Structure and Ideology in the Tasmanian Labor Party: Postmaterialism and Party change

By

Peter James Patmore
LL.B., Dip. Crim.

Submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

University of Tasmania, March 2000
This thesis contains no material which has been accepted for a degree or diploma by the University or any other institution, except by way of background information and duly acknowledged in the thesis, and to the best of my knowledge and belief no material previously published or written by another person except where due acknowledgment is made in the text of the thesis.

Peter Patmore

23rd February 2000.
This thesis is not to be made available for loan or copying for two years following the date this statement is signed. Following that time the thesis may be made available for loan and limited copying in accordance with the Copyright Act 1968.

 peter patmore

23rd February 2000
ABSTRACT

The Tasmanian Labor Party has found itself, like many western social democratic parties, recently subject to challenge; not from its traditional enemy, the economic right, but from a new postmaterialist left. This thesis considers the concept of postmaterialism, its rise and role in the formation of new ecocentric political parties, and its impact on the structure, ideology and electoral strategy of the Tasmanian Labor Party.

Maurice Duverger's typology of political parties has been used to elucidate and consider the characteristics and formation of political parties and the importance of electoral systems – particularly proportional representation – in achieving representational success. This typology, coupled with Ronald Inglehart's concept of postmaterialism shows how a conflict of values and a new ecocentric ideology has given rise to new environmental movements and green political parties.

This thesis finds that, in a Tasmanian context, both the Labor Party's history and the impact of Tasmania's peculiar electoral system contributed to the emergence of environmental parties in Tasmania. Further, it finds that the strength of their emergence and the significance of postmaterialism's ecocentric ideology necessitated a serious response from Tasmanian Labor. National and Labor Party surveys, confirmed the existence and persistence of postmaterialism – both in the broader Tasmanian community and the Tasmanian ALP.

As a result of this research, it is argued that some options in meeting the postmaterialist challenge could not be utilised by the Tasmanian Labor Party. Major structural reform would not be effective and ideological renewal would have only limited effect. Thus, the Party has pursued a strategy of retaining party unity while attempting to attract sufficient postmaterialist support to gain majority government.
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Many people have provided help and support to me in the writing of this thesis and I thank them all, but two deserve special acknowledgment.

First and foremost I acknowledge my wife Jane. A project of this nature demands a near obsessive focus, often to the detriment of family contact. She understood my obsessions and tolerated my absences, while providing constant support and understanding. I remain constantly in her debt.

I would also like to record my appreciation to Dr. Richard Herr of the Department of Government at the University of Tasmania who supervised this project. Richard’s guidance was essential for my completion, for it soon became obvious that I had both underestimated the work required and overestimated my abilities. His enthusiasm and advice kept me going.
ADDENDUM

The danger for any author is finding a suitable point at which to conclude. I had chosen the leadership change from Michael Field to Jim Bacon for it seemed, at that stage, major changes prior to an election were unlikely. However, just as the final draft had been written, legislation was introduced which altered the electoral system to the advantage of both the major parties. Anyone reading this work should be aware of these changed circumstances.

The new Leader of the Labor Opposition, Jim Bacon, introduced the *Parliamentary Reform Bill 1998* into the House of Assembly in May 1998. Its main provision was to cut the numbers of the House of Assembly from 35 to 25 and the Legislative Council from 19 to 15. The members of the House of Assembly were to be elected from the existing five electoral divisions, thus raising the quota necessary for election from 12.5 percent to over 16 percent. The second reading of the Bill was defeated by the Government on the 22nd of May 1998.

But the Premier, Tony Rundle, under public and party pressure recalled Parliament on the 22nd of July 1998 for the express purpose of legislating to cut the size of the House of Assembly from 35 to 25; effectively accepting the model preferred by the Labor Party.

In each vote taken during the passage of the *Parliamentary reform Bill 1998* the Government and the Labor opposition voted together. Despite intense and heated opposition by the Greens, the Bill passed rapidly through both the House of Assembly and the Legislative Council, commencing operation on the 28th of July 1998. In the election which followed in August 1998 Labor was returned with 14 seats, the Liberals were reduced to 10 and only one Green in the division of Franklin, Mrs Putt, overcame the increased quota to retain her seat.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Statements ................................................................................................................ ii
Thesis Abstract. ........................................................................................................ iv
Acknowledgments ..................................................................................................... v
Addendum ................................................................................................................ vi

Chapter 1. Introduction ........................................................................................... 1
  Introduction ............................................................................................................. 1
  The nature of parties ............................................................................................... 2
  Pressures for fundamental change ......................................................................... 3
  Relationship of the two key themes ......................................................................... 5
  Structure of the thesis ............................................................................................. 8
  Ancillary methodological considerations ............................................................... 10
  Limitations of study ............................................................................................... 10

Chapter 2. Structure and Party Categorisation ....................................................... 12
  Introduction ............................................................................................................. 12
  Nature and definition of political parties ............................................................... 14
  Party relevance and Sartori – a threshold issue .................................................... 16
  Electoral systems – barrier or frontier? ................................................................. 18
  Party structures – towards a typology of ideal types ............................................ 24
    Type 1: cadre party ............................................................................................... 25
    Type 2: mass party ............................................................................................... 28
    Type 3: devotee/charismatic party ....................................................................... 32
    Criticisms of typology – the impact of societal change on ideal types ............... 36
    catch-all party type ............................................................................................. 38
    framework party type ......................................................................................... 41
  Indicators of institutionalisation and its effect ....................................................... 44
  Party development and structural limitations ....................................................... 46
Pragmatists, ideologues and lobbyists ................................................................. 49
The different preferred roles and structures of parties ................................. 50
Leadership autonomy and its benefits .............................................................. 52
Conclusion ....................................................................................................... 56

Chapter 3. Ideological Change and its Influence on Structure ...................... 57
Introduction .................................................................................................... 57
Changes to terminology .................................................................................. 58
Ideology and Change ....................................................................................... 60
End of ideology ............................................................................................... 60
Transition to postmaterialism ......................................................................... 62
  New politics and the characteristics of its supporters .................................. 63
  An explanation of the new values – postmaterialism .................................. 65
Inglehart’s theory on the relationship between economic
  security and postmaterialism ....................................................................... 66
The spread of postmaterialism through generational change ................. 68
Criticisms of Inglehart’s theory ................................................................. 68
Criticisms based on the role of education ............................................... 71
Environmental parties and green politics ..................................................... 73
  Green continuum ....................................................................................... 75
  Anthropocentrism ...................................................................................... 77
  Eco-capitalism and eco-socialism ............................................................. 78
  Ecocentrism ............................................................................................... 79
The Effect of Ideological Change on Structure .............................................. 85
  Opportunities and constraints for formation of ‘new politics’ parties ....... 85
  The conflict of values ................................................................................ 89
  Conservative response ............................................................................. 93
  The challenge of new ideology ............................................................... 94
    The socialist dilemma – a structural response to
    new ideology .......................................................................................... 95
  The relative positions of the parties – ideological
    and structural changes ....................................................................... 98
Difficulties of accommodation and alliance potential.............................................. 101
Conclusion............................................................................................................ 104

Chapter 4 Established Tasmanian Parties – Influences and History .......... 105
Introduction........................................................................................................ 105
Tasmania........................................................................................................... 106
Government and the growth of traditional parties........................................... 109
Anti-Labor and Liberal Parties........................................................................ 110
  Liberal control over policy / leadership autonomy........................................ 112
  Revenue / funds............................................................................................ 114
  Membership.................................................................................................. 114
  Liberal party as cadre.................................................................................. 116
Labor history..................................................................................................... 117
  Control over policy / leadership autonomy................................................ 118
  Revenue / fees............................................................................................. 120
  Strong leadership – Ogilvie to Reece........................................................ 122
  Hydro-industrialisation.............................................................................. 125
  Labor after Reece – membership fluctuations
    and internal divisions................................................................................ 128
The structural rigidity and ideological dogmatism of the ALP ..................... 132
Attitudes of established parties and their role in the
  creation of new parties.................................................................................. 134
Opportunities for and constraints on forming new parties in Tasmania.... 137
The first election of an environmentalist......................................................... 139
Tasmanian Electoral System............................................................................ 141
Hare-Clark....................................................................................................... 141
Tasmania’s system and multipartyism............................................................. 147
Conclusion........................................................................................................ 148
Chapter 5 Emergence of Postmaterialism and a New Ideology in Tasmania

Introduction ................................................................................................ 150
Lake Pedder – the first conflict ..................................................................... 151
United Tasmania Group – the first environmental and postmaterialist party ........................................................................................................... 155
Franklin River debate – a postmaterialist challenge to the Labor Party .... 159
The rise of the Greens ................................................................................ 168
Wilderness as sacred .................................................................................. 169
Bob Brown and charisma ............................................................................. 171
Post-1982 – The environment dilemma for the ALP ................................. 175
1986 election – another defeat for Labor ................................................... 177
Wesley Vale – a final rebuttal of development politics ............................. 179
1989 election – the balance of power ........................................................ 183
The Tasmanian Parliamentary Accord ......................................................... 185
Accord negotiations ................................................................................... 186
Union backlash against the Accord ........................................................... 189
Accord tensions between the Greens and Labor ........................................ 191
Salamanca Agreement ............................................................................... 194
End of the Accord ...................................................................................... 196
Conclusion ............................................................................................... 197

Chapter 6 Labor’s Response to Postmaterialism – the Current State of Tasmanian Parties

Introduction ................................................................................................ 199
Labor’s structural and strategic changes ..................................................... 200
Another defeat for Labor – the 1992 election ............................................ 200
ALP restructuring ...................................................................................... 202
Labor’s moves to increase membership ..................................................... 205
Relationship with the unions ..................................................................... 206
APPM dispute – Labor’s support of the strikers ....................................... 206
Department of Construction redundancies ................................................. 207
Chapter 7 Structural and Ideological Comparisons ........................................ 224
  Introduction................................................................................................ 224
  Structural comparisons ................................................................................ 225
    Labor as a mass party ........................................................................... 225
    The Greens as a charismatic framework party ....................................... 227
      Control over policy/leadership autonomy ......................................... 228
    Catch-all.................................................................................................. 232
  Ideological comparisons ............................................................................. 235
    Attitudes to society ............................................................................... 235
    Ideological levels ................................................................................... 236
  Involvement / commitment of members...................................................... 238
    Tasmanian Greens ideology ................................................................ 239
    Green voter profile / membership....................................................... 245
    ALP voter profile ............................................................................... 253
      Conclusion........................................................................................... 259

Chapter 8. Labor and Community Surveys.................................................. 261
  Introduction................................................................................................ 261
  Community and Labor Party Surveys....................................................... 263
  Survey indicators of materialists and postmaterialists in Tasmania .......... 266
    Materialist/postmaterialist questions ................................................... 267
    AES surveys – postmaterialists in the community .................................. 268
      Education and socio-economics ......................................................... 268
Social issues..................................................................................................................269
Environment ................................................................................................................270
Labor’s survey – postmaterialists in the ALP..............................................................270
Labor’s survey indicators of postmaterialism ..............................................................272
Education and socio-economics ................................................................................272
Social issues..................................................................................................................272
Economics...................................................................................................................273
Political activism ........................................................................................................273
Environment ................................................................................................................273
Generational replacement ............................................................................................274
Definitions of ‘left’ and ‘right’........................................................................................275
Left/right self-placement ...............................................................................................278
Labor Party members characteristics .........................................................................279
Occupation....................................................................................................................279
Age and length of membership.....................................................................................279
Women in the ALP.......................................................................................................280
Electorates.....................................................................................................................281
Members’ left/right placement of the Party ..................................................................282
Attitudes to other parties..............................................................................................283
Approval of social movements ....................................................................................285
Comparison of characteristics of ALP and the electorate..........................................286
Education......................................................................................................................287
Social class....................................................................................................................288
Religion........................................................................................................................288
Left/right self-placement ..............................................................................................289
Approval/disapproval of Greens...................................................................................290
Social policy..................................................................................................................291
Economic issues..........................................................................................................293
The environment.........................................................................................................296
Attitudes to government and politics..........................................................................299
Political activism .........................................................................................................299
Conclusion....................................................................................................................300
# Chapter 9. Labor’s Response to Postmaterialism

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>302</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What were the options?</td>
<td>303</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alliance potential</td>
<td>305</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labor/Green</td>
<td>308</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liberal/Green</td>
<td>310</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liberal/Labor</td>
<td>310</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Majority government</td>
<td>312</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What the surveys disclose</td>
<td>313</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Left/right self-definition</td>
<td>313</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Differences within the Party</td>
<td>316</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Materialist/postmaterialian</td>
<td>317</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Generational change</td>
<td>319</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education and social class</td>
<td>320</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attitudes to other parties</td>
<td>321</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Differences with the electorate</td>
<td>322</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social policies</td>
<td>322</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic issues</td>
<td>323</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Political Response to Postmaterialism</td>
<td>324</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A static assessment of the Tasmanian political scene</td>
<td>324</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Green adaptiveness as a factor</td>
<td>325</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Structure</td>
<td>325</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inconsistent ideological statements</td>
<td>328</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of a coherent strategy</td>
<td>330</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labor’s response</td>
<td>331</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The dimensions of the challenge for Labor</td>
<td>331</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Party structure</td>
<td>334</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A new Labor strategy – majority government</td>
<td>336</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>338</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter 10. Conclusion .................................................................................................................. 340
  Introduction .......................................................................................................................... 340
  General findings .................................................................................................................. 341
  The Tasmanian findings ........................................................................................................ 343
  Implications of postmaterialism and some consequences of party change ......................... 347
  Tasmania ................................................................................................................................ 347
  Broader implications ............................................................................................................. 352

Appendix .................................................................................................................................... 354

Selected bibliography .............................................................................................................. 367