The Training and Education Needs of Emergency Medicine Doctors working in Rural and Regional Australia

Dr Peter Arvier  BSc, MB BS, FACRRM

Submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the Degree of Master of Medical Science

University of Tasmania
June 2007
DECLARATION

I declare that this thesis does not contain material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university; nor does it contain material previously published or written by any other person, except where due reference is made in the text of the thesis.

Dr Peter Arvier
26 June 2007

STATEMENT OF AUTHORITY OF ACCESS

This thesis may be made available for loan and limited copying in accordance with the Copyright Act 1968.

Dr Peter Arvier
26 June 2007
Acknowledgements

My thanks to my supervisors, Prof Judi Walker, Dr Tom McDonagh and Dr Phil Hungerford for their enthusiasm, guidance and support during the duration of this project. The ready availability of my supervisors, in particular the efforts they went to in maintaining contact with me in Canada, has contributed enormously to the completion of my study.

I am also most grateful to the University of Tasmania Department of Rural Health and the staff of the Rural Clinical School for providing the necessary facilities and infrastructure. I also acknowledge the generous assistance of the Rural Clinical School, Dr Tom McDonagh and the Australian College of Rural and Remote Medicine that has enabled me to attend and present this material at various conferences in Australia and Canada.

Importantly, this project could not have succeeded without the many doctors and other health professionals, educators and administrators who gave their time, knowledge and information on what they saw as the important issues. I sincerely hope that this project will contribute to an improvement in the delivery of emergency medicine services to rural and regional Australia.

Lastly, thanks to my sister Robyn, author and linguist, for her patience in proof reading this thesis for consistency of spelling and grammar.
For professional and lifestyle reasons, most specialist doctors (including emergency medicine specialists) choose to live and work in major metropolitan centres. In rural and regional hospitals, emergency presentations are generally dealt with by ‘non-specialist’ doctors, often with limited peer support and minimal specialist backup. Recruitment of suitably trained medical staff for rural and regional hospitals is increasingly difficult. The doctors working in the emergency departments of these smaller hospitals are a mix of junior medical staff, Career Medical Officers, short term locums, and part time General Practitioners - with a high reliance on overseas trained doctors from widely varying backgrounds.

While undergraduate and general practice training in rural areas has been extensively studied, there has been relatively little attention given to postgraduate specialty training and few studies on adverse events and health outcomes in rural areas.

The purpose of the study was to undertake an investigation of the knowledge, skills and future directions of the workforce providing emergency medicine services in rural and regional hospitals.

The study examined advertisements to fill vacant rural and regional emergency medicine positions and found that employers were often willing to
accept even minimally trained doctors to fill service gaps. There were no agreed educational standards or qualifications for such positions.

A survey of 230 doctors working in 57 rural and regional emergency departments across Australia revealed that the ‘variety of clinical work’ and ‘colleagues/co-workers’ were rated as the most important positive aspects of the job. However, many felt overworked, unsupported, and lacking educational opportunities or a career structure. There appeared to be considerable instability in the workforce with the majority planning to leave their current position or reduce their clinical involvement. At the same time, many of these doctors expressed a desire to undertake further emergency medicine training.

Interviews with employers, educators and administrators revealed widely varying views as to how and where emergency medicine doctors should be trained. There was scepticism that increased numbers of undergraduate places would match the rate of attrition from the workforce.

The study concluded that there is need in Australia to offer a specific postgraduate qualification for doctors wishing to practise emergency medicine outside major city hospitals. To be accessible and relevant, such a course would need to be be largely taught in rural and regional hospitals and contain additional elements relevant to rural context. Emergency medicine training that exists in New Zealand and Canada may be useful models for Australia.
CONTENTS

Declaration ii
Acknowledgements iii
Abstract iv
List of Figures xii
List of Appendices xiv
Publication Inside back cover

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1. Background 1
1.2. The problem 3
1.3. Purpose of the study 9
1.4. Research questions 9
1.5. Delineation of the research problems 10
1.6. Hypothesis 12
1.7. Methodology outline 13
1.8. Importance of the study 13
1.9. Definition of terms 14
1.10. Scope of study 16
1.11. Summary 16
# 2. LITERATURE REVIEW

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>Emergency medicine as a speciality</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>Health services in rural and regional Australia</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>Emergency medicine in rural and regional Australia</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>‘Non-specialist’ emergency medicine doctors</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>Other emergency medicine providers</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>Quality of care in rural hospitals</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>Training rural doctors in emergency medicine</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.9</td>
<td>Alternative models of providing emergency medicine services</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.10</td>
<td>Nurse Practitioners</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.11</td>
<td>Rural training in other specialties</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.12</td>
<td>International practice</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.13</td>
<td>Workforce planning</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.14</td>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3. METHODOLOGY

3.1. Overview
3.2. Analytical framework
3.3. Research questions
3.4. Ethics approval
3.5. Methodology process
   3.5.1. Literature review and analysis
   3.5.2. Survey of advertisements
   3.5.3. Workforce survey
   3.5.4. Field visits and interviews
3.6. Triangulation
3.7. Reflexivity

4. RESULTS and DISCUSSION

4.1. Research Question 1: Advertisements
   4.1.1. Introduction
   4.1.2. Prior general experience
   4.1.3. Registration requirements
   4.1.4. Required prior emergency medicine experience
4.1.5. Enquiry for further information on advertised positions 113

4.1.6. Summary 114

4.2. Research Question 2: Survey of rural and regional emergency medicine workforce

4.2.1. Introduction 116

4.2.2. Gender of respondents 117

4.2.3. Age of respondents 118

4.2.4. Eligibility for registration 121

4.2.5. Postgraduate qualifications 123

4.2.6. Current position 127

4.2.7. Employment status 129

4.2.8. Continuing education and professional development 132

4.2.9. Years of emergency medicine experience 134

4.2.10. Previous experience in a rural or regional setting 135

4.2.11. ‘Hands on’ time in emergency medicine 137

4.2.12. Additional responsibilities 138

4.2.13. Positive aspects of current position 140
4.2.14. Negative aspects of current position 142
4.2.15. Future plans over the next five years 144
4.2.16. Plans for future emergency medicine training 145
4.2.17. Additional free text comments 147
4.2.18. Summary 149

4.3. Research Question 3: Stakeholder consultations and interviews

4.3.1. Introduction 152
4.3.2. Country of current practice 153
4.3.3. Principal role of persons interviewed 154
4.3.4. Preferred solution to workforce shortages 156
4.3.5. Summary 160

4.4. Research Question 4: Relevance of other Australian and international training programs

4.4.1. Other Australian training programs 161
4.4.2. New Zealand comparison 162
4.4.3. Canadian comparison 163
### 4.4.4. Summary 165

### 4.5. Research Question 5: Developing a new emergency medicine qualification

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.5.1. Introduction</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5.2. Location of training</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5.3. Principles and framework</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5.4. The curriculum</td>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5.5. Workforce issues</td>
<td>170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5.6. Summary</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 5. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.1. Conclusions</td>
<td>172</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2. Recommendations</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3. Areas for further study</td>
<td>179</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### LIST OF REFERENCES 182
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 4.1: Advertised positions by required years of experience 110
Figure 4.2: Advertised positions by required registration 111
Figure 4.3: Advertised positions by contact/enquiry person 113
Figure 4.4: Age of all respondents 119
Figure 4.5: Age of female respondents 119
Figure 4.6: Age of male respondents 120
Figure 4.7: Respondents by registration status 122
Figure 4.8: Respondents by postgraduate qualifications 125
Figure 4.9: Respondents by Fellowship qualifications 126
Figure 4.10: Relevant emergency certificates by type 126
Figure 4.11: Respondents by current position title 128
Figure 4.12: Respondents by time worked 130
Figure 4.13: Male respondents by time worked 130
Figure 4.14: Female respondents by time worked 131
Figure 4.15: CME/MOPS participation by program 133
Figure 4.16: Respondents by years of emergency medicine experience 134
Figure 4.17: Respondents by previous rural experience 136
Figure 4.18: Respondents by proportion of ‘hands on’ time in emergency medicine 137
Figure 4.19: Percentage of respondents by additional responsibilities 139
Figure 4.20: Percentage of respondents by positive aspects of current position 141
Figure 4.21: Percentage of respondents by negative aspects of current position 143
Figure 4.22: Percentage of respondents by future plans over the next five years 144

Figure 4.23: Percentage of respondents by plans for future emergency medicine training 146

Figure 4.24: Interviewees by country of current practice 153

Figure 4.25: Categories of persons interviewed by principal role 155

Figure 4.26: Interviewees by preferred workforce solution 159
# LIST OF APPENDICES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A.</th>
<th>Ethics approval</th>
<th>216</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>B.</td>
<td>Individuals and organisations consulted</td>
<td>217</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.</td>
<td>Hospitals surveyed</td>
<td>220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D.</td>
<td>Information sheet and survey form</td>
<td>224</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E.</td>
<td>Personal account of working in rural Canada</td>
<td>231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F.</td>
<td>Suggested curriculum for postgraduate qualification in rural EM</td>
<td>249</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G.</td>
<td>List of ACEM accredited hospitals</td>
<td>264</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H.</td>
<td>List of abbreviations and acronyms</td>
<td>269</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I.</td>
<td>Presentations of this research</td>
<td>273</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>J.</td>
<td>Tables of data</td>
<td>274</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>