Supervising Doctorates Downunder

KEYS TO EFFECTIVE SUPERVISION IN AUSTRALIA AND NEW ZEALAND

Edited by Carey Denholm and Terry Evans

ACER Press
Contents

Foreword  iii
About the editors  viii
Authors  ix

CHAPTER 1  Introduction  1
Carey Denholm and Terry Evans

SECTION 1  Doctoral research supervision  5

CHAPTER 2  The importance of doctoral research to Australia and Aotearoa New Zealand  6
Maxwell King

CHAPTER 3  Approaches to doctoral supervision in Australia and Aotearoa New Zealand  11
Barbara Grant and Margot Pearson

SECTION 2  Beginning the supervision process  19

CHAPTER 4  Agreeing to supervise  20
Mark Tennant and Susan Roberts

CHAPTER 5  Setting the scene: Initiating the supervision relationship  28
Natalie Moltschaniwskyj and George Moltschaniwskyj

CHAPTER 6  Developing the intellectual and emotional climate for candidates  36
Linda Conrad

CHAPTER 7  Helping candidates form their research question  45
Richard Ingleby
## CONTENTS

### SECTION 3

**Planning matters** 53

**CHAPTER 8** Helping candidates manage their candidacy 54  
Ed Carson

**CHAPTER 9** Conducting reviews of candidature 62  
Carey Denholm

**CHAPTER 10** Intellectual properties: Yours, theirs and others’ 71  
Helene Marsh and James Burnell

**CHAPTER 11** Supervising workplace-based research 79  
Christopher Hickey

**CHAPTER 12** Editing and proofreading skills 87  
Alison Garton and Jo McFarlane

### SECTION 4

**Ensuring a positive candidate experience** 95

**CHAPTER 13** Focusing on generic capabilities 96  
Rod Wissler

**CHAPTER 14** Integrating doctoral candidates into research teams 105  
Brian Yates

**CHAPTER 15** Effective supervision of part-time candidates 113  
Terry Evans

**CHAPTER 16** Thinking like a researcher 121  
Margaret Kiley

### SECTION 5

**Issues of care** 129

**CHAPTER 17** Recognising and responding to candidates’ health needs 130  
Kenneth Kirkby

**CHAPTER 18** Disability and chronic illness: A lived experience 138  
Christopher Newell

**CHAPTER 19** Valuing international research candidates 146  
Robyn Owens

**CHAPTER 20** Supervising Aboriginal doctoral candidates 155  
John Henry with the Institute of Koorie Education
CONTENTS

CHAPTER 21  Supervising Maori doctoral candidates  164
Joanna Kidman

CHAPTER 22  Self-care for the supervisor: A personal account  173
Elaine Stratford

SECTION 6
Promoting candidates' reading, writing and thinking  181

CHAPTER 23  Providing quality advice on candidates' writing  182
Kate Cadman and Margaret Cargill

CHAPTER 24  Supervising publishing from the doctorate  192
Peter Macauley and Rosemary Green

CHAPTER 25  Assisting candidates with seminar and conference presentations  200
Léonie Rennie

CHAPTER 26  The literature review: Not sinking, writing  208
Kate Crowley

CHAPTER 27  Degrees of uncertainty: Writing and demystifying the thesis  215
Elaine Martin and Ron Adams

CHAPTER 28  Determining doctoral quality  224
Jacqueline Rowarth and Graeme Fraser

SECTION 7
The examination and beyond  233

CHAPTER 29  Examiners and examination outcomes  234
Sid Bourke, Allyson Holbrook and Terence Lovat

CHAPTER 30  Preparing candidates for oral examination  243
Graeme Fraser and Jacqueline Rowarth

CHAPTER 31  Assisting candidates as they move into postdoctoral life  251
Andrew Cheetham, R. Warwick Blood, Anne Daly and Bill Maher

CHAPTER 32  Developing career management skills in candidates  261
Peter Tatham and Carey Denholm

CHAPTER 33  Supervising doctorates downunder: Concluding comments  269
Carey Denholm and Terry Evans
Self-care for the supervisor: A personal account

Elaine Stratford
University of Tasmania

INTRODUCTION

To write about the care of the self is to engage in a discussion that is simultaneously very private and very public. Take first the personal elements of self-care. We all have views about what it means to look after our body, our emotional and mental wellbeing, and our spiritual welfare. Consciously or unconsciously, some of us may privilege one of these domains over others, while some may seek to balance them holistically. Our views on self-care may or may not coincide with actual practices, and both views and practices will change over time according to context and setting. In this sense, self-care is highly personal and contingent.

Take next the public elements of self-care—a phrase I mean in two ways. First, the self (which I will describe as an individual’s understanding of himself or herself as coherent and autonomous) is also a product of complex and ongoing processes of socialisation and enculturation. All things being equal, these shared processes will equip an individual to live with others in a given community or communities. Thus, self-care is always and already mediated by these other processes and, in this sense, is public. Second, self-care is public because its effects are registered not simply by the self, but by others, some of whom the individual may be responsible for or to whom they are accountable. Thus, capacity for self-care may have significant influence on others, perhaps as a result of our experiencing diminished competence or, conversely, because we are in a position to meet or exceed expectations, for example.

The supervision of graduate research candidates is a set of privileges and responsibilities that tends to prioritise their care, and rightly so. It involves
someone taking 'the key responsibility for coordinating, communicating and
managing the candidature as well as overall responsibility for guidance, direction
and advancement of the thesis and ensuring that the candidate is informed about
the quality of the thesis' (University of Tasmania 2006). It also involves the creation
of a relationship of trust based on the mutual exploration of intellectual puzzles
intended to contribute to common-good scholarship. Given these parameters,

some (re)orientation of thought and action to ensure self-care by the supervisor

need not imply any loss of care to the candidate. Indeed, it is my central premise

that self-care is immensely important for supervisor and candidate, providing

crucial renewal to the first, and vital role-modelling to the second.

In this chapter I discuss the importance of self-care for the supervisor, and

the work presented is both personal and public. It draws on my own experiences

as a supervisor of 57 honours and masters coursework and graduate research

candidates over the period from 1996 to the present. It also draws on observations

of others in my role as a graduate research coordinator in a university department

with 17 profile staff and between 70 and 80 research higher degree candidates.

Indebted in particular to works by Covey (1989, 2003) and Dowrick (1995, 1997),
in what follows I focus on four layers of self-care and share key insights on the

manifold benefits of looking after oneself.

LAYERS OF SELF-CARE FOR THE SUPERVISOR

In various works, Stephen Covey expands upon a series of key habits for living

that he suggests are hallmarks of leadership. If one accepts that supervision is

a form of facilitative leadership (a means by which to provide an early career

research scholar with constructive conceptual, organisational, intellectual and

other forms of scaffolding), then these key habits are illuminating. My summation

of Covey’s (1989, 2003) work follows:

• Habits that advance private victories and constitute a move from dependence to
  independence
  – Be proactive and response-able.
  – Be centred in correct principles and begin with the ends in mind.
  – Be value-focused around life’s priorities; think ‘first things first’.
• Habits that advance public victories and constitute a move from independence to
  interdependence
  – Build rich and enduring relationships; think ‘win-win’.
  – Seek first to understand and then to be understood.
  – Be creatively cooperative and see the potential in all things. Work for
    mutually beneficial solutions.
• Habits that underpin interdependence and self-in-community
  – Renew: remember to live well (physical care), love (emotional care), learn
    (mental care) and leave a legacy (spiritual care).
- Find your voice through facilitative leadership and help others to find theirs.

Dowrick describes an understanding of social, personal, collective and spiritual development that is consonant with Covey. She maintains the absolute centrality of love, generosity, thoughtfulness and mindfulness, kindness, giving and peace. Both draw in different ways upon an older idea that Covey attributes in his books to a survivor of the Nazi death camps, Viktor Frankl—namely that between stimulus and response is a space, and in that space lie our freedom and power to choose our response, and in that response lie our growth and our happiness. Foundational tasks for self-care, care of others and of the Earth may be enacted in such spaces.

Over more than a decade of post-doctoral academic life, it has become apparent to me (indeed it seems axiomatic) that universities everywhere are complex and highly pressured environments. They are deeply bureaucratic and embedded in forms of conduct underpinned by neoliberal governmental practices and value systems. Yet they remain populated by scholars committed to the project of higher education to advance knowledge for diverse and (generally) beneficent means and ends. Nevertheless, it is also my experience that this last and arguably most important goal of university life is affected by the exigencies of late modernity in ways that erode the quality of our service to others and our care of self. As I have become increasingly busy with departmental and university-wide academic administration, having simultaneously retained both ‘normal’ undergraduate and postgraduate teaching responsibilities and developed a high supervisory load, I have had to decide how I wanted to be in the world as an academic. This ontological question has required that I think about self-care in ways that move beyond the me to the we—to thinking about how self-care is crucial to thrive in academic life and demonstrate to candidates (and always non-judgementally) that intellectual lives in organisational settings can be simply and deeply rewarding, especially if they prioritise regular and consistent periods of mindful self-care.

Let me elaborate on the how of some of the insights I have gained from rethinking my ways of being a supervisor and an academic. The usual caveats apply: I cannot describe all possible aspects of self-care; I am not ‘expert’ in all domains; by separating each form of care there is a risk of suggesting that they are not integrated. What I have to convey is far from a one-size-fits-all ‘take’ on self-care and the supervisor. Nevertheless, it may resonate with at least a proportion of the readership.

Physical care

Let me focus, perhaps predictably, on sleep, diet and exercise. Slumber is vital for cellular healing, growth and restoration. Tearoom stories about it often centre on tactics to get to sleep and stay asleep. Colleagues jest about dreaming restlessly
about candidates’ revisions. Others refer to the ‘radar effect’ or completing ‘audits’ of candidates at 2 am, wondering why they haven’t heard a ‘blip’ from John or Jane for a while. Some feel jaded during daylight hours, producing what they perceive as substandard lectures, having insufficient ‘oomph’ to write coherent arguments in their papers, or becoming ‘cranky’ with candidates who ‘fail to deliver’. Some joke about midnight raids on the fridge, their BBC addiction, warm baths, meditation, medication.

Perhaps ‘whatever works’ is best where insomnia is rare or short-lived. Where it is habitual, colleagues who ‘go with the flow’ tell me they no longer burn with resentment about being awake when they ‘should’ be asleep and some have noted that productive periods of problem solving attend longer bouts of insomnia. These days, when I wake with a candidate’s welfare in my head, I realise the matter can wait and so go back to sleep, although it took practice to get to that point. When the new day arrives, I contact the candidate and work with them to try and ensure they have mechanisms, support systems and practices in place to assist them. The recognition that empathy does not demand that I entirely solve someone else’s challenges has been a very significant step in my self-care—and I sleep better too.

Five years ago, I was advised to rethink my diet, increase the amount of low-fat protein I consumed, decrease the intake of highly processed carbohydrate products, watch that extra glass of wine after dinner, and move! I have been lifting weights and walking ever since and have changed my diet, and have been immensely glad that I did both. I have more physical strength, and that has been important in the field where I tire less readily; physical manifestations of stress are reduced; my posture is better; the aches and pains have largely gone—except when I forget that writing for four straight hours at a computer is just plain silly. I often let candidates know how fantastic I feel by investing just five hours a week in my physical wellbeing. I couch this message in terms of how it has helped me to better fulfil my obligations: first things first and ends in mind. I hope I have avoided moralising, but a key idea has been to convey that we all need to remember that we are worth the investment. As Dowrick (1991) notes, what ‘is needed as a starting point is a sense, no matter how tentative, that your own life is worth some attention, and that your own self is worth discovering’ (p. 26).

**Emotional care**

In my experience, a key task in self-care is constantly to practise strategies that enhance maturity, empathy and confidence. Let me deal with each in turn.

First, doctoral candidature is a high-level and complex training ground for professionals across a range of disciplines to prepare them for sophisticated,
multifaceted and demanding work, either inside or outside the higher education sector. It is a work contract that requires all parties to articulate, negotiate, document, understand and enact their roles. This contract needs to be explicit, whether or not candidates are on scholarship, mean to seek employment after completion or have full- or part-time status. A substantial part of candidature needs to be fostered by the supervisor, requiring emotional maturity. In the department I work in, at least a third of candidates are what might be termed 'lifestyle students' in their fifties and sixties, and many of them bring such emotional maturity to the task because they have been in high-pressured professional positions at some point. Many still are, and all are serious about their studies. In my experience, candidates who come straight through school to university, and through honours into the doctoral program, tend to find that 'work' ethos harder to manifest, and understandably so.

To my mind, our own capacities for emotional self-care (for being responsible, value-oriented and clear about our roles) are vital in constituting the ontological components of candidature. Those guidelines need to be explicitly articulated to all students, and to 'straight-through' students in particular. Clarity about how we are being in the process (or knowing that we provide a role model for mature and professional behaviour) is key to our own and our candidates' emotional wellbeing. 'Responsibility for others is crucial to living an emotionally mature life, but so is the capacity to acknowledge and take responsibility for one's own thoughts, feelings and actions: the effects they are having on others; the effects they are having on your own self' (Dowrick 2001, p. 18).

If emotional maturity characterises our own work practices—and therefore our approach to supervision—then we are more likely to realise one simple idea that promotes our capacity to be 'involved with detachment' and maintain our emotional wellbeing: It's not about me. Candidature is a profoundly important and extended opportunity to provide some assistance to an emergent scholar seeking to professionalise their skills, and emotional maturity is central to that task. Divesting the candidature of certain emotions (angst, ego or possessiveness not least among them), and investing it with empathic listening and questioning, are paramount if we are to avoid the interrelated traps of listening autobiographically and then constantly reliving our own scripts through our candidates.

It is my experience that if emotional maturity and empathy are embedded in our work (from supervisory strategies to collegial engagement), then confidence grows; and that strengthens our capacity to see supervision as an immense privilege that need not drain us of our own affective energies. We are less likely to be burdened by self-doubt in advising, because we are less inclined to draw on our own scripts and can then help candidates to help themselves to recognise, name, investigate, categorise, evaluate, monitor and act upon the problems that need to be solved by them during their candidatures.
Mental care

The life of a healthy individual is characterised by fears, conflicting feelings, doubts, frustrations, as much as by positive feelings. *The main thing is that the man or woman feels that he or she is living his or her own life.* (Dowrick 2001, p. 22 [original emphasis])

Academic life is predicated on contemplation of one sort or another. It requires discipline, persistence, courage, tenacity, insight, optimism, critical and creative thought, passion and dedication—an exciting and exhausting list. Yet most academics I know are time-poor, and that does not bode well for our sense of wellbeing. Thus, if I were to characterise academic life as I perceive many of us to experience it, terms such as 'ennui', 'stress', 'brain-fag', 'distractibility' and 'fragmentation' would be there in the mix.

A year ago, I reached a point where it became crucial to be deliberate about looking after my own mental wellbeing: I became head of school and was determined that it would not be the death-knell to my intellectual development and scholarly pursuits. Without these, I feel my professional life is diminished and my contribution to my candidates 'mere' project management.

It may seem pedestrian but, for me, time management strategies have been central to the process of preserving my scholarship. As Covey (2003) would have it, these strategies increase our circles of influence and diminish our circles of concern and, as it turns out, have provided the scaffolding for my capacity to care for my physical, emotional and spiritual wellbeing. I spend one day a week with no appointments, working on my own publications and research projects, and am in the process of organising the department timetable so that, over two years, we free up one day from any teaching. I do not check my email on my research day, and tend not to check it on other days more than three times—morning, noon and late afternoon. I answer urgent and important emails at once, but leave others until Friday afternoons. I also use what is sometimes called a 'tickler' filing system: suspension files numbered 1–31 for the days of the month, and 1–12 for the months of the year. As work comes across my desk(top), deadlines are determined and work filed according to when it needs first to be dealt with—month to month, week to week, and daily. Since adopting the system, I have not missed a deadline and have felt on top of what has been a significant workload.

I have also started to work my diary so that, wherever possible, the first one or two hours of days that are not my research day may also be spent in writing, with appointments thereafter. Again, wherever possible, I schedule time at the day’s end to commune with an endangered species—I read. So seriously do I take this responsibility that, on the encouragement of staff, I have included a week’s reading in the academic workload formula in my department; it is not enough, but it is a start and symbolically important. In short, I have realised that the best way
for me to thrive and take care of my own mental wellbeing is to understand that I can't 'find' time; rather, I have 'made' time, and am better versed in the literature in my fields than I have been for some time. That currency has informed my own scholarship and is paying new dividends with my candidates and staff. I am also witnessing the value of showing them the time-management strategies I have in hand and, in turn, they assure me that the systems are helping their own work and capacity to avoid feeling stressed and mentally tired or out of control.

CONCLUDING COMMENTS

The spiritual dimension is your core, your center, your commitment to your value system ... And people do it very, very differently. (Covey 1989, p. 292)

In thinking about spiritual self-care, about how that form of care underpins and overlays all the others I have written about above, one singular insight prevails. There is great value in what I will call 'away times and spaces'. Once again, these need to be deliberately sought and protected. Some of them provide private and solitary opportunities for renewal: consciously sought periods during which one purposefully reflects upon values, contributions to be made, ethics and personal and professional practice in relation to the ontological foundations of a life. Since I have cause to travel alone on a regular basis, I have become adept at using these times for contemplation, and find them deeply renewing of my core energies, enthusiasm and commitment to others, my candidates not least among them. Of course, these times and spaces need not always be solitary and private. Simple 'time out' with family and friends in convivial spaces and places of felt value can be immensely renewing of the spirit. Again, such times need to be prioritised and celebrated as core to our self-care such that we are centred and then able to serve others.

In closing, I stress that the supervision of research candidates is a set of privileges and responsibilities that tends to prioritise their care, and this should be the case. It is also important for supervisors to prioritise self-care in ways that move beyond the me to the we: to serve as non-judgemental role models. In testing times in higher education, it is vital to demonstrate to candidates that a scholarly existence can be immensely rewarding and contribute to the foundational mission of university life, especially when it is underpinned by mindful attention to physical, emotional, mental and spiritual wellbeing.

QUESTIONS

1. What is the hardest thing for you about taking care of yourself? And the thing that comes most readily? How do you currently approach your self-care in terms of physical, emotional, mental and spiritual domains?
2 As a supervisor, in the interface between personal care and professional care, what is working well and why? And what and how would you like to change about what is working less well? What would empower you to do so?

3 Imagine a candidate comes to you deeply concerned about their own wellbeing. While avoiding the temptation to rescue/disable or shift into autobiographical mode, how might you assist your candidate?

REFERENCES


University of Tasmania 2006, *Graduate research resource book*, University of Tasmania, Hobart.
Contents

Introduction
Bernie Warren i

Collective Depression: Its Nature, Causation and Alleviation
William W. Bostock 1

A Study of Psychological Well-being, Job Satisfaction and Sources of Pressure of Medical Consultants and Post Graduate Students.
Vijayalaxmi A. Aminabhavi and Ajitha Dindigal 13

Evaluation of the Historical Recent Past: Humour as a Possible Collective Coping Strategy
Judit Ujlaky 31

The Medicalization of Emotions: Happiness and the Role of General Practice
Louise Woodward and Ian Shaw 43

Nervios: Lessons from Cuba’s Oriente
Traci Potterf 61

The Role of Negative Self-concept in Depression, Stress, and Anxiety of Married Women
Banoudokht Najafianpour 77

Hong Kong’s Female Sex Workers: Stress and Anxiety-related Consequences of the Intersection of Poverty, Gender, Dangerous Work
Eleanor A. Holroyd, William C.W. Wong, Davina C. Ling, Ann Gray 93

We Aim To Pee: Unmasking the Secret Phobia and Reducing Performance Anxiety
Alex P.W. Gardner 103

Asylum Seekers in Australia: Turning Repression and Stress into long-term Anxiety and Depression
Harold A. Bilboe 123

The Hospital Clown: A Cross Boundary Character
Tom Doude van Troostwijk 137

Clown Language, Performance and Children’s Hospitals
Ana Achcar 149
LaughterBoss – The Court Jester in Aged Care
Dr. Peter Spitzer 165

“Nothing seems funny anymore”: Studying Burnout in Clown-Doctors
Nicole Gervais, Bernie Warren and Peter Twohig 175

Expressing Sensibilities: Healing Functions of Humour in Palliative Care
Ruth Anne Kinsman Dean 191

Collective Bibliography 207

Index 229