Shame: The Root of Violence

Professor Chris Poulson
Department of Management and Human Resources
California State Polytechnic University Pomona
Pomona, CA 91768 USA

cfpoulson@csupomona.edu

+1-909-869-2415 office
+1-909-869-4353 office fax
+1-949-464-9366 home
+1-949-494-6596 home fax

Mail:
P. O. Box 339
Claremont, CA 91711
USA

Abstract:

Violence takes many forms, from emotional to physical, from individual to group to societal, from swift to chronic. The greater the violence the more likely it is that question asked is "*Why?*"

The roots of violence, in organizations and in society as a whole, are in emotion -- more specifically, shame.

Shame is a misunderstood emotion that has come into focus only in recent years. Some will argue that it is the lack of shame that leads to violence and that the solution lies in shaming of offenders (Braithwaite, 1989). In that sense shame, or perhaps the avoidance of shame, is seen as a deterrent. It is a means of shaping behavior in keeping with contemporary societal norms. Getting the offender to accept the shame reduces the probability of future offences.

In the view of others (see for example Scheff, 1994, Nathanson, 1992,) shame is a negative affect arising from social experience, physiological origins, or both. In this sense shame is a disruptive experience for the self and thus may trigger negative consequences for the self, others, or both. Gilligan (1996) has argued that shame is a necessary but not sufficient precondition to violence.

In an exploratory effort to look at the link between shame and violence, the words of two mass killers will be analyzed. Thomas Hamilton killed 17 at the Dunblane (Scotland) Elementary School in March of 1996, and Kipland "Kip" Kinkel who killed his parents then drove to Thurston High School (Springfield, Oregon) the next morning and killed two more people and wounded many others, both wrote of their situations before they killed. These documents (or fragments thereof) are examined for indications of shame. In the analysis the works of Gilligan (1996), Nathanson (1992) and Retzinger (1991) are used as a basis for examination.

The paper concludes with a discussion of the need for greater understanding of the link between shame and violence and for methods of reducing the negative effects that shame plays throughout the course of life.

Shame: The Root of Violence

"The emotion of shame is the primary or ultimate cause of all violence whether toward others or toward the self. Shame is a necessary but not sufficient cause of violence…" (Gilligan, 1996: 110)

Introduction:

Violence is symbolic of disrupted relationships, of something gone wrong. Violence is also symbolic of power as it asserted over the target of the violence. Violence is used to express emotion; violence is used to control. Violence takes many forms, from emotional to physical, from individual to group to societal, from swift to chronic. The greater the violence the more likely it is that the question asked is "*Why*?"

The roots of violence, in organizations and in society as a whole, are in emotion -- more specifically, shame. Shame serves as a boundary to tell us when we have transgressed a norm and shame is used as tool to shape and develop socially appropriate behavior. Shame in this regard can serve a very positive role. But shame has a much more destructive side. The dark side of shame is a sense of defectiveness, a sense of powerlessness, of worthlessness. That shame can explode into violence against the self and against others. It serves as "the underside of narcissism" (Morrison, 1987) and wounded narcissists shame others out of defending against their own shame. All of these affect organizational life.

I begin by looking at the nature and extent of organizational violence, then I describe the two cases of extreme violence that provide the data for my analysis. Following discussion of shame as a construct, I turn to applying a small portion of our growing knowledge about shame to the analysis of writings by the two "shooters" in the cases. I conclude with a discussion of what we can learn from such analysis as well as implications for further research.

Violence in organizational life:

Violence in organizational life takes many forms. The most apparent and sensational events are those involving shooting, and other destructive acts against persons. In a report on workplace violence in the US between 1992 and 1996 - the latest report available surprisingly) homicides represented.05% of the victims of crime in the workplace as opposed to .2% of all victimizations). Assaults (both simple and aggravated) represented 93%, robbery 4.2% and rape and sexual assault 2.5%. The victims were largely male (66.6%) and overwhelming white (88.6%). Correspondingly offenders were male (82.9%) and 58.4% white. Firearms were used in 7.5% of crimes. (Warchol, 1998) There are no national data available on emotional violence and/or abuse.

Schools have been the most visible locations of workplace violence in the US (teaching ranked third in violent victimizations between 1992-1996) but victimizations in retail sales were more than double those in teaching. (Warchol, 1998) And, despite the high media visibility given to school shootings, the rate of school violence has actually been declining. (United States Secret Service, 2000)

Violence is also a learned response to perceived injustice or wrong on the part of others. Foreign policy of many nations over the course of history has used societal violence as a means of sanction. The message has been that if one disagrees with another and sees no other recourse, then violence is an appropriate course of action. In a letter published in *The Sunday Observer* (6 May 2001) Timothy McVeigh, awaiting execution in an American Federal prison for bombing a Federal office building in Oklahoma City killing 136 people, said:

> Additionally, borrowing a page from US foreign policy, I decided to send a message to a government that was becoming increasingly hostile, by bombing a government building and the government employees within that building who represent that government. Bombing the Murrah federal building was morally and strategically equivalent to the US hitting a government building in Serbia, Iraq, or other nations.
>
> Based on observations of the policies of my own government, I viewed this action as an acceptable option. (*The Observer*, 6 May 2001)

 The irony is, of course, that the American Government is pursuing the same course of action on him. Violence leads to violence, which leads to more violence.

Violence in organizational settings is not limited to the US. Far from it. "A 1996 European Union survey based on 15,800 interviews in its 15 member States showed that 4 per cent of workers (6 million) were subjected to physical violence in the preceding year; 2 per cent (3 million workers) to sexual harassment; and 8 per cent (12 million workers) to intimidation and bullying." (DiMartino, 2000: 2)

It is the psychological violence that comes in many forms - belittling, name-calling, ostracizing, exclusion, harassment, to name a few - that seems most pervasive and, perhaps, most destructive to organizational effectiveness. Of all these forms, harassment, largely sexual harassment, and bullying have received the greatest attention in the literature. And all have their roots in shame.

While shame serves to trigger violence, much violence, especially psychological/emotional violence/abuse, triggers shame. The result may well be escalation through a spiral of shame and rage to more violence. Understanding shame, how shame and rage interact, and how shame experiences may trigger violence is critical to reducing the level of violence in organizations (and in societies as whole.)

Two Stories -- Two Tragedies
The best way for me to illustrate the possibility of shame as an antecedent to violence seems to be to use stories. In this case two stories. Stories that are both mass tragedies. Both are stories of shootings in schools. Both were male. One shooter was 44 years old, the other 15. One died by his own hand, the other received 112 years in prison. Their histories alone provide ample suggestion of shame experiences throughout their lives. Both left materials written prior to the shootings however, which is the reason for choosing these two stories. As I proceed through this paper I will use brief selections from their writing to

illustrate the points I am discussing. Following brief descriptions of the individuals and their violent acts, the documents are included in their entirety. They have been published in public media, most notably newspapers. These provide anecdotal evidence at best but they have been the most available sources for this paper. In addition aspects of other cases will be included from time to time to illustrate a point. All of the background information and quotations used here are from publicly available media sources. (Sources from newspapers are not included in the references. Sources accessed through the Lexis/Nexis database are identified as such after the name of the newspaper.)

Thomas Watt Hamilton was 43 when, at about 9:30 AM on 13 March 1996, he entered the Dunblane (Scotland) Elementary School with 743 rounds of ammunition and four holsters around his waist. Using his Browning semi-automatic pistol he fired 105 rounds of lethal hollow-point ("dum-dum") bullets killing 16 kindergarten children and their teacher as well as wounding 14 more. He then turned his Smith & Wesson to kill himself. It was the end to a very difficult life:

> His hatred had deep roots. It originated in a childhood of disappointment and betrayal; it intensified over 22 years of rejection in adult life; and it became murderous after the one activity that gave his existence meaning—his involvement with young boys—was taken away from him.
>
> In contrast to the secure middle-class children of Dunblane, Hamilton's early years in a tough part of Glasgow were rough. His parents Thomas Watt, . 21, a bus driver, and Agnes Hamilton 19, a box-maker, had married at the Church of Scotland in Bridgeton on December 8, 1950. Money was tight. The tempestuous marriage failed when he was no more than a toddler. His mother placed him for adoption with her own parents, James and Catherine Hamilton, while she found work in the hotel trade. For years, he thought she was his sister. (*The Sunday Times* (London) March 17, 1996: 11)

Reportedly, his grandmother/mother was a very difficult person and his grandfather/father wanted no part of the charade. Thomas' own mother was herself illigitimate and had been adopted by Thomas' grandparents.

> Anthea Callaghan, 58, who lived in the same converted manse as the Hamilton family in the late 1960s, described the young Hamilton as a "good-looking boy but a loner". She said: "I would see him cycling home from school. Out of the whole family I would say he was the most normal one."
>
> Mrs Callaghan said the family was dominated by a "grandmother from hell" who proudly displayed the youngster as her son. To the outside world young
> Thomas was a normal child with an elder sister and elderly parents but
> Agnes, the young woman playing the role of big sister, was his natural mother. (*The Times* 14 March, 1996 [Lexis-Nexis])

As a young man Hamilton became involved in Scouting and at age 21 he became a Scout Leader. Over the ensuing years rumors circulated that he was a pedophile, a problem not only socially for Hamilton, but economically as well -- he had started "Rover Clubs" for boys as a means of earning a living. He also developed an interest in firearms and had

certification from the police to possess them. At the inquiry conducted by Lord Cullen after the massacre, there was no clear evidence presented that Hamilton had ever abused any of his charges. What was clear was that his judgement about organizing and leading activities was not the best. In his programs he had also videotaped and photographed boys with their shirts off. He was seen in Dunblane as a problem however and was investigated by the police with no charges resulting. Yet he lost both his post in Scouting and the supply of new boys for his Rover programs. Two women testified to Lord Cullen that they had thrown garbage on him trying to run him out of town. They:

> 'said [they] had hoped their gesture would prompt a court case which would lead to an investigation into him. They gathered two buckets of suntan oil, liquid manure, vinegar, flour, eggs, fish manure and "any rubbish and stinking stuff I could put my hands on", the inquiry was told. "I went after him first and let him have most of mine. Janet let him have most of hers. "I emptied the rest of mine and kicked him up the backside." The school janitor called police but Hamilton refused to press charges. "I said that's ridiculous. Janet said we would not even get cautioned. That was it."' (Press Association, June 5, 1996 Lexis-Nexis)

That was not included in the commission's final report however.

He engaged in an active letter writing campaign to restore his reputation culminating in the following letter (Exhibit 1) to Queen Elizabeth II written just a week before the shooting. It is this letter that is the basis of the discussion that follows later in the paper.

<center>======INSERT EXHIBIT 1 ABOUT HERE ======</center>

Kipland "Kip" Kinkel was 15 when he hit the breaking point in his young life. He shot and killed his father, a highly respected but retired teacher at the high school Kip attended, and dragged his body into the bathroom. When his mother arrived home, he met her in the garage, told her that he loved her, and killed her too. He spent a sleepless night in the family home near Springfield, Oregon, before driving the family Ford Explorer to Thurston High School. In the school cafeteria he opened fire with the rifle he had hidden under a long coat killing two and wounding 25. When he ran out of bullets several students tackled him before he could get his cherished Glock semi automatic pistol free to shoot himself. As they beat him into submission he screamed "Just kill me!" Later, at the police station, he drew the knife he had strapped to his leg and attacked a police officer, again shouting, "Just kill me! Just shoot me!" They did not; he survived to plead guilty and at 17 to be sentenced to 112 years in prison -- with no chance for parole.[i]

A child born late in his parents' marriage, his mother was 41 his father 43, Kip struggled to live up to both his parents' expectations and his six year older sister's abilities and accomplishments. At 4 his first school experience was in pre-school in Spain where his "legendary" Spanish teacher father was spending a year; a year in which Kip struggled to understand a new language when he had only begun to have some mastery of English. His father's expectations that his son would follow in his own footsteps as both an excellent student and keen athlete were slowly eroded as Kip tried in vain to fulfil them. He was, in fact, dyslexic. A result was a seemingly ever-widening gap between father and son; a gap that led to serious lapses in communication.

<center>4</center>

Adolescence was even more difficult for Kip as he struggled with his parents, difficult times in school, his growing interest in firearms, and his unrequited interest in a girl who seemed to manipulate him. Out of this struggle he apparently developed a fascination with *Romeo and Juliet* after seeing the Leonardo DiCaprio film in school. (When police arrived at the Kinkel home after the shooting at school, they found the CD of the *Romeo and Juliet* soundtrack endlessly playing a single track.) After Kip was arrested on a felony charge arising out of dropping stones on cars from an overpass, his parents finally took him to a psychologist (over his father's reluctance) who diagnosed depression and recommended Prozac. In his notes the psychologist wrote:

> "He became tearful when discussing his relationship with his father. He reported his mother views him as a 'good kid with some bad habits,' while his father sees him as ´a bad kid with bad habits.' He feels his father expects the worst from him."

> Kip told the psychologist that he can sometimes talk about personal issues with his mother, but, Dr. Hicks writes, "He cannot discuss his feelings with his father for fear he will become angry with him."

> Kip told the doctor he couldn't understand his own anger, but he made a shocking revelation about how he relieved it. "Kip reported he makes explosives from gasoline and other household items and detonates them at a nearby quarry to vent feelings of anger. If he has a bad day at school, he feels better after detonating an explosive." (Frontline, 1999)

Dr. Hicks saw him for only 9 sessions and released him. Kip was doing "so well" that several months later his parents thought he could stop Prozac. He did.

With Kip's interest in guns growing his father relented and allowed Kip to have a gun prior to the felony; a decision he revoked after the arrest. But the psychologist had an interest in guns as well, especially his own Glock semi-automatic pistols which he discussed with Kip. After the psychologist discharged Kip his father again relented and bought Kip the Glock he had desperately wanted. In the meantime Kip was also developing his fascination with bombs, accessing information on the Internet, and nurturing his growing rage at his father and other students at the school. The rage spawned an apparent hatred of people in general (with occasional expressions of hope) as revealed in the writing police found in the Kinkel home (transcripts of these notes plus the note he left in the house after killing his parents follow as Exhibit 2. His statement to the survivors and the victims' families after the guilty plea is also included.) The final blow came when Kip was again arrested, this time for buying a stolen Baretta .32 caliber semi-automatic handgun and having it in his locker at school. That day he went home and killed his father with the .22 caliber rifle his father had given him.

====== INSERT EXHIBIT 2 ABOUT HERE ========

What is shame?

Shame is a powerful, social emotion. It is learned as we learn the expectations and standards imposed upon us by others, and amplified as we develop expectations of ourselves. It is strongly rooted in culture and in language. Shame is also an affect, an innate physiological state. (Nathanson, 1992) In recent years there has been growing attention given to understanding shame -- which Thomas Scheff (1994, 1997) has called "the master emotion." I have extensively reviewed the literature in another paper (Poulson, 2000); here I will select those concepts that seem most appropriate to the task at hand. In analyzing the statements from the Kinkel journal, Hamilton's letter and other sources, I am looking for themes that suggest shame and/or an aspect of a shame experience that seems to fit with the concept being used. The method is not precise and the examination purely exploratory. I am only suggesting that the links exist as a way of providing some insight into the perennial "Why?" that follows such violent acts as the ones discussed here.

The experience of shame as an emotion can arise from many sources. The key elements (according to Lewis, 1992) are:
1. A violation of some role or standard
2. A failure to meet expectations
3. A defect of the self that cannot easily be repaired.

In the note Kip Kinkel wrote after killing his parents he spoke of all three of these elements:

> " I just got two felonies on my record. My parents can't take that! It would destroy them. The embarrassment would be too much for them. [Here Kip also seems to be saying that he was trying to save his parents the shame of dealing with his failings.] They couldn't live with themselves. I'm so sorry. I am a horrible son. I wish I had been aborted. I destroy everything I touch."

It has been argued that shame arises from a breach in the social bond (Scheff, 1994) or, similarly, from breaking the "interpersonal bridge." (Kaufman, 1989, 1992) Kaufman further argues that the core of shame is in powerlessness -- the state in which we all begin life, totally dependent on others for our survival. It seem clear in the words of both Hamilton and Kinkel journal that this bond had been broken:

> I sit here all alone. I am always alone. (Kinkel journal)
> As well as my personal distress and loss of public standing, this situation has also resulted in loss of my business and ability to earn a living. Indeed, I cannot even walk the streets for fear of embarrassing ridicule. (Hamilton)

As means of shaping behavior and making judgements it can be an important aspect of learning roles and standards -- the development of social competence. It is a means for learning what is acceptable and unacceptable in a society, organization, group, or family - in any interpersonal setting. (Seidler, 2000) When an individual is able to perceive that one has transgressed a boundary and/or engaged in an inappropriate behavior (from the perspective of self, other, or both), the experience of shame can signal the need to change behavior. The argument has been made (Braithwaite, 1989) that offenders who experience the shame (and the consequences) arising from their transgressions can be more effectively

rehabilitated than if they do not. This approach has been incorporated into programs known as "restorative justice" in which offenders and victims are brought together in "community conferences." (See for example Schweigert, 1999.)

The negative side of shame can have a much more powerful impact on behavior. While on the positive side, the experience of shame serves as a driver for constructive change, on the negative side it serves to reduce self-esteem and self-worth, and may accumulate over time until a point of overload is reached. It is this overload that seems most associated with violence.

Shame as antecedent to violence
The central argument of this paper is that shame, most especially accumulated shame that has not had an avenue for effective discharge, is the root of violence. James Gilligan, formerly medical director of the Bridgewater (Massachusetts) State Hospital for the criminally insane and former director of mental health for the Massachusetts prison system, has written an extensive examination of the roots of violence. He asserts

> "The different forms of violence, whether toward individuals or entire populations, are motivated (caused) by the feeling of shame." (Gilligan, 1996: 110)

Shame is a necessary but not sufficient cause of violence. There are three preconditions that must be met.

"The *first precondition* is probably the most carefully guarded secret held by violent men. *The secret is that they feel ashamed.* Nothing is more shameful than to feel ashamed. (Gilligan, 1996: 111)

> Oh fuck. I sound so pitiful. People would laugh at this if they read it. I hate being laughed at. (Shame arising from ridicule) (Kinkel journal)

> It is clear that no one will help me. Oh God, I am so close to killing people. So close. (Shame arising from powerlessness) (Kinkel journal)

> My eyes hurt. They hurt so bad. They feel like they are trying to crawl out of my head. Why aren't I normal? Help me. No one will. I will kill every last mother fucking one of you. The thought of you is still racing in my head. I am too drunk to make sense. (Shame arising from a sense of defectiveness) (Kinkel journal)

The *second precondition* is that they perceive "themselves as having *no nonviolent means of warding off or diminishing their feelings of shame or low self-esteem.*" (Gilligan, 1996: 112)

> I want to die. I want to be gone. *But I have to kill people. I don't know why.* I am so sorry! Why did God do this to me. I have never been happy. I wish I was happy. I wish I made my mother proud. I am nothing! I tried so hard to find happiness. But you know me I hate everything. *I have no other choice.* What have I become? I am so sorry. (from Kinkel's note left after killing his

7

parents -- emphasis added) [Here he seems to be expressing the sense of shame of the first precondition as well as the second.]

Nine times in the transcript and audio file of the police interview after the shootings at the school, Kip tells the detective "I had no other choice." (In doing so his voice is frantic with emotion -- grief, fear, shame -- He is *NOT* cold and distant as one might want to think.)

The **third precondition** is that the person "*lacks the emotional capacities or feelings which normally inhibit the violent impulses* that are stimulated by shame." (Gilligan, 1996: 113)

> I don't want to see, hear, speak or feel evil, but I can't help it. I am evil. I want to kill and give pain without a cost. And there is no such thing. We kill him - we killed him a long time ago. Anyone that believes in God is a fucking sheep (Kinkel journal)

> Oh fuck. I sound so pitiful. People would laugh at this if they read it. I hate being laughed at. But they won't laugh after they're scraping parts of their parents, sisters, brothers, and friends from the wall of my hate. (Kinkel journal)

> I feel like everyone is against me, but no one ever makes fun of me, mainly because they think I am a psycho. There is one kid above all others that I want to kill. I want nothing more than to put a hole in his head. The one reason I don't: Hope. That tomorrow will be better. As soon as my hope is gone, people die. (Kinkel journal)

Donald Nathanson's work on shame as affect is comprehensive and rich -- more so than I can do justice here. In looking at the nature of the shame process, the shame experience, he identifies four phases:

(1) Trigger : "Some easily defined impediment to whatever positive affect had just then been in progress."… "….some event that ushers in the unpleasant flow of events we call shame." (1992: 307-8)

(2) Physiological response: A response within the affect and somatic systems that includes blushing, a sense of distraction/disorientation, slumping of the shoulders, visceral tension. (This response has been identified by Thomas, 1995, as an antecedent to violence.)

(3) Cognitive review: The momentary trigger is followed by a cognitive review, not of the triggering events, but of "the group of shame related *scripts* [constellations of memories of similar events with a common theme where it is the theme rather than the events that predominates]…It is the history of our prior experiences of shame and the importance to us of these painful moments that will determine the duration and intensity of our embarrassment." (1992: 308)

(4) Response: Each event leads to a set of potential responses that Nathanson classifies into acceptance and defense responses. The acceptance approach leads the individual to what might be called a developmental outcome, one that leads to learning and

growth. The defensive responses are those that include (but are not limited to) the violence we are examining here.

Nathanson also identifies what he calls "the compass of shame" - the four categories of responses to a shame experience: withdrawal, avoidance, attack self, and attack other. A full discussion of this set of responses is beyond the scope of this paper; it is important to point out that it is principally the "attack other" response that I am addressing here. And the acts of the two individuals are at the very extreme of the attack other response set. It is important to note that the extreme of the attack self set is suicide. In both cases I will discuss, suicide seemed to be the ultimate goal, the way to finally release the individual from the shame they otherwise could not seem to escape. Hamilton did indeed kill himself after shooting the children and their teacher. (He had alluded to his intent two weeks before the shootings when reportedly telling a friend about buying two shirts on his credit card: "The beauty is I will not have to pay for them - ever." Glasgow *Herald*, 17 October 1996: 2 [Lexis/Nexis]) Kinkel expressed the wish to die several times in his journals and notes as well as taping two bullets to his chest so he would have them to use on himself. He failed to do so and exhorted both the students who subdued him and the police to kill him. Murder and suicide seem to be common companions in cases like these.

In this paper I will be focusing on not the triggers (although I recognize the critical importance of understanding these if we are to reduce the level of violence), but on the cognitive phase and the scripts that come into play. It is these scripts that carry the accumulated shame of the past and that can lead to the overload we experience in explosive rage:

> I know everyone thinks this way sometimes, but I am so full of rage that I feel I could snap at any moment. (Kinkel journal)

Using Nathanson's themes from the cognitive review phase of the compass of shame to analyze Hamilton's letter, the inherent shame becomes evident with that expressed in the final paragraphs most powerfully:

> "…and as a result of this, reported in confidence to me that Mr R. Deuchars was attempting to have me branded as a pervert."
> *Theme F: Sexuality "there is something wrong with me sexually"*

> "My attempts to approach Scottish Scout Headquarters were ignored and I could get nowhere since I was blocked from all angles. I was unable to get any response as to whether or not I was blacklisted or informed about details of the confidential report by Mr Deuchars."
> *Theme B: Dependence/Independence Sense of helplessness.*
> *Theme C: Competition "I am a loser.*

> "It seems to be a tactic of the police during any investigation, to spread innuendos to as many people as possible and in such a way as to cause maximum damage and then when their investigation comes to nothing, they do nothing about retracting their accusations. This has probably been the most damaging of all on the part of the Police and Council."

Theme B: Dependence/Independence; Sense of helplessness.
Theme D: Sense of Self "I am unique only to the extent that I am defective."

I have been involved with the organisation of Boys Sports Clubs for over 20 years and the rumours circulated by officials of the Scout Association have now reached epidemic proportions across Central Region. As well as my personal distress and loss of public standing, this situation has also resulted in loss of my business and ability to earn a living. Indeed, I cannot even walk the streets for fear of embarrassing ridicule.

All of this and more has been caused by the maladministration of the Scout Association and their denial of natural justice and duty of care. To some Scout Officials, it was simply a rouse to oust a rival (deleted) group.

I turn to you as a last resort and am appealing for some kind of intervention in the hope that I may be able to regain my self-esteem in Society.
Theme A: Matters of personal size, strength, ability, skill. "I am weak, incompetent, stupid."
Theme B: Dependence/Independence. Sense of helplessness
Theme C: Competition "I am a loser."
Theme D: Sense of self "I am unique only to the extent that I am defective"
Theme F: Sexuality "There is something wrong with me sexually."
Theme G: Issues of seeing and being seen. The urge to escape from the eyes before which we have been exposed. The wish for a hole to open up and swallow me.

It is interesting to note that Mr. Deuchars, about whom Hamilton complained, was, in fact, his upstairs neighbor -- a daily reminder of the problem.

Retzinger (1991: 69) has identified a series of code words and phrases that are emblematic of shame and its context. The classifications of groups of these terms are
  (1) direct indication (humiliated, embarrassed, etc);
        Indeed, I cannot even walk the streets for fear of embarrassing ridicule (Hamilton)

  (2) abandonment, separation, isolation statements or indications of not belonging;
        Every time I talk to her, I have a small amount of hope. But then she will tear it right down.(Kinkel journal)
        End. New day. Today of all days, I ask her to help me. I was shot down. I feel like my heart has been ripped open and ripped apart.(Kinkel journal)
        I can tell you one about love. It does more harm than good. I plan to live in a big black hole. [Also Nathanson's Theme F] (Kinkel journal)
        It is clear that no one will help me. (Kinkel journal)

10

(3) ridicule – words or phrases about being hurt, put down, threatened by another person;

> People would laugh at this if they read it. I hate being laughed at.(Kinkel journal)
>
> I feel like everyone is against me, but no one ever makes fun of me, mainly because they think I am a psycho.(Kinkel journal)

(4) inadequate – statements about not measuring up to one's own or others' standards;

> I think I love her, but she could never love me. I don't know why I try. [Also themes D & E] (Kinkel journal)
>
> My eyes hurt. They hurt so bad. They feel like they are trying to crawl out of my head. Why aren't I normal? (Kinkel journal)
>
> I don't know who I am. I want to be something I can never be. I try so hard every day. But in the end, I hate myself for what I've become (Kinkel journal)

(5) discomfort – references to unease in social settings;

> I need to find more weapons. My parents are trying to take away some of my guns! My guns are the only things that haven't stabbed me in the back.

(6) confused/indifferent – statements that indicate a muddled thought process:

> My head just doesn't work right. God damn these VOICES inside my head. (In the note Kinkel journal left after killing his parents and before the school shooting)
>
> My eyes hurt. They hurt so bad. They feel like they are trying to crawl out of my head. Why aren't I normal? Help me. No one will. I will kill every last mother fucking one of you. The thought of you is still racing in my head. I am too drunk to make sense. (Kinkel journal)
>
> End. New day. Today of all days, I ask her to help me. I was shot down. I feel like my heart has been ripped open and ripped apart. Right now, I'm drunk, so I don't know what the hell is happening to me. (Kinkel journal)

(It is interesting to note that twice in the journal segments he refers to being drunk -- a depressed 15 year old, drunk in his bedroom, with a cache of arms at hand. One might ask how this could go unnoticed -- or if it did.)

Shame, Pride, and Violence
If shame arises from powerlessness (Kaufman, 1989) then the greater the powerlessness the greater the attendant shame. Shame and pride are ends of an axis (Nathanson, 1992.) Thus we might expect that for a person who experiences shame as a result of powerlessness might experience pride when asserting power. This sense of pride is not the healthy pride

associated with accomplishment of a goal or task, but the pride of overcoming temporarily at least the sense of shame.

> "The purpose of violence is to diminish the intensity of shame and replace it as far as possible with its opposite, pride, thus preventing the individual from feeling overwhelmed by the feeling of shame." (Gilligan, 1996: 111)

> I know everyone thinks this way sometimes, but I am so full of rage that I feel I could snap at any moment. I think about it everyday. Blowing the school up or just taking the easy way out, and walk into a pep assembly with guns. In either case, people that are breathing will stop breathing. That is how I will repay all you mother fuckers for all you put me through. (Kinkel journal)

The shame that is released by acts such as these is not the shame associated with a single experience but the accumulated shame (and often attendant rage) of as much as a lifetime (as in the cases of both Hamilton and Kinkel.) Shame that has deep roots.

Roots of shame

The roots of shame are in childhood (Dutton, 1998; Kaufman, 1989; M. Lewis, 1992; Miller, 1984, 1990; Nathanson, 1992; Shengold, 1989). We are born powerless and totally dependent upon the primary caregiver, usually the mother or another woman, for every need. As we mature we learn that we must assume increasing responsibility for ourselves. This is most especially true in individualistic cultures and in the development of masculinity (where dependency is seen as a weakness and un-masculine). As we develop away from powerlessness there is a sense of shame associated with being and/or feeling powerless. This shame of powerlessness, asserts Gershen Kaufman is the base of all shame and is perhaps its most robust form:

> Powerlessness, the perception of lack of control, begins as the state of helplessness into which all individuals are thrust at birth … Powerlessness experienced anew during adulthood reactivates that earlier governing scene of initial primary helplessness … Powerlessness is not an affect per se but an *activator* of affect; it is experienced with any of the negative affects or combinations thereof. Defeat, failure, rejection, and loss thus guarantee a perpetual vulnerability to shame, which is likely to be experienced either singly or in conjunction with other negative affects. (1989: 48-49)

> I don't want to see, hear, speak or feel evil, but I can't help it. I am evil. I want to kill and give pain without a cost. And there is no such thing. (Kinkel journal)

> Please. Someone, help me. All I want is something small. Nothing big. I just want to be happy. (Kinkel journal)

> I need help. There is one person that could help, but she won't. I need to find someone else. I think I love her, but she could never love me. I don't know why I try. (Kinkel journal)

Childrearing practices, however benign in intention, carry with them at least some shaming of the child. As Lewis (1992) points out even facial expressions of dissmell ("some interference with the act of smelling") or disgust (Nathanson, 1992: 121) at infant diapers can convey suggestions of shame. Models of parenting that attempt to change child behavior through disapproval and/or humiliation may well be received by the child as global inferences about the self rather than the (perhaps) intended parental reactions to specific behavior. The expression of primary emotions (especially fear, anger, sadness, or disgust) on the part of the parent can lead to self-conscious evaluative emotions on the part of the child (including embarrassment, shame, or guilt) (Lewis, 1992; Lewis et als, 1992).

Gilligan asserts: "…the more harshly we punish criminals, or children, the more violent they become; the punishment increases their feelings of shame decreases their capacities for feelings of love for others, and of guilt toward others." (Gilligan, 1996: 113) In testimony at the sentencing hearing for his son, convicted serial killer of 11, Charles Ng, his father described how he had tried to discipline his son:

> At times assisted by a Cantonese translator, the elder Ng, who flew from Hong Kong to testify, explained he only wanted to raise his son on a straight and narrow path. Sometimes, he said, that meant tethering Charles and whipping him with a stick.
>
> "I tried to bring him up right," he testified. "Unfortunately, I used thewrong way. I thought this was normal. But now I know how wrong I am."
>
> "I beat him," said the elder Ng, who frequently choked back tears. "Even my wife tried to stop me. Even my mother-in-law tried and stop me." (Los Angeles Times April 21, 1999: B1)

His son was sentenced to death.

Emotional Violence and Bullying
There is little said about how emotional violence can trigger physical violence in response -- Suzanne Retzinger's (1991) careful documentation of the shame/rage spiral in couples in marital counseling clearly shows how emotions escalate and might lead to physical violence. The shame rage spiral -- shame triggering rage which leads to countershaming which leads to greater rage which leads to counter shaming -- can escalate very quickly, turning a mild, even unintentional, slight into an outburst of violent emotion.

 Bullying is emotional violence that may have a physical component as well. (See Adams, 1992, 1997; Randall, 1997; Rayner, 1997; Rayner and Hoel, 1997) It is an attempt to intimidate -- shame -- the other as small, weak, powerless. A recent study showed the prevalence of bullying in US schools (Nansel et als, 2001) and a "threat assessment" study by the United States Secret Service found bullying as an antecedent factor in many cases of school shooting. (United States Secret Service, 2000.) Eric Harris, 18, one of the two shooters at Columbine High School who left 15 dead including himself and his fellow shooter Dylan Klebold left this note reflecting the bullying they purportedly had experienced:

"By now, it's over. If you are reading this, my mission is complete. I have finished revolutionizing the neoeuphoric infliction of my internal terror.

"Your children who have ridiculed me, who have chosen not to accept me, who have treated me like I am not worth their time are dead. THEY ARE (expletive) DEAD. " (*Rocky Mountain News*, April 24, 1999: 2a [Lexis/Nexis])

Martin Bryant, who killed 35 people at Port Arthur, Tasmania on 28 April 1996 (only six weeks after the Dunblane shootings) was extensively interviewed by forensic psychiatrists after the massacre. He was diagnosed with Asperger's syndrome (a mild form of autism),

"He functions in the borderline range between intellectual disability and the dull, normal individual.
.........His physical, emotional, intellectual development was slow, he had considerable difficulties relating to other children, his behaviour was often aggressive and disruptive......The intellectual limitations impaired his capacity to learn and his behavioural difficulties alienated him from his peers and made him difficult to manage both at home and at school.......Mr Bryant's memories of school are that he found it an unpleasant and distressing appearance for virtually the whole of his attendance....*He recalls frequently being bullied and he only recalls one companion at school.....The predominant memory is of being by himself, ignored by other children or attended to in a bullying and frightening manner."*

Professor Mullin said Bryant had become increasingly unhappy and angry because he had no real friend.

"He said: 'All I wanted was for people to like me'. Their failure to respond to his overtures led him to feel that 'I'd had a gut full'," *his report said.* (Emphasis added) (Hobart *Mercury* Nov 25, 1996: 16-17)

The "gut full" must have been of shame arising from an ever-widening gulf in the social bond between Bryant and his community. Bryant is now in prison "for the term of his natural life" -- a life upon which he has made at least four attempts in prison.

Conclusion:
Throughout this paper I have explored possible links between shame and violence. While the two cases that served as the focus are not of violence enacted by or on behalf of organizations both had their culmination in organizational settings -- schools, one in Scotland and the other in the US.

There is no question that violence in organizations has become a widespread concern. The focus of much of the concern is on extreme acts of physical violence (most committed by men) and on acts of harassment, most typically sexual harassment. The recent studies and press reports on bullying have brought another dimension to the fore to be examined and reported upon. Programs designed to prevent physical violence and harassment and fairly widespread, and programs aimed at reducing bullying are growing. What has received the least attention is the shaming that occurs on an ongoing basis in a vast array of

organizations, shaming that we more popularly call "abusive management." One study stands out which links "administrative assault" and subsequent violence in the U S Postal Service -- the setting for so much violence in the past that the slang term for shootings in the workplace is "going postal." (Diamond, 1997) Clearly more such studies must be done.

We also need many more studies of the relationships among shame, rage, and violence. The place to reduce violence is not the factory gate or the school house door. We ensure that our workplaces and schoolhouses give respect to all those within and that we not only model respect but require it. It is much earlier that we find the roots of shame. Parenting does not come naturally in today's complex world; dysfunctional families like Thomas Hamilton's need help as do families where nurturing is intended but ineffective as was Kip Kinkel's.

We must address how we help those whom we have marignalized for whatever reason, not by shaming them for being different and not fitting in but helping them to build a true sense of pride in who they are while teaching all of us how to accommodate those who are different without stigmatization:

> "In every school there are angry kids, threatening kids, suicidal kids," Deitz said. "That's where our attention should be, not trying to prevent mass murder so much as the other suffering and harm that routinely goes on in every school." Dr. Park Deitz (quoted in "Mental illness set Kip Kinkel journal apart from other shooters." Associated Press November 13, 1999 -- Lexis-Nexis)

After five years struggling to understand those who act out so tragically, I have reached a point where I think I understand the distress that brings them to the point where rage overflows. These are not "evil people" but *hurt* people, *wounded* people acting out in what seems to them to be the only path left. I do not condone their actions in any way but I do feel that we must look beyond their actions to answer the question "*Why???"* in a way that helped us to reduce the levels of violence overall.

In discussing Martin Bryant, the Port Arthur gunman, Professor Paul Mullin, a forensic psychiatrist at Monash University (Australia), said:

> "I think what we can do is make very clear that people who do this kind of thing are in fact exactly the sort of people that they are, they are inadequate, sad, silly people. Not embodiments of evil. Not dreadful monsters. The more we make them monstrous, the more we make them evil, the more it will encourage people who want that kind of potency, that kind of power at any price and we have to remember, some people out there will accept gladly the label of evil and monster. They'd be less willing to accept the label of wimp, weakling, inadequate, pathetic." (*4Corners*, 1 July 1996)

His words echo those of James Gilligan, cited earlier in this paper: "The purpose of violence is to diminish the intensity of shame and replace it as far as possible with its opposite, pride, thus preventing the individual from feeling overwhelmed by the feeling of shame." (Gilligan, 1996: 111)

It is this link between shame and violence that I have tried to illustrate here by looking at the words of the killers themselves. I do believe that shame *is* the root of violence; clearly we need to more research to establish that link and to develop methods of prevention including non-shaming environments that accept and respect differences.

Exhibit 1: Letter from Thomas Hamilton to Queen Elizabeth II, 7 March 1996

7 March 1996

Your Majesty,

I understand you are Patron of the Scout Association and in that capacity I would like to make you aware of longstanding complaint against the Scout Association.

Over 20 years ago, as a young man of about 20 years of age, after my time as a Venture Scout, I was asked to become a Scout Leader, which I did with enthusiasm and in a fair and competent manner. I was at that time, however, somewhat disillusioned with the general management which existed in this District at that time. After a period of a year, I was offered a better position by District Commissioner, J. Don, within the Association in Mr Don's nearby district of Hillfoots which I accepted. However, my transfer was refused by Scottish Scout Headquarters without any explanation. D.C. Don approached my previous D.C., Mr R. Deuchars, and as a result of this, reported in confidence to me that Mr R. Deuchars was attempting to have me branded as a pervert. When Mr Don demanded justification of this, Mr Duechars' only response was that I was 'friendly' with the boys. Mr Don remarked that a Scout Leader was supposed to be friendly with the boys and as a conclusion Mr Don reported to me that he had nothing on me but he may cause me considerable damage if unchecked.

In what I consider to be a breach of natural justice, Mr. R. Deuchars then submitted a confidential report on me in line with the Policy Organisation and rules of the Association. I know that no child has ever made any complaint of a sinister or sexual nature against me but D. C. Deuchars, together with the A.D.C. Mr Samuels and the G.S. L. Mr McKenzie, visited and interviewed every child in my old Group including especially everyone who had been a member and left. Nothing of a sinister nature came to light. However, in a bid to justify his actions, Mr McKenzie reported that Mr Deuchars had sought to create innuendos about me with the statement Why is he so enthusiastic -- think about it? Mr J. Don referred to jealousy as the likely cause.

My attempts to approach Scottish Scout Headquarters were ignored and I could get nowhere since I was blocked from all angles. I was unable to get any response as to whether or not I was blacklisted or informed about details of the confidential report by Mr Deuchars. As time passed, numerous and various reports were received that Mr Deuchars was passing information within the District Scout area that I was a pervert which was passed to the public in an underhand manner.

Over the past 20 years of youth work, this has caused me untold damage including Council, Police and Social Work investigations where they had acted as a direct result of information received in absolute confidence from officials of the Scout Association. Any subsequent investigation was instigated on a whim and without proper complaint, cause or justification. For the purpose of the police complaints procedure, the investigative skills of the police are put into reverse. It seems to be a tactic of the police during any investigation, to spread innuendos to as many people as possible and in such a way as to cause maximum damage and then when their investigation comes to nothing, they do nothing about retracting their accusations. This has probably been the most damaging of all on the part of the Police and Council.

I have been involved with the organisation of Boys Sports Clubs for over 20 years and the rumours circulated by officials of the Scout Association have now reached epidemic proportions across Central Region. As well as my personal distress and loss of public standing, this situation has also resulted in loss of my business and ability to earn a living. Indeed, I cannot even walk the streets for fear of embarrassing ridicule.

All of this and more has been caused by the maladministration of the Scout Association and their denial of natural justice and duty of care. To some Scout Officials, it was simply a rouse to oust a rival (deleted) group.

I turn to you as a last resort and am appealing for some kind of intervention in the hope that I may be able to regain my self-esteem in Society.
I am,
Your Obdeient Servant,

Thomas W Hamilton

Exhibit 2: Writings of Kip Kinkel released by the police and court.

His confession (This note was found on the coffee table in the Kinkel journal's living room after Kip's arrest.)

I have just killed my parents! I don't know what is happening. I love my mom and dad so much. I just got two felonies on my record. My parents can't take that! It would destroy them. The embarrassment would be too much for them. They couldn't live with themselves. I'm so sorry. I am a horrible son. I wish I had been aborted. I destroy everything I touch. I can't eat. I can't sleep. I didn't deserve them. They were wonderful people. It's not their fault or the fault of any person, organization, or television show. My head just doesn't work right. God damn these VOICES inside my head. I want to die. I want to be gone. But I have to kill people. I don't know why. I am so sorry! Why did God do this to me. I have never been happy. I wish I was happy. I wish I made my mother proud. I am nothing! I tried so hard to find happiness. But you know me I hate everything. I have no other choice. What have I become? I am so sorry

From a journal found in his bedroom:

I sit here all alone. I am always alone. I don't know who I am. I want to be something I can never be. I try so hard every day. But in the end, I hate myself for what I've become.

Every single person I know means nothing to me. I hate every person on this earth. I wish they could all go away. You all make me sick. I wish I was dead.

The only reason I stay alive is because of hope. Even though I am repulsive and few people know who I am, I still feel that things might, maybe, just a little bit, get better.

I don't understand any fucking person on this earth. Some of you are so weak, mainly, that a four year old could push you down. I am strong, but my head just doesn't work right. I know I should be happy with what I have, but I hate living.

Every time I talk to her, I have a small amount of hope. But then she will tear it right down. It feels like my heart is breaking. But is that possible. I am so consumed with hate all of the time. Could I ever love anyone? I have feelings, but do I have a heart that's not black and full of animosity?

I know everyone thinks this way sometimes, but I am so full of rage that I feel I could snap at any moment. I think about it everyday. Blowing the school up or just taking the easy way out, and walk into a pep assembly with guns. In either case, people that are breathing will stop breathing. That is how I will repay all you mother fuckers for all you put me through.

I feel like everyone is against me, but no one ever makes fun of me, mainly because they think I am a psycho. There is one kid above all others that I want to kill. I want nothing more than to put a hole in his head. The one reason I don't: Hope. That tomorrow will be better. As soon as my hope is gone, people die.

I ask myself why I hate more than anyone else. I don't know. But my head and heart want him dead. He only knows who I am through reputation, and I know he is scared of me. He should be. One bad day, and there will be a sawed off shotgun in his face or five pounds of Semtex under his bed.

I need help. There is one person that could help, but she won't. I need to find someone else. I think I love her, but she could never love me. I don't know why I try.

Oh fuck. I sound so pitiful. People would laugh at this if they read it. I hate being laughed at. But they won't laugh after they're scraping parts of their parents, sisters, brothers, and friends from the wall of my hate.

Please. Someone, help me. All I want is something small. Nothing big. I just want to be happy.

End. New day. Today of all days, I ask her to help me. I was shot down. I feel like my heart has been ripped open and ripped apart. Right now, I'm drunk, so I don't know what the hell is happening to me.

It is clear that no one will help me. Oh God, I am so close to killing people. So close.

18

I gave her all I have, and she just threw it away. Why? Why did God just want me to be in complete misery? I need to find more weapons. My parents are trying to take away some of my guns! My guns are the only things that haven't stabbed me in the back.

My eyes hurt. They hurt so bad. They feel like they are trying to crawl out of my head. Why aren't I normal? Help me. No one will. I will kill every last mother fucking one of you. The thought of you is still racing in my head. I am too drunk to make sense.

Every time I see your face, my heart is shot with an arrow. I think she will say yes, but she doesn't, does she? She says, "I don't know". The three most fucked up words in the English language.

I want you to feel this, be this, taste this, kill this. Kill me. Oh God, I don't want to live. Will I see it to the end? What kind of dad would I make? All humans are evil. I just want to end the world of evil.

I don't want to see, hear, speak or feel evil, but I can't help it. I am evil. I want to kill and give pain without a cost. And there is no such thing. We kill him - we killed him a long time ago. Anyone that believes in God is a fucking sheep.

If there was a God, he wouldn't let me feel the way I do. ....Love isn't real, only hate remains. Only hate.

Paragraphs found in Kip's room which appear to be responses to an essay question about love at first sight:

Love Sucks

No, I don't believe in love at first sight because love is an evil plot to make people buy alcohol and firearms. When you love someone something it is always taken away from you. I also would like to add that I hate each and every one of you. Because everything I touch turns to shit. I think if you think you fall in love with someone at first sight it might just be lust. Love at first sight is only in movies. Where the people in the movies are better than you. That is why you go to a pone [pawn] shop and buy an AK-15 because you are going to execute every last mother fucking one of you. If I had a heart it would be gray.

It is easier to hate than love. Because there is much more hate and misery in the world than there is love and peace. Some people say that you should love everyone. But that is impossible. Look at our history it is full of death, depression, rape, wars and diseases. I also do not believe in love at first sight. But I do believe in hate at first sight. Therefore love is a much harder feeling to experience.

I really wouldn't know how to answer this question because my cold black heart has never and never will experience true love. I can tell you one about love. It does more harm than good. I plan to live in a big black hole. My firearms and [illegible] will be the only things to fight my isolation. I would also like to point out Love is a horrible thing. It makes things kill and hate.

Words written at the top of a Spanish worksheet:

I will hunt you down and put a hole in your head. With explosives. You hear me. Power to the shampoo. RIP [sad face with Xed out eyes]. You must DIE.
[Teacher's response: "I'm concerned??"]

Statement to his victims (Kip read this to the victims present at his sentencing hearing.)

I have spent days trying to figure out what I want to say. I have crumpled up dozens of pieces of paper and disregarded even more ideas. I have thought about what I could say that might make people feel just a little bit better. But I have come to the realization that it really doesn't matter what I say. Because there is nothing I can do to take away any of the pain and destruction I have caused. I absolutely loved my parents and had no reason to kill them. I had no reason to dislike, kill or try to kill anyone at Thurston. I am truly sorry that this has happened. I have gone back in my mind hundreds of times and changed one detail, one small event so this never would have happened. I wish I could. I take full responsibility for my actions. These events have pulled me down into a state of deterioration and self-loathing that I didn't know existed. I am very sorry for everything I have done, and for what I have become.

Endnote:

[1] The Public Broadcasting System program "Frontline" produced an intensive 90 minute examination of the tragedy entitled "The Killer at Thurston High" as well as posting transcripts and extracts from Kinkel journal's own writing on its website (http://www.pbs.org/wgbh/pages/frontline/shows/Kinkel journal/). This has been the source of nearly all the information used here and individual; citations will not be used for data from there.

References:

Adams, A. (1992) Bullying at work. London: Virago

Adams, A. (after) (1997)"Bullying at work*." Journal of Community and Applied Social Psychology*, 7, 177-180

Braithwaite, J. (1989)Crime, shame and reintegration. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Crawford, N. (1997) *"Bullying at work: a psychoanalytic perspective." Journal of Community and Applied Social Psychology 7, 219-225

Diamond, M. (1997)Administrative assault: a contemporary psychoanalytic view of violence and aggression in the workplace. American Review of Public Administration 27,3,228-247

Di Martino,V. (2000) "Violence at the Workplace: the Global Challenge" International Conference on Work Trauma, Johannesburg, 8 - 9 November (http://www.ilo.org/public/english/protection/safework/violence/violwk/violwk.htm)

Dutton, D. (1998) The Abusive Personality: Violence and control in intimate relationships. New York: Guilford

"Four Corners" (1996) 'A Dangerous Mind' Australian Broadcasting Corporation (Transcript of television program) www.abc.org.au

"Frontline" (1999) Kip Kinkel written notes, journals, etc From "The Killer at Thurston High" www.pbs.org/frontline

Gilligan, J. (1997) Violence: Reflections on a national epidemic. New York: Vintage

Kaufman, G. (1992) Shame: The power of caring. Rochester, VT: Schenkman Books

Kaufman, G. (1989)The Psychology of Shame: Theory and treatment of shame-based syndromes. New York: Springer

Lewis, H. (1971) Shame and guilt in neurosis. New York: International Universities Press

Lewis, M. (1992) Shame: the exposed self. New York: The Free Press

Lewis, M. (1993) "The development of anger and rage." In Glick, R and Roose, S. (editors) Rage, power, and aggression. New Haven: Yale University Press

Miller, A. (1984)Thou Shalt Not be Aware: society's betrayal of the child. Translated by Hildegarde and Hunter Hannum. New York: Meridian

Miller, A. (1990) Banished Knowledge: Facing childhood injuries. Translated by Vennewitz, Leila. New York: Doubleday,

Miller, A. (1990) For Your Own Good: Hidden cruelty in child-rearing and the roots of violence. New York: Noonday Press

Morrison, A. (1987) Shame: the underside of narcissism. Hillsdale, NJ: Analytic Press

Morrison, A. (1996) The culture of shame. New York: Ballantine

Nansel, T. et als, (2001) "Bullying Behaviors Among US Youth Prevalence and Association With Psychosocial Adjustment" Journal of the American Medical Association 285, 16,

Nathanson, D. (1992) Shame and pride: affect, sex, and the birth of the self. New York: Norton

Poulson, C. (2000) "Shame – The Master Emotion?" University of Tasmania School of Management Working Paper Series.
http://www.comlaw.utas.edu.au/management/wps/wps_2000.html

Randall, P. (1997) Adult bullying: perpetrators and victims. London: Routledge

Rayner, C. (1997)"The incidence of workplace bullying." Journal of Community and Applied Social Psychology 7, 199-208

Rayner, C. and H. Hoel (1997) ″A summary review of literature relating to workplace bullying." Journal of Community and Applied Social Psychology 7, 181-191

Retzinger, S. (1991) Violent emotions: shame and rage in marital quarrels. Newbury Park, CA: Sage

Scheff, T. (1997) Emotions, the social bond, and human reality: part/whole analysis Cambridge: Cambridge University Press

Scheff, T. (1994) Bloody revenge: emotions, nationalism, and war. Boulder, CO: Westview Press

Shengold, L. (1989) Soul Murder: The effects of childhood abuse and deprivation. New York: Fawcett

Schweigert, F. (1999) "Learning the common good: Principles of community-based moral education in restorative justice" Journal of Moral Education 28, 2: 163

Seidler, G. (2000) (Jenkins, A. trans.) In others' eyes: an analysis of shame. Madison, CT: International Universities Press

Thomas, H. (1995) "Experiencing a shame response as a precursor to violence." Bulletin of the American Academy of Psychiatry and the Law 23,4, 587-593

United States Secret Service, (2000) "Safe School Initiative: Interim report on the prevention of targeted violence in schools." Washington: United Sates Secret Service.

Warchol,G (1998) "Workplace Violence, 1992-96" United States Department of Justice, Bureau of Justice Statistics, Special Report NCJ 168634