beach, south-west Tasmania ... 151
4.2: In the Great Ravine, Franklin River ............................ 163
6.1: Mt Gould and Lake Marion, central Tasmania .................. 246
6.2: Cape Raoul, Tasman Peninsula, southeast Tasmania .......... 247
6.3: Port Davey, west coast ............................................. 247
6.4: St Columba Falls, South George River, northeast Tasmania .. 248
6.5: Cradle Mountain ................................................. 249
6.6: Russell Falls, Mt Field National Park ............................ 250
6.7: Frenchmans Cap, west coast .................................... 251
6.8: Mount Gould and Lake Elysia, the Labyrinth, Du Cane
Range, central Tasmania ............................................. 252
6.9: East face of Cradle Mountain .................................... 252
6.10: New Harbour Beach, southwest Tasmania ...................... 253
TABLES

2.1: Reserves of natural areas in Tasmania, 1899 ............................ 25
2.2: National Parks and reserves in Tasmania, 1937 ....................... 52
3.1: National Parks and reserves in Tasmania, 1970 ....................... 104
3.2: Reserve revocations, 1938-1970 ........................................... 110
4.1: National parks and natural area reserves in Tasmania, 1992 ... 190
4.2: Reserve revocations, 1971-1992 ........................................... 198
5.1: Current and pre-European estimated statewide extents of forest communities, with areas lost since European settlement .... 217
5.2: Current and pre-European statewide extents of vegetation types, with areas lost since European settlement ..................... 219
5.3 Current and pre-European areas of vegetation types, expressed as a percentage of total statewide vegetation ......................... 220
5.4: Cumulative representation of forest communities in reserves over three historic periods ..................................................... 222
5.5: Cumulative percentage representation of forest communities in reserves over three historic periods ............................... 225
5.6: Cumulative representation of vegetation types in reserves over three historic periods ..................................................... 228
5.7: Cumulative percentage representation of vegetation types in reserves over three historic periods ............................... 230
6.1: Representation of natural scenic elements in photographs of natural areas published in three historic periods in Tasmania ... 245
6.2: Cumulative reservation of scenic attributes over three historic periods, expressed as absolute scores and percentages of the 1992 totals of the Tasmanian natural scenic estate ........................... 259
6.3: Mean grid square scores of scenic attributes in national parks and equivalent reserves over three historic periods ................ 259
6.4: Summed scores and mean grid square scores of scenic attributes for reserved and unreserved components of the Tasmanian natural scenic estate, 1992 .............................................. 260
6.5: Proportional increase in the representation of scenic attributes in reserves over time ....................................................... 260
7.1: Statewide extents of wilderness core areas and wilderness loss from pre-European area over major periods of national park development ....................................................... 281
7.2: Wilderness loss over three historic periods ....................... 281
7.3: Representation of wilderness core and buffer zone areas in reserves over three historic periods ......................... 287
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ABPB</td>
<td>Animals and Birds Protection Board</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACE</td>
<td>Association of Consumers of Electricity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACF</td>
<td>Australian Conservation Foundation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AMN</td>
<td>Australian Newsprint Mills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APM</td>
<td>Australian Paper Manufacturers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPM</td>
<td>Australian Pulp and Paper Manufacturers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BHP</td>
<td>Broken Hill Pty Ltd</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CMB</td>
<td>Cradle Mountain Reserve Board</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSIRO</td>
<td>Commonwealth Scientific and Industrial Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CWA</td>
<td>Country Womens Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HEAT</td>
<td>Hydro Employees Action Team</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HEC</td>
<td>Hydro-Electric Commission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IUCN</td>
<td>International Union for the Conservation of Nature</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LPAC</td>
<td>Lake Pedder Action Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NPB</td>
<td>National Park Reserve Board</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NPWS</td>
<td>National Parks and Wildlife Service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NWI</td>
<td>National Wilderness Inventory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RFA</td>
<td>Regional Forest Agreement (Tasmania-Commonwealth)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SPA</td>
<td>Scenery Preservation Act</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SPB</td>
<td>Scenery Preservation Board</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SWTAC</td>
<td>South-West Tasmania Action Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TCT</td>
<td>Tasmanian Conservation Trust</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TPFH</td>
<td>Tasmanian Pulp and Forest Holdings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TWS</td>
<td>Tasmanian Wilderness Society</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UTG</td>
<td>United Tasmania Group</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHA</td>
<td>World Heritage Area</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>