Patents for Pharmaceuticals and Access to Affordable Medicines:
Towards an All-Encompassing Access Paradigm for Africa

Olasupo Ayodeji Owoeye
LL.B (Hons)
Barrister and Solicitor, Supreme Court of Nigeria
Enrolled Barrister and Solicitor, High Court of New Zealand

Submitted in Fulfilment of the Requirement for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy

June 2014

University of Tasmania
Declaration of Originality

This thesis contains no material which has been accepted for a degree or diploma by the university or any other institution, except by way of background information and duly acknowledged in the thesis, and to the best of my knowledge and belief no material previously published or written by another person except where due acknowledgment is made in the text of the thesis, nor does the thesis contain any material which infringes copyright.

Authority of Access

This thesis may be made available for loan and limited copying and communication in accordance with the Copyright Act 1968.

Olasupo Ayodeji Owoeye ……………………. 19 June 2014
For mum
Abstract

The connection between patents for pharmaceuticals and access to affordable medicines has elicited considerable attention and highly stimulating debates since the emergence of the World Trade Organisation (WTO) Agreement on Trade Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights (the TRIPS Agreement) as part of the Marrakesh Agreement Establishing WTO in 1994. The TRIPS Agreement is the first international convention to make it mandatory for all countries to make patents available in all fields of technology provided the invention to be patented meets the criteria for patentability. Consequently, countries like India, Brazil, China and Thailand that used to refuse to grant patents for pharmaceuticals were constrained to amend their patents laws to bring them in line with the WTO standard. Many developing countries did not even have legislation for a number of the intellectual property rights areas covered by the agreement at the time it was adopted. The TRIPS Agreement has been criticised as being a significant part of the global access to medicines problem and strong arguments have been raised for having more flexible standards for the protection of patents particularly in relation to pharmaceuticals.

This thesis examines the WTO regime for patent protection in the context of pharmaceuticals and the existing flexibilities in the TRIPS Agreement that countries seeking access to affordable patented pharmaceutical products might adopt. The effectiveness of the TRIPS compulsory licensing regime is examined, with particular focus on the limitations resulting from the TRIPS requirements for test data protection. The concepts of parallel importation and exhaustion of intellectual property (IP) rights are also examined with a view to ascertaining the extent to which they may serve as legal stratagems for developing countries seeking access to affordable medicines. The thesis argues that the existing frameworks for the right to health and the right to development in international law may provide a strong justification for the broad interpretation of the existing flexibilities in the TRIPS Agreement without the need for going through the very rigorous process of amending it.

The thesis considers the patents and access to medicines problem in the context of the special and highly complex challenges people in Sub-Saharan Africa are currently encountering. It recommends the establishment of an African Free Trade Area to make it easier for Africa as a continent to make better use of the TRIPS flexibilities. The thesis argues that more than ever before, the time has come for Africa to harness her resources to address her access to
medicines problem through the use of all the available options in international economic law and international human rights law.
# Table of Contents

Abstract ................................................................................................................................. iii

Acknowledgements .............................................................................................................. x

Introduction .......................................................................................................................... 1
  1. General Introduction .......................................................................................................... 1
  2. Africa and the Access to Medicines Problem .................................................................... 2
  3. Patents and Access to Medicines ...................................................................................... 3
  3.1 The TRIPS Flexibilities .................................................................................................. 6
  4. IP and Access to Medicines: An African Free Trade Remedy .......................................... 8
  5. Original Contribution to Existing Knowledge .................................................................. 10
      5.1. Research Methodology and Outline ........................................................................... 11
      5.2. Publications from the Thesis .................................................................................... 13

1. The TRIPS Compulsory Licensing Regime ....................................................................... 15
   1.1. Introduction .................................................................................................................. 15
       1.1.1. Compulsory Licensing in Historical Context ......................................................... 17
       1.1.2. Compulsory Licensing under TRIPS: The Negotiations .................................... 20
   1.2. The Scope of Compulsory Licensing under TRIPS Article 31 .................................... 24
       1.2.1. Local Working Requirements and TRIPS .............................................................. 28
       1.2.2. TRIPS Compulsory Licensing Regime – Pre Doha Developments .................... 31
   1.3. The Doha Declaration ................................................................................................. 33
       1.3.1. Doha Paragraph 6 Implementation Decision- The Negotiations ........................ 35
       1.3.2. The Implementation of Paragraph 6 of Doha Declaration .................................... 37
       1.3.3. The Protocol Amending TRIPS ............................................................................ 41
       1.3.4. Compulsory Licensing under the Doha Paragraph-6 System .............................. 44
       1.3.5. Canadian Compulsory Licensing Regime ............................................................ 48
   1.4. Conclusion .................................................................................................................... 50

2. Compulsory Licensing and Access to Medicines in Africa ............................................. 52
   2.1. Introduction .................................................................................................................. 52
   2.2. Justifying Compulsory Licensing ................................................................................ 53
       2.2.1. Compulsory Licensing and the Access to Medicines Conundrum ....................... 55
       2.2.2. The Precautionary Principle and Compulsory Licensing .................................... 57
   2.3. Compulsory Licensing and Access to Medicines ......................................................... 59
       2.3.1. Is Compulsory Licensing Pivotal to Access to Medicines? ................................... 62
4.3.1. An Analysis of Exhaustion of Patents Rights under the TRIPS and the Paris Convention ................................................................. 119
4.3.2. TRIPS Exhaustion Regime and the GATT ......................................................... 121
4.4. Parallel Importation in International Trade .......................................................... 123
  4.4.1. Parallel Importation and Pharmaceuticals ...................................................... 126
  4.4.2. Differential Pricing ..................................................................................... 131
  4.4.3. Parallel Importation and Competition Policy ............................................... 134
  4.4.4. Parallel Importation of Goods Made under Compulsory Licensing ............. 138
  3.4.4 Parallel Trade as a Mechanism for Accessing Medicines in Africa .................. 140
4.5. The Implications of the Anti-Counterfeiting Trade Agreement for Parallel Trade 141
4.6. Conclusion ........................................................................................................ 145

5. Pharmaceutical Patents and the Obligation to Protect Health .................................................. 147
  5.1. Introduction ..................................................................................................... 147
   5.1.1. Theoretical Foundation of Human Rights .................................................. 149
   5.1.2. Human Rights in International Law ........................................................... 152
  5.2. The Right to Health in International Law .......................................................... 155
   5.2.1. The Right to Health in International Conventions ...................................... 156
   5.2.2. Bioethics Declaration and the Declaration of Alma-Ata ............................... 158
   5.2.3. Access to Medicines and the Right to Health ............................................ 160
  5.3. Domestic Implementation of the Right to Health ................................................ 162
   5.3.1. Reasons for the Unenforceability of Social, Economic and Cultural Rights .... 165
   5.3.2. Enforcement in National Courts .................................................................... 167
   5.3.3. Enforcement in Regional Courts .................................................................. 170
  5.4. Economic and Property Rights as Human Rights ............................................... 175
   5.4.1. International Trade Law and Human Rights: Is there a Conflict? .................. 179
  5.5. Access to Medicines, the Right to Health and Pharmaceutical Patents ............... 182
   5.5.1. Human Rights, Human Security and Public Health .................................... 183
   5.5.2. The Interface between Trade, Intellectual Property and Access to Medicines ... 186
   5.5.3. Public Interest Measures in the TRIPS Agreement ...................................... 188
   5.5.4. The Right to Health and the Duty of Multinational Pharmaceutical Companies 192
  5.6. Conclusion ........................................................................................................ 194

6. Patents for Pharmaceuticals and the Human Right to Development ............................... 196
  6.1. Introduction ..................................................................................................... 196
   6.1.1. The Concept of Development ...................................................................... 198
   6.1.2. The Legal Order for International Economic Law ...................................... 199
  6.2. The Right to Development as a Human Right ..................................................... 201
6.2.1. TRIPS and Development ................................................................. 203
6.3. Intellectual Property, Economic Growth and Development .................. 207
   6.3.1. Patent Harmonisation and Development ...................................... 210
   6.3.2. The WTO and WIPO Development Agendas .................................. 213
6.4. Anti-Counterfeiting Trade Agreement Patent Regime and Development .... 217
6.5. The TRIPS Technology Transfer Regime and Implications for Development .... 219
6.6. Pharmaceutical Patents, Health and Development ................................ 224
6.7. Conclusion .......................................................................................... 227

7. Free Trade and Economic Collaboration as Access Paradigms .................. 229
   7.1. Introduction ....................................................................................... 229
   7.2. The Treaty Establishing the African Economic Community (Abuja Treaty): A Brief Background ................................................................. 232
      7.2.2. The Challenges of Implementing the Abuja Treaty ......................... 237
   7.3. The Role of the African Union ........................................................... 238
   7.4. Access to Medicines and Free Trade .................................................. 241
      7.4.1. The Benefits of an African Regional Trade Agreement .................... 246
   7.5. The Patent Pool Option ...................................................................... 249
      7.5.1. Other Recommendations ............................................................. 251
   7.6. Conclusion ......................................................................................... 252

General Conclusion .................................................................................... 254
Concluding Remarks .................................................................................... 256

Bibliography ............................................................................................... 258
Articles/Books/ Reports ................................................................................. 258
Cases ........................................................................................................... 295
Legislations ................................................................................................. 300
Treaties & Declarations .............................................................................. 301
GATT/WTO Documents ............................................................................ 304
WTO Cases ................................................................................................. 306
Others .......................................................................................................... 306